

DOCTORAL DISSERTATION SERIES

Publication No. : 21, 350

AUTHOR: George Emil Riday, Ph. D., 1956
University of Michigan

TITLE: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THE
COUNSELING METHODS EMPLOYED
BY THE GRADUATES OF ANDOVER
NEWTON THEOLOGICAL SCHOOL
AND EASTERN BAPTIST THEOLOGICAL
SEMINARY

University Microfilms, Ann Arbor, Michigan

A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THE COUNSELING METHODS
EMPLOYED BY THE GRADUATES OF ANDOVER NEWTON
THEOLOGICAL SCHOOL AND EASTERN
BAPTIST THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

by
George E. Riday

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in the
University of Michigan
1956

Doctoral Committee:

Professor Harlan C. Koch, Chairman
Assistant Professor Robert O. Blood
Assistant Professor Delmont K. Byrn
Professor Howard Y. McClusky
Associate Professor Edward C. Roeber

A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THE COUNSELING METHODS
EMPLOYED BY THE GRADUATES OF ANDOVER NEWTON
THEOLOGICAL SCHOOL AND EASTERN
BAPTIST THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

by George E. Riday

The purpose of this study was to examine the counseling philosophies and methods of the graduates of two contrasting theological institutions. Andover Newton Theological School, located at Newton Centre, Massachusetts, was chosen because it offers rather extensive work in counseling which concludes with an experience in clinical practice for a period of twelve weeks. The other, Eastern Baptist Theological Seminar, at Overbrook, Pennsylvania, has no clinical training for its students and offers few courses in counseling or related fields.

Data were gathered on two prepared forms: a Counselor Information Sheet on which the respondent indicated his type of employment, academic background, experience, and number of books on counseling or related subjects read during the past five years; and an Interview Report Form on which the respondent described the client, his problem, what the counselor did about the problem, the attitude of the counselor and client toward each other, whether or not a referral was made, and indicated whether the respondent kept records of such counseling contacts. Those who participated in the study were requested to report interviews that they had during any four week period between October 1 and November 30, 1955.

Eight criteria were selected by which to judge the interviews submitted:

1. Identification of the Real Problem
2. Clarification of the Problem
3. Encouragement of Free Expression of Feelings
4. Absence of Moralizing or Preaching
5. Appropriate Use of the Resources of the Christian Faith
6. Identification of the Client's Need with his Problem
7. Helping the Client to Help Himself
8. The Ability to Recognize the Need for a Referral

In the light of these criteria three persons with training and experience in counseling independently judged 111 interviews (53 from Andover Newton and 58 from Eastern drawn from a sample of half the total number) as "good," "questionable," or "poor." Without knowing the ratings assigned by the three judges, the writer also classified these interviews. The correlation between the average ratings of the three judges and the writer was .74. The Spearman-Brown formula was applied to the "three person" evaluation and that of the writer with a resulting coefficient of .85. Under this procedure the 111 counselors were rated as follows:

	Andover Newton	Eastern
Good	35	6
Questionable	12	18
Poor	<u>6</u>	<u>32</u>
Total	53	58

Two other considerations carried weight in the evaluation of the training afforded in these two institutions: (1) the quality of the reporting of interviews and (2) reasons given for not participating by those who declined

to cooperate in this inquiry. Each of these factors indicated revealing information concerning counseling philosophies and methods.

The statistical data show that there is little difference between the graduates of the two schools in the amount of talking during the interview by the counselor and by the client ($\chi^2 = 1.87$, not significant), and attitudes of counselor and client toward each other (counselor's attitude toward client - $\chi^2 = 3.941$, not significant; client's attitude toward counselor - $\chi^2 = 2.970$, not significant), number of interviews $\chi^2 = .728$, not significant), and the types and frequencies of the problems confronted (Rank-difference correlation coefficient of .80). Such information leads to the conclusion that regardless of the amount of type of their theological training most ministers, if not by their own choice then by the very needs and insistence of the people to whom they minister, are compelled to be counselors.

When the eight criteria mentioned above were applied to the reported interviews, the evaluations supported the hypothesis that the graduates of Andover Newton Theological School adhere to philosophies and methods of counseling which are more consonant with currently acceptable counseling techniques than do those of Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The writer is exceedingly indebted to a number of persons who have given invaluable assistance in the writing of this dissertation. A word of appreciation must be expressed first of all to Dr. Harlan C. Koch, chairman of the doctoral committee, for his gentle, tireless, and able guidance. To fellow faculty members, Leva R. Huffman, Joseph D. Billups, and Ruth E. Shearer, who gave so liberally of their time to study and rate interviews I wish to convey my sincere gratitude. Virginia Proudfoot, my capable secretary, also contributed greatly in the tedious task of typing the manuscript in a most efficient manner. To the members of my doctoral committee who voluntarily assisted me I also wish to indicate my indebtedness.

Finally, I wish to acknowledge the inspiration and practical help afforded me by my wife, Phyllis. Often when I felt like surrendering to a life of ease rather than study she encouraged me. When the two younger children were about to engage in some kind of play that would disturb their Dad who was working in his study she would sit with them and attempt to keep them quiet with a story or game. Without her aid I could not have completed my study and writing.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	ii
LIST OF TABLES	iv
Chapter	
I. TO BE TRAINED, OR NOT TO BE? -- THAT IS THE QUESTION	1
A Description of the Curricula of the Two Schools Comprising the Study	
II. HOW THE DATA WERE GATHERED AND QUANTITATIVELY TESTED	17
Significance of the Data to the Study	
III. CRITERIA FOR EVALUATING INTERVIEWS	33
IV. APPLICATION OF THE CRITERIA TO ACTUAL INTERVIEWS . .	42
Analysis of Poor Interviews	
Analysis of Questionable Interviews	
Analysis of Good Interviews	
V. FACTORS OTHER THAN INTERVIEWS INFLUENCING THE STUDY	146
Amounts of Information Reported in the Interview	
Reasons for Not Participating in the Study	
VI. CONCLUSION	153
APPENDIXES	157
BIBLIOGRAPHY	170

LIST OF TABLES

Table		Page
I.	General Statistical Data Pertaining to this Study	20
II.	Geographical Distribution of Counselors Who Participated in this Study	29
III.	Types and Frequencies of Problems Brought to Counselors	31
IV.	Group Ratings of a Random Sample of Andover Newton Counselors	44
V.	Group Ratings of a Random Sample of Eastern Counselors	45

APPENDIX A

I.	Significance of Difference Between Number of Respondents who Actually Reported and Those Who Agreed to Report	157
II.	Significance of Difference Between the Number of Counselors and the Number of Interviews Reported	158
III.	Significance of Difference in the Clinical Training of the Two Groups of Participants	159
IV.	Significance of Difference in the Amount of Talking During the Interview by the Counselor and by the Client	160
V.	Significance of Difference in Clients' Attitudes toward Counselors--Andover Newton and Eastern	161
VI.	Significance of Difference in Counselors' Attitudes toward Clients--Andover Newton and Eastern	162
VII.	Significance of Difference in the Use of Prayer During the Interview by the Two Groups of Respondents . . .	163
VIII.	Significance of Difference in the Use of the Bible During the Interview by the Two Groups of Respondents	164
IX.	Significance of Difference Between the Number of Requests for Another Interview by Clients and by Counselors	165
X.	Test of the Significances of Difference Between the Classification of Andover Newton and Eastern Counselors According to the Ratings of Their Interviews	166

CHAPTER I

TO BE TRAINED, OR NOT TO BE?-- THAT IS THE QUESTION

One of the functions of a modern minister is that of counseling, not only with members of his congregation, but also with persons living in his community who may not be members of his or any other church. Since much of the minister's time is consumed in the counseling relationship it seems rather logical to assume that a portion of the training of the theological student should be in the field of counseling. As one peruses the course offerings of various seminaries he is impressed with the fact that there is little uniformity in what is offered in the field of counseling. Some theological schools offer very little and others outline rather extensive programs which are designed to assist the young theolog in gaining skills in pastoral counseling.

The purpose of this study is to examine the counseling philosophies and methods of the graduates of two theological institutions. Andover Newton Theological School, located at Newton Centre, Massachusetts, has been chosen as one of the institutions because it offers rather extensive work in counseling which concludes with an experience in clinical practice for a period of twelve weeks. The other institution is Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary, situated in Overbrook, Pennsylvania. Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary has no clinical training for its students and offers few courses in counseling or related fields.

It is the hypothesis of this study that the graduates of Andover Newton Theological School adhere to philosophies and methods of counseling which are more consonant with currently acceptable counseling techniques than do those of Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary.

CRITERIA EMPLOYED

The basic hypothesis will be tested by applying certain criteria to each set of counseling interviews. These criteria are described at some length in the pages which follow but it may be helpful at the outset to list the criteria without any elaboration of them. They are as follows:

1. Identification of the Real Problem
2. Clarification of the Problem
3. Encouragement of Free Expression of Feelings
4. Absence of Moralizing or Preaching
5. Appropriate Use of the Resources of the Christian Faith
6. Identification of the Client's Need with His Problem
7. Helping the Client Help Himself
8. The Ability to Recognize the Need for a Referral

METHOD OF GATHERING DATA

The method of gathering data was that of sending a Counselor Information Sheet on which the respondent indicated his type of employment, academic background, experience, and number of books on counseling or related subjects read during the past five years. The actual report of interviews was done on an Interview Report Form which described the client, his problem, what the counselor did about the problem, the attitude of the counselor and client toward each other,

whether or not a referral was made, and an indication of the records kept by the counselor. These two forms are reproduced on pages 167-169. Those who participated in the study were requested to report interviews that they had during any four-week period between October 1 and November 30, 1955. In the next chapter there is a detailed description of the method of gathering data.

Since it is necessary to compare the kind of training that the two schools offer, a complete description of the curricula of the two theological schools comprising the study will now be examined.

A DESCRIPTION OF THE CURRICULA OF THE TWO THEOLOGICAL SCHOOLS COMPRISING THE STUDY

The Statement of Purpose contained in the catalog of Andover Newton Theological School indicates the type of emphasis the School makes concerning the training of a minister particularly in his relationship as a pastor. A study of the catalogs issued each year between 1946 and 1955 reveals that the Statement of Purpose has remained the same.

The objective of the School is the professional education of learned Christian ministers, persons called of God and equipped by faith and discipline to assume places of responsible leadership in the life and work of the churches. Such leaders as the School wishes to provide must be capable of bringing others to the saving knowledge of God in Jesus Christ, guiding their growth in the Christian life, directing wisely and effectively the tasks of the church, and ministering with intelligence and devotion to the needs of the community and the world.

It is our conviction that a minister should be especially competent in appropriating Christian truth as revealed through the Bible and supremely in Jesus Christ. Such learning, moreover, should embrace a keen and broad understanding of human nature, the principles of education and growth, the facts and ways of Christian experience. It should further include a sound knowledge of the structure of society, involving the processes and forms of group living in their many manifestations.

To this end the School believes that the student for the Christian ministry must be adequately trained in each of the following disciplines: (1) a working knowledge of the tradition found in the

Bible and in the history of the church; (2) a comprehension of the basic issues and major contributions within the philosophical and theological development of Christian thought; (3) an insight into psychological and social forces which shape personal and group experience; and (4) skill in the professional tasks of preaching, teaching, counseling, and administering the varied work of the churches. The curriculum of the School is organized to provide an integrated and growing experience along these several lines of emphasis.

It is this educational experience which is intended to set the whole tone of the School's corporate life. Students, teachers, and administrative staff are members of a community of work and worship, study and service. A fellowship of common interests and loyalties defines the spirit of classroom and dormitory, of personal contact and organized activity. The School welcomes those who share its purposes and give promise of real competence in attaining them.¹

It can be observed from this general Statement of Purpose that the School is specific in its desire to make the minister it graduates proficient in pastoral counseling. Such sentences as the one that suggests that the minister's learning "should embrace a keen and broad understanding of human nature, the principles of education and growth, the facts and ways of Christian experience," support the indication that the School is concerned about assisting its students in counseling. Disciplines numbered (3) an insight into psychological and social forces which shape personal and group experience; and (4) skill in the professional tasks of preaching, teaching, counseling, and administering the varied work of the churches, likewise bring focus upon the attitude of Andover Newton Theological School concerning the importance of a trained ministry in the area of pastoral counseling.

In addition to the counseling emphasis found in the Statement of Purpose the course offerings in Psychology and Counseling are a further indication of the prominent place that is given to the minister's role as counselor. In the year 1946 the catalog listed the following courses:

¹The Andover Newton Bulletin, (No. 3; Newton Centre, Mass.: February, 1951), Vol. XLIII, pp. 14-15.

1. CLINICAL TRAINING

The purpose of this course is to provide supervised clinical experience for the student in a general hospital so that he may study psychology of religion and theology in the laboratory. The course will be divided each semester between hospital calling and seminar sessions.

1a. THE PSYCHOLOGY OF RELIGION

Ward calling and record writing, with seminars and a minimum of required reading. Three hours, first semester.

1b. CLINICAL THEOLOGY

Procedure will be the same as in Course 1a. The seminars will consist of the clinical study of the concepts of the Christian Faith. Three hours, second semester.

2. WORK WITH INDIVIDUALS

2a. PERSONALITY STUDY

This course, based upon case-history material and required reading, is directed to the better understanding of individuals through the use of modern psychology. Two hours, first semester.

2b. PASTORAL COUNSELING

This course is planned to assist the student in working out his own views and skills in consultation work with people. It will include case material, reviews of recent books, study of the methods of distinguished pastors and physicians, and conferences with individuals. Two hours' credit, second semester.

3. THE PSYCHOLOGY OF GUILT AND FORGIVENESS

This is an elective, open to graduate students and to commuting parish ministers. The course includes a study of the personalities of religious leaders placed beside a pastor's case studies of neurotic individuals with an eye to the guilt and forgiveness aspects of the experience of salvation. This supplements the student's courses in systematic theology and his courses in the philosophy and psychology of religion, having for its objective improved work of the pastor with individuals. Three hours, each semester.

4. SUMMER SCHOOL CLINICAL EXPERIENCE

Application may be made by students and pastors who are in the parish ministry, for appointment, under the Andover Newton Theological School, for clinical training in general hospitals during the summer months. Other theological schools of New England are cooperating in this project. Appointments carry pastoral aid

covering one-half of minimum costs. Academic credit usually can be secured.¹

In the subsequent years new courses were added:

1947

5a, 5b. THE PSYCHOLOGICAL USE OF THE GOSPELS

This course purports to use the incidents in our Lord's life, as well as his contacts with people, in such a way as shall attract parishioners to the Christian solution of their problems, and Christian redemption from their sense of lostness, death or sin. First and second semesters.²

6a. PSYCHOLOGICAL MEASUREMENT: INTRODUCTORY COURSE

This course will deal primarily with those aspects of measurement and experimentation which are pertinent to the problems of counseling. Emphasis will be laid upon the nature and meaning of measurement in general, problems conspicuous in educational and vocational measurement, relationship between tests and traits, principles of test construction, availability of published tests and their uses, statistical treatment of test data, and the uses of special tests. Attention, also, will be given to the study of actual case problems to illustrate methods of dealing with varied types of needs. Three hours credit, second semester.³

2a. PSYCHOLOGY OF PERSONALITY (Change of title)

This course, based upon case-history material and required reading, is directed to the better understanding of individuals through the use of modern psychology. Two hours, first semester.

3a, 3b. THE PSYCHOLOGY OF FEAR, GUILT AND HATE (This course title replaced course 3. The Psychology of Guilt and Forgiveness).

7a, 7b. PASTORAL COUNSELING (In 1947 there was a course listed in the Catalog as 2b. Pastoral Counseling. In the 1948 Catalog the course previously listed as 2b. Pastoral Counseling was changed to Psychological Counseling)

4. SUMMER SCHOOL CLINICAL COURSE (It will be noted by comparison with the preceding year that the course is growing more extensive)

This course will continue for two periods of six weeks each. During the first ten days the student works as an orderly, which introduces

¹Ibid., pp. 38-39.

²Ibid. (No. 2; February, 1948), Vol. XL, p. 39.

³Ibid., p. 40.

him quickly into large hospitals with their complicated routine, enables him to see the effect of various diseases upon many different patients, permits him to see at first hand the work of scientific medicine and its healing ministry, and helps him to build up his own poise and strengthen his spiritual discipline in the presence of suffering. In addition there are also daily seminars led by the chaplains which deal with the psychology of religion, illnesses, personal problems, cooperation with other professional workers, and the whole art of pastoral work and personal counseling. During the remainder of the course, calls are made by members of the group upon selected patients. The calls are carefully examined for purposes of discussion and to discover the strength and weakness of each student in his pastoral work. Twelve hours' credit for the Summer.

6a. INTRODUCTORY COURSE IN STATISTICS

This course will deal primarily with those aspects of measurement and experimentation which are pertinent to the problems of counseling. Emphasis will be laid upon the nature and meaning of measurement in general, problems conspicuous in educational and vocational measurement, relationship between tests and traits, principles of test construction and statistical treatment of test data. Three hours' credit, first semester.

10a, 10b, and 11a, 11b. INDIVIDUAL STUDY

These are open, with the consent of professor, to graduate students who are ready for constructive work in a special field, or for tutorial instruction, or individual research. Credit and hours to be arranged.¹

1950

In this year course 2. Work with Individuals, was dropped from the curriculum.²

1953

At this time the two courses, 6a. Introductory Course in Statistics, and 6b. Measurement in Counseling, were combined under the title 6. Psychological Measurements in Counseling.

7. THEORY OF INTERPERSONAL RELATIONS

This course will deal with the dynamics of the group process, with an exploration of the therapeutic opportunities in the group setting.

¹Ibid., (No. 2; February, 1949), Vol. XLI; pp. 43-45.

²Ibid., (No. 2; December, 1949), Vol. XLII, p. 31.

This course will be limited to twelve students. Two hours, second semester.

8. YOUTH COUNSELING

This course will deal with problems of young people in vocational and educational areas. The various techniques of counseling, psychological testing and case studies will be examined. Each student will have opportunity to participate in clinical demonstrations of counseling with young people. Two hours, second semester.

9. PSYCHOLOGY OF THE FAMILY

This course will deal primarily with the psychological and physical factors which form the dynamics of marriage. The approach will be that of a medical specialist, with emphasis on the Christian and psychological aspects of a successful marriage. Preference will be given to married students and their wives. Two hours, second semester.¹

The participants in this study are graduates of the two theological schools between the years 1946 and 1954. Andover Newton's graduates extend from 1947 to 1954. Eastern's graduates extend from 1946 to 1952. It was the original intention of the writer to include only those men who graduated before 1952 so that they would have more time to become established in their churches or in whatever type of profession they chose. However, in the case of the Andover Newton men it was learned that Clinical Training was not a required course for all students until 1949. Prior to this date students could elect Clinical Training. Of the fifty-three participants from Andover Newton there are fifty who have engaged in the Clinical Training program. The others without actual Clinical Training were recommended by Dr. John M. Billinsky, Guiles Professor of Psychology and Clinical Training, as men who had considerable work and experience in counseling and psychology.

On December 12, 1955, the writer conferred with Dr. John M.

¹Ibid., (No. 2; December, 1953), Vol. XLVI, p. 33.

Billinsky, of Andover Newton Theological School. On that occasion the latter stated that although Clinical Training is the only course required of the theological students many of the other courses in psychology and counseling are eagerly chosen as electives. During the interview it was also learned that Dr. Billinsky's own counseling philosophy is that of an eclectic. This fact undoubtedly will have some influence upon the students who came under his guidance. Dr. Billinsky explained that the minister by virtue of his profession deals with moral and ethical values which necessitate his being a directive counselor at times. On the other hand, he stated the wisdom of a non-directive approach in certain situations.

CLINICAL TRAINING AT ANDOVER NEWTON THEOLOGICAL SCHOOL

This program is conducted by the School at Boston City Hospital although many of the participants have had clinical experiences at some of the other hospitals in the Boston area. The Clinical Training lasts for a period of twelve weeks. The men are introduced to the program by serving as orderlies for two weeks. The identity of the orderly as a theological student is not revealed to the patients in the hospital. The students gain first-hand information and experience during this two-week period. They are admonished to be alert to activities in the hospital and concentrate upon listening. The novices are afforded opportunities to observe experienced persons and fellow students in pastoral work with the sick. Time is spent in learning how to take voluminous notes and organize them in proper fashion. Seminar sessions with about a dozen men in each one are provided for the purpose of discussing reports and problems related to counseling. Each day worship services are held with the intention of helping students attain a sense

of unity and a measure of inner poise which, it is hoped, can be communicated to others. Conferences between the individual student and the teacher are also held.

At the beginning of each semester's work the students are given copies of the objectives of the program. The objectives are as follows:

1. To deepen the student's understanding of personality structure and the dynamics of the pastor-parishioner relationship.
2. To provide theological students and clergy with an opportunity to minister, under supervision, to sick persons.
3. To supply experimental evidence for the oneness of man's mind, body, and soul, and its role in his reconciliation to himself, to his fellows, and to his Creator.
4. To refine awareness of, and skill in, the use of the pastor's resources and opportunities in the pastoral care of the individual.
5. To help the student obtain insight into what it means to be understanding, tolerant, permissive, friendly, forgiving, discerning, supportive, and creative; and to develop his ability to feel and express these attributes.
6. To raise pertinent questions concerning what the Christian Church can and ought to do in order to act as a preventive agent for some of the major problems in living, by reducing or eliminating their causes.
7. To enable the minister to appreciate more clearly his partnership with other professional persons who are also seeking to help people solve their problems.¹

A portion of the mimeographed summer schedule is listed on page 11. This schedule gives some indication of the subjects discussed and the length of time afforded each aspect of the program.

Another advantage which the student has in the program is his experience in the out-patient department. Each morning the medical interns meet at about eight o'clock in order to receive and discuss their assignments for the day. Then they go into the tenement districts

¹The information concerning the actual Clinical Training Program was derived from conferences with faculty members and students at Andover Newton Theological School, and from Paul C. Mills's unpublished S.T.M. thesis, "An Evaluation of the Clinical Pastoral Training Program at Andover Newton Theological School with some suggestions for Teaching Techniques in the Seminar Sessions."

A Portion of the Mimeographed Summer Schedule

Monday, July 12, 1954

- 8:30 Clinical Seminars
- 10:00 Pastoral Calling
- 12:00 Chapel Service
- 1:30 "Psychopathology of Personality" by Dr. J. M. Billinsky

Tuesday, July 13, 1954

- 8:30 Clinical Seminars
- 10:00 Pastoral Calling
- 12:00 Chapel Service
- 1:30 "Psychopathology of Personality, II" by Dr. J. M. Billinsky
- 3:00 Pastoral Calling

Wednesday, July 14, 1954

- 8:30 Seminar - Class Seminar led by one of the chaplain supervisors
- 10:00 Pastoral Calling
- 12:00 Chapel Service
- 1:00 "Obstetrical Patient" by A.D. Elia, M. D.
- 3:00 Pastoral Calling

Thursday, July 15, 1954

- 8:30 "Gynecological Patient" by A.D. Elia, M. D.
- 10:00 Pastoral Calling
- 12:00 Chapel Seminars
- 1:00 Clinical Seminars
- 3:00 Pastoral Calling

Friday, July 16, 1954

- 8:30 "Premarital and Marital Counseling" by A. D. Elia, M. D.
- 10:00 Pastoral Calling
- 12:00 Chapel Service
- 1:30 Clinical Seminars
- 3:00 Pastoral Calling

Some of the other lecture titles:

"Professional Terminology"
 "Institutional Ministry"
 "The Modern Hospital"
 "Clinical Theology"
 "Ministering to the Dying and Dead"
 "Modern Science"

"Pediatric Patient"
 "Homosexual Patient"
 "Christian Forgiveness"
 "Psychoanalysis"
 "Medical Patient"
 "Psychiatric Patient"

of Boston and render medical aid to those in need. The seminary student, dressed as an intern, accompanies the medical intern on these excursions and serves in any manner that he can as an assistant. In this way an opportunity is afforded of observing the intern at work and seeing conditions as they really are in some of the tenement sections of the city.

The students are permitted to watch operations from the galleries above the operating rooms at Boston City Hospital. They also visit the morgue and hospital museum and are permitted to watch and assist with autopsies, if they choose.¹

COUNSELING TRAINING AT EASTERN BAPTIST THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

The most recent catalog of Eastern Seminary does not include a general statement of purpose but the following aims are listed for the School of Theology and the School of Christian Education.

School of Theology

General Aims

1. To acquaint students with the functions of the church.
2. To provide the type of training needed by students for effective leadership in the program of the local church and its outreach into the community and the world.
3. To familiarize students with the methods and techniques of research.

Specific Aims

1. To acquaint students with the content, backgrounds, and methods of study of both the Old and New Testaments.
2. To aid students in achieving general knowledge of church history, and the ability to evaluate contemporary church problems in the light of its history.
3. To help students systematize their Christian thinking through an understanding of the basic concepts of systematic and Biblical theology.
4. To guide students in the principles and practice of evangelism.
5. To guide students in the formulation of adequate theories and practices of Christian education.

¹Ibid.

6. To develop in students the ability to administer the work of the church and to give adequate pastoral care.
7. To guide students in the application of Christian ethics to community relations.
8. To develop the art of preaching and leadership in public worship.
9. To give students guided field experiences.

School of Christian Education

General Aims

1. To acquaint students with the educational functions of the church.
2. To provide the type of training which will prepare students for effective leadership in the educational program of the church.
3. To prepare full-time professional workers in Christian education.
4. To familiarize students with the methods and techniques of educational research.

Specific Aims

1. To acquaint students with the content, backgrounds, and methods of study of both the Old and New Testaments.
2. To aid students in achieving a general knowledge of church history, and the ability to evaluate contemporary problems in the light of Christian history.
3. To help systematize their Christian thinking by being familiar with basic concepts in systematic and Biblical theology.
4. To guide students in the principles and practice of evangelism.
5. To guide students in the formulation of adequate theories of Christian education.
6. To develop in students the ability to administer group work in harmony with the Christian faith and modern principles of administration.
7. To give students guided field experience.¹

Item 6 under the specific aims of the School of Theology states, "To develop in students the ability to administer the work of the church and to give adequate pastoral care." The question can be justly raised concerning the meaning of the phrase "adequate pastoral care." In order for pastoral care to be adequate one would expect to find a rather liberal offering of courses in the field of pastoral care but the Seminary provides only three courses that can be construed as being applicable

¹Eastern Baptist Bulletin, (March, 1955), Volume XXX, pp. 30-31.

to the work that a pastor must do if he is to function as a counselor.

These courses are:

PASTORAL CARE

701. The Work of the Pastor: The minister's call; the minister's preparation, spiritual and academic; the minister's relation to God and to his work. Special attention will be given to his devotional life, public prayer, conduct of public worship, pastoral calling, civic responsibilities and duties. Instruction will be given in the administering of baptism, the conduct of the Lord's Supper, marriage and funeral services. Two hours. Given every year.

703. Applied Psychiatry and Pastoral Counselling: A course in applied psychiatry in which various mental diseases and maladjustments are presented including case histories. Differentiation between illness and personal problems will be considered. Discussions will be directed along two lines--namely, the viewpoint of the pastor and the viewpoint of the psychiatrist. The purpose of the course is to show the pastor when and how to call upon the special skill of the psychiatrist to help in the solution of personal problems. Two hours.

704. Applied Psychiatry and Pastoral Counselling: A continuation of course 703. Two hours.¹

The description of the contents of course 701, The Work of the Pastor, indicates that it so filled with material that is essential for a minister to know that there undoubtedly is a very small amount of time that can be given to the work of the pastor in his counseling relationships.

The three courses mentioned are required by all students working for a Bachelor of Divinity but a student may elect one or two courses in the Christian Education Department which ought to make some contribution to his preparation for the task of counseling. These courses are Human Development and Christian Education, and Group Dynamics and Christian Education.

It can be readily seen that Andover Newton and Eastern have different objectives, methods, requirements, and personnel in their

¹Ibid., p. 46.

training of young men in pastoral counseling. Theological institutions often specialize in certain fields. One seminary may emphasize Biblical interpretation and another homiletics, or some other field. Since it is obvious that Andover Newton Theological School "majors" in preparing its students for pastoral counseling and Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary does very little in this area, the graduates of these two institutions should prove to be interesting subjects for a comparative study in counseling.

SUMMARY

In this chapter the reason for attempting such a study as this has been indicated. Counseling is a major part of the task of the modern minister and he, therefore, should be trained. In order to learn whether or not formal training makes any difference in the counseling philosophy and method of a pastor it was decided to study the products of two institutions which offer ministerial education. The one, Andover Newton Theological School, has an excellent counseling program for its students, and the other, Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary, offers little in counseling work. It is the hypothesis of the study that the graduates of Andover Newton adhere to philosophies and methods of counseling which are professionally identifiable and therefore more acceptable than those held by Eastern graduates. This hypothesis will be tested by the following criteria: (1) Identification of the Real Problem, (2) Clarification of the Problem, (3) Encouragement of Free Expression of Feelings, (4) Absence of Moralizing or Preaching, (5) Appropriate Use of the Resources of the Christian Faith, (6) Identification of the Client's Need With His Problem, (7) Helping the Client Help Himself, and (8) The Ability to Recognize the Need for a Referral.

The research design involves the use of a questionnaire on which the participants reported interviews which took place during any four-week period between October 1 and November 30, 1955.

A fairly extensive survey of the purposes and curricula of the two schools is also included in this chapter.

CHAPTER II

HOW THE DATA WERE GATHERED AND QUANTITATIVELY TESTED

METHOD OF GATHERING DATA

The most effective manner of gathering data on counseling methods and philosophies would be that of visiting each counselor, having a fairly extended conversation with him and, in addition, observing the individual at work in a number of counseling interviews. Quite obviously this method of collecting data is out of the question primarily because of the impracticality of observing interviews in a pastor's study. Therefore, the most feasible alternative open to the writer was to resort to a questionnaire. The reader need not be reminded that persons who are plagued with questionnaires usually find them very irksome. With this fact in mind, the writer attempted to design such an instrument of inquiry as would inconvenience the respondents as little as the basic purposes of this study would permit. Then, too, it seemed only fair and courteous to request the cooperation of those whose methods and philosophies were to be studied before the questionnaire was mailed to them.

The questionnaire in question was prepared and, after many revisions, adopted. It was designed to get the necessary information in as succinct a manner as possible. Of course, this was not easily accomplished. The instrument is not a perfect one. The writer fully recognizes its inadequacies. Its weaknesses are due to a definite

striving to enlist cooperation by not repelling the respondents with a lengthy and formidable questionnaire. One must make a choice. Shall he construct an instrument that will be extremely detailed and derive exactly the information he wants? If he does, his affirmative replies to his requests for cooperation will probably be so few that his sample will be invalid from the viewpoints of size and bias. On the other hand, if he designs his questionnaire in such a fashion that respondents are willing to cooperate there must be some sacrifices made. The second of these alternatives was chosen. It now appears that the information collected is adequate enough to make it possible to draw correct conclusions about the counseling practices of the graduates of the two institutions. A sample of the items contained in the questionnaire is to be found in Appendix B.

Typewritten letters, each one an original, were sent to 153 men from Andover Newton Theological School and 199 from Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary. These were graduates of their respective schools between the years 1948 and 1953. These years were chosen in order to get as contemporary a picture of each institution as possible while still allowing the most recent graduates time to acquire some experience in counseling. Another reason for choosing these years relates to the clinical training program at Andover Newton, which is a rather recent requirement. The letters explained the purpose of the study, how the study would be conducted, and indicated that the president of each institution had approved the project and had given permission to conduct the survey. Enclosed with the letter was an addressed post card on which the one invited checked his willingness or unwillingness to cooperate. Some of the men returned their cards with a notation requesting more information and a copy of the questionnaire before they would

commit themselves. Some in this group agreed and others refused to cooperate when they received the detailed information concerning the amount of work involved. The results of this first mailing were eighty-seven affirmative replies from Andover Newton and eighty-eight from Eastern.

The persons invited to participate were asked to report counseling interviews for any four-week period between October 1 and November 30. In addition to answering the items in the questionnaire the respondents were requested to write pertinent information on the backs of the counseling forms and send verbatim reports of interviews whenever possible. Five copies of each of the questionnaires were sent to everyone who agreed to cooperate. There was also included a Counselor Information Sheet, a sample of which is reproduced in Appendix C. The purpose of this sheet was to collect personal data about the counselor's training, age, type of employment, books read on counseling or related subjects, and the like. The sheets on which the information concerning interviews was recorded were designated as the Interview Report Form. When the deadline of November 30 was reached individual letters went to those who had not mailed their material. Interview Report Forms came in as late as January 30, 1956.

STATISTICAL COMPARISON OF DATA

In the following chapter the actual interviews will be analyzed but in this section there will be a review of those data which are important to the study but not considered in Chapter III. Table I sets forth the general data which we shall consider briefly in the following pages.

1. Persons requested to participate.--As was previously mentioned

TABLE I
GENERAL STATISTICAL DATA PERTAINING
TO THIS STUDY

	Andover Newton	Eastern
1. Persons requested to participate	153	199
2. Affirmative replies	87	88
3. Persons reporting	53	58
4. Individual interviews	218	203
5. Participants with clinical training	50	7
6. Average number of books in counseling or related fields read in the past five years	9	3.5
7. Counselor requested client to come for the interview	31	35
8. Client talked more than counselor during the interview	171	133
9. Counselor talked more than the client during the interview	47	50
10. Counselor's feelings toward the client		
Amiable	85	79
Sympathetic	100	95
Hostile	8	2
Resentful	1	1
Uncertain	15	17
11. Client's feelings toward the counselor		
Amiable	117	111
Sympathetic	30	35
Hostile	6	7
Resentful	1	3
Uncertain	43	35

TABLE I--Continued

	Andover Newton	Eastern
12. Prayer used during the interview	95	154
13. Bible referred to during the interview	21	61
14. Length of the interview		
Fifteen minutes or less	4	9
Between 15 and 29 minutes	37	49
Between 30 and 59 minutes	33	40
Between one and one-and-a-half hours	83	62
Between one-and-a-half and two hours	11	17
Between two and three hours	14	12
15. Return visit requested by the counselor	100	111
16. Return visit requested by the client	121	88
17. Client's attitude toward religion		
Antagonistic	4	5
Opposed	1	6
Neutral	45	32
Favorable	80	65
Highly favorable	38	73
18. Referrals		
Physician	13	15
Psychiatrist	15	9
Psychologist	9	6
Social worker	6	3
Lawyer	5	7
Other	14	12

TABLE I--Continued

	Andover Newton	Eastern
19. Records kept of interviews		
Complete	17	11
Partial	6	9
20. Interviews		
First	102	104
Second	32	33
Third	23	17
Fourth	10	10
Fifth or more	36	19

153 men from Andover Newton were invited to participate and 199 men from Eastern.

2. Affirmative replies.--From Andover Newton came eighty-seven affirmative replies and from Eastern, eighty-eight. This means that 57 per cent agreed from Andover Newton and 49 per cent from Eastern.

3. Actual number of persons reporting.--Fifty-three counseling reports were finally received from Andover Newton and fifty-eight from Eastern, or 61 per cent and 66 per cent respectively. A casual glance indicates little difference between these two groups as far as participation is concerned. (Difference: $\chi^2 = .057$. Not significant. Table I, Appendix A).

4. Individual interviews.--As for individual interviews, Andover Newton reported 218 and Eastern, 203. There is very little difference here. When the number of reports is compared with the number of persons reporting, no significant difference was found. ($\chi^2 = .728$. Table II, Appendix A).

5. Participants with clinical training.--Out of fifty-three graduates of Andover Newton, fifty had clinical training. The other three men were reported by the school as having previous training equivalent to the clinical program at Andover Newton. Seven of the men from Eastern out of a total of fifty-eight had clinical training in various places. The training was acquired after graduation. For our purposes we can state that Andover Newton represents counselors with clinical training and Eastern represents counselors without clinical training. This difference proved to be significant at the .01 level. ($\chi^2 = 76.45$. Table III, Appendix A).

Many of the respondents wrote that they did not know how many hours nor the specific courses they had taken in counseling or psychology.

Furthermore, a number of the men left these spaces blank. It is impossible to come to any accurate conclusion about the figures relating to this item. However, it may be mentioned for what it is worth that the men from Andover Newton who listed courses had about twice the number that the men from Eastern recorded.

6. Books in counseling or related fields read in the past five years.--Andover Newton men averaged nine books while Eastern's average was 3.5. To a fairly large extent this difference may be accounted for by the fact that some of the more recent graduates of Andover Newton had read many of the texts they listed as required reading for courses in theological school as well as for the clinical training they had had.

7. Counselor requests for interviews.--Thirty-one of the Andover Newton interviews indicated that the counselor requested the client to come for an interview and thirty-five interviews from Eastern men indicated requests from the counselor for the client to come for an interview. The difference has no statistical significance.

8. Talking during an interview by counselor and client.--This question (Items 8 and 9, Table I) was omitted from some of the reports. In cases where the respondent indicated that the talking was a 50/50 affair credit was given to both the counselor and the client. A chi-square test shows that the difference between the amount of talking by the two groups of counselors was not significant. ($\chi^2 = 1.87$. Table IV, Appendix A.) Thirty-one of the Andover Newton interviews recorded the counselor as talking more than the client and thirty-five of the Eastern interviews recorded the counselor as being the more talkative. This item cannot be observed and conclusions drawn without knowing the nature of the

problem and the personality of the client. Consequently, whether or not the counselor should speak more than the client depends on a number of factors.

9. Client's and counselor's attitudes toward each other.--

Numerically it is not too significant to report the number of times the counselor or client felt hostile, sympathetic, or resentful (Items 10 and 11, Table I). This information is helpful, however, in observing how the client or counselor behaves in the light of certain feelings. The comparison of the number of times a counselor or client felt one way or another shows little difference. (Difference: $X^2 = 2.970$, not significant, Table V, Appendix A, and $X^2 = 3.941$, not significant, Table VI, Appendix A.)

10. Prayer during the interview.--Ninety-five of the Andover Newton and 154 of the Eastern interviews recorded the use of prayer (Item 12, Table I). At this point there is a significant difference at the .01 level ($X^2 = 44.20$, Table VII, Appendix A). However, the number of times a counselor prays is not particularly significant. The conditions under which he prays and the kind of prayer he offers are far more important. A thoughtless, inappropriate prayer can destroy a counseling relationship. A greater use of prayer on the part of the graduates of Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary may be due to the more conservative theological viewpoint and also due to the fact that Eastern men, recognizing their lack of training are more prone to resort to prayer to compensate for their own inadequacies. On the other hand some Andover Newton men may tend to feel as though resorting to prayer is unnecessary if the counselor employs proper counseling methods. The writer conjectures that both schools would do well to rethink the place of prayer in the counseling interview.

11. Bible referred to during interview. Twenty-one times the use of the Bible was reported by Andover Newton men and sixty-one times, by the Eastern respondents (Item 13, Table I). Observations comparable to those about prayer may be applied here: it is not the number of verses quoted that is important but under what circumstances was the Bible quoted, and what portions were recited? Yet it must be admitted that the Word of God is one of the resources of the Christian faith that the counselor can employ with wholesome results. In times of great distress and anxiety the thoughts of an eternal and loving God are most comforting if properly chosen. It is impossible to know whether the Bible references were well or poorly chosen by the men who used them. Here the difference is significant at the .01 level ($\chi^2 = 26.72$, Table VIII, Appendix A).

12. Length of the interview.--As indicated by Item 14, Table I the length of the interviews was about the same for each school. They ranged from fifteen minutes or less to between two and three hours. The time most frequently reported by both groups of respondents was between one and one-and-a-half hours. The original information does not lend itself to exact computation. Perhaps an hour is the length of the average interview for the graduates of both institutions. No significant difference is apparent here.

13. Counselor's request for the client to return for another interview.--One hundred Andover Newton counselors asked their clients to return for another interview and 111 Eastern men made the same request. No comment is necessary on this item.

14. Client's request for a return for another interview.--One hundred and twenty-one of the clients of Andover Newton counselors requested to see their counselors another time. The number of clients of

Eastern counselors is smaller: eighty-eight requested return visits for counseling. The chi-square here is 2.19. This difference is significant at the 15 per cent level. (Table IX, Appendix A).

15. Client's attitude toward religion.--These statistics are not quantitatively meaningful (Item 17, Table I). For our purpose they served to reveal the client's attitude toward religion whereupon we could estimate the counselor's reaction in light of the client's religious feelings. The greatest difference is in the number of clients who were reported as highly favorable toward religion. Here Andover Newton registered thirty-eight against Eastern's seventy-three. This whole matter of judging a person's attitude toward religion--its validity--depends upon the religious viewpoint and subjectivity of the one doing the rating. These differences were not statistically tested.

16. Number of referrals made.--As revealed by Item 18, Table I, there is little difference between Andover Newton and Eastern in this regard. The greatest difference is in the referrals to psychiatrists. Andover Newton, as might have been surmised, listed more psychiatric referrals than Eastern: fifteen as against six. No test of significance was made here.

17. Records kept of interviews.--In view of the stress that is laid in clinical training upon the importance of keeping notes and records, it is a bit surprising to find only seventeen Andover Newton and eleven Eastern men who reported that they keep such records. Partial records are kept by six men from Andover Newton and nine from Eastern. In view of their training, one would expect a greater difference than this with Andover Newton counselors preserving records on a much larger scale. This difference was not tested for significance.

18. Interviews according to sequence.--These statistics show very little deviation until we come to the "fifth or more" category (Item 20, Table I). At this point Andover Newton listed thirty-six interviews to Eastern's nineteen. This difference has important implications for the study. It is apparent that a greater number of Andover Newton men conceive of counseling as being more than a "one night stand." We conclude that their concept is more intensive and long range than that held by Eastern men. The chi-square test was not applied here.

Geographical Distribution

The Andover Newton returns include reports from twenty-one states, Hawaii, and Egypt and those from Eastern came from seventeen states, Alaska, and Brazil. Table II shows these distributions.

Types and Frequencies of Problems

A quick observation of Table III will disclose the interesting information that the types of problems and their frequencies do not vary very much between the two groups. Two of the Andover Newton men are hospital chaplains which accounts for the deviation in problems dealing with physical illness. It is difficult and perhaps unnecessary to attempt an explanation of the differences in school problems, vocational problems, and human relations. ($\rho = .80$, Table III.)

SIGNIFICANCE OF THE DATA TO THE STUDY

Without any previous studies to go by, or without any data to refer to for guidance it was the opinion of the writer that there would be significant differences in the statistics presented by the two groups. As we have seen, chi-square tests indicate there are differences at

TABLE II

GEOGRAPHICAL DISTRIBUTION OF COUNSELORS
WHO PARTICIPATED IN THIS STUDY

	Andover Newton	Eastern
Alaska	..	1
Alabama	1	..
Arizona	..	1
Brazil	..	1
California	2	5
Colorado	2	1
Connecticut	2	..
Egypt	1	..
Georgia	1	..
Hawaii	1	..
Illinois	3	3
Iowa	1	..
Kansas	..	1
Maine	3	2
Maryland	1	3
Massachusetts	17	1
Michigan	1	1
Missouri	1	..
New Hampshire	4	..
New Jersey	..	10
New York	3	9
North Carolina	1	1

TABLE II--Continued

	Andover Newton	Eastern
North Dakota	1	1
Ohio	2	..
Oregon	1	2
Pennsylvania	..	12
Rhode Island	1	..
South Carolina	..	1
Virginia	2	2
Washington	1	..
Total	53	58

TABLE III
TYPES AND FREQUENCIES OF PROBLEMS
BROUGHT TO COUNSELORS

Types	Andover Newton			Eastern			D
	No.	Pct.	Rank	No.	Pct.	Rank	
1. Marital	38	18.9	1.5	34	15.3	1.0	0.5
2. Family Relations	38	18.9	1.5	30	13.6	2.0	0.5
3. Alcohol	14	7.0	5.0	14	6.3	6.0	1.0
4. Religious	26	12.9	3.0	26	11.8	3.0	0.0
5. Physical Illness	11	5.5	6.0	4	1.8	14.0	8.0
6. Boy-Girl Relations	3	1.5	14.5	4	1.8	14.0	0.5
7. School Problems	2	.9	16.5	12	5.4	10.0	6.5
8. Bereavement	2	.9	16.5	3	1.4	16.5	0.0
9. Vocational	4	2.0	12.5	12	5.4	10.0	2.5
10. Human Relations (outside the family)	6	3.0	10.5	15	6.8	4.5	6.0
11. Financial	6	3.0	10.5	7	3.2	12.0	1.5
12. Sex	17	8.5	4.0	15	6.8	4.5	0.5
13. Mental Illness (serious)	10	5.0	7.0	13	5.9	7.5	0.5
14. Mental Illness (less serious)	9	4.5	8.0	13	5.9	7.5	0.5
15. Employment	3	1.5	14.5	3	1.4	16.5	2.0
16. Pre-Marital	8	4.0	9.0	12	5.4	10.0	1.0
17. Lawlessness	4	2.0	12.5	4	1.8	14.0	1.5
Total	201	100.0		221	100.0		160.50

Rank-difference correlation coefficient

$$\text{rho} = .80$$

the .01 level between some of the statistics but the over-all view of these data shows that these differences are rather infrequent. More clients interviewed by Andover Newton men requested to see their counselor again than was the case with Eastern men. Christian resources, particularly prayer and the Bible, were used more by Eastern than by Andover Newton counselors. The research design was adopted upon the assumption that the clinical training which Andover Newton men had received would produce measurable differences when compared with the training of Eastern's graduates.

The very fact that there is not much difference statistically between the two groups points to the fact that whether a minister has training in counseling or not he is going to have to be a counselor for people with all kinds of problems. Apparently few parishioners inquire about the amount of counselor training or experience a pastor has. Ministers do counsel and, by and large as we have seen, they are confronted with the same types of problems regardless of their ability to handle their clients wisely and well. Since this is the case, it seems to be logical to expect all young men who are in theological institutions to be subjected to some kind of educational experiences designed to make them competent to play a role which is inevitably going to be theirs, if not by their own choice, then by the very needs and insistence of the people to whom they minister.

CHAPTER III

CRITERIA FOR EVALUATING INTERVIEWS

Certain statistical data have now been reviewed and analyzed. We have learned something about the types of problems that are dealt with, the number of interviews a minister has had, the length of interviews, and numerous other details which are indicative of some factors related to effective or ineffective counseling, but the touchstone of any counseling situation that most realistically reveals its worth is the interview itself.

It is now our intention to analyze the individual interviews to see if we can evaluate what took place in the relationship of counselor to client. Perhaps it is proper at this point to acknowledge the truth that, ultimately, the only way to evaluate the effectiveness of an interview is to examine what took place in the behavior of the client after the interview was finished. Such a pragmatic approach to the problem was denied the writer for a variety of reasons, chief of which was the impracticality of maintaining sustained contact with a large number of widely dispersed counselors. The limitations of making a judgment of the success of a counseling interview solely on reported interviews, the majority of which are not verbatim reports, is fully recognized.

Since it is necessary to evaluate what the participants of the study reported after each interview, a list of criteria for such an evaluation was devised.

The preparation of such a list was not simple. One's definition of counseling and the particular school to which he subscribes would greatly influence the criteria he chooses. The complexity of selecting criteria becomes more pronounced when an attempt is made to evaluate the counseling that is done by a man whose vocation is motivated by religious principles and whose role is prescribed by society in the spiritual as well as the mundane milieu. For the person possessing a religious faith there are resources other than those which are purely physical, or psychological. These are intangibles which the minister or chaplain feels are available to those who are willing to appropriate them by faith. This is not to imply that God is not the creator and author of things physical and psychological. Nor must we assume that spiritual assistance drops rather mechanically upon those who utter the correct incantations, or that God, independent of a person's cooperation, will participate very much in the therapeutic process or supply whatever else is needed. If a man needs food for his family it is far more genuinely spiritual for a counselor to indicate places where he can get a job rather than piously to fold his hands and suggest they pray that the bountiful hand of God provide them with a well-spread table. The line of demarcation between the secular and sacred is often very wispy and not easily defined. Yet there are times when prayer is valuable in a counseling interview, and occasions arise when a deep religious faith or inspiration from the Bible is exceedingly helpful, and perhaps the only benefits that will meet certain needs of a client.

Even though there were difficulties in setting up a list of criteria, a list of such standards by which the reported interviews could be judged was set up. These criteria are presented on page 35. Here we shall attempt to explain them one by one in the following paragraphs.

THE CRITERIA

The criteria were selected on the basis of the writer's general acquaintance with the field of counseling which is the result of formal courses taken on the graduate level at Wayne University and the University of Michigan, and practical experience as a pastor, camp director, army chaplain, and college dean. A valuable portion of the formal training consisted of experience in the Counseling Laboratory which is directed by Dr. Edward C. Roeber at the University of Michigan. In addition to training and practical experience, helpful information in the formulation of a list of criteria was found in Carl R. Rogers', Counseling and Psychotherapy,¹ and Seward Hiltner's text, Pastoral Counseling.² It seemed wise to include some criteria which would come from an authority in the field of pastoral counseling since practically all of the participants would be functioning as pastoral counselors. These criteria were also approved by the three trained persons who assisted in the rating procedure.

1. Identification of the Real Problem

This criterion represents the ability to listen, speak, and act in such a manner that it will be possible to identify the real problem that is troubling the client instead of accepting the one that is verbalized. Skilled counselors well know that a client very often refuses to reveal his real problem until he has come to feel confident in his relationship with the counselor. In early interviews, therefore, the counselor will do well to allow his client to speak and act in a very natural manner. The actual words of the client may not bring the basic problem

¹Carl R. Rogers, Counseling and Psychotherapy, (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1942).

²Seward Hiltner, Pastoral Counseling, (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1949).

into proper focus but experience and a knowledge of the dynamics of behavior should help the counselor recognize certain "signs" or "signals."

2. Clarification of the Problem

A person may come to his counselor unable to identify that which actually disturbs him but before long sees the issues that really annoys him. Seeing the real issue, however, does not necessarily mean that he is capable of viewing his problem clearly. A client may come to realize that his marital problems are a result, not of his wife's inordinate yearning for social position, but of his own feeling of inadequacy. He then must understand how this feeling of inadequacy expresses itself and why it exists. After the real cause of difficulty is isolated then it must be examined as clearly as possible.

3. Encouragement of Free Expression of Feelings

This is very often a difficult problem for many ministers to solve. The very nature of the minister's role as a protagonist of righteousness and the enemy of evil brands him, in the eyes of many, as one before whom it may be unsafe to express true feelings. The Protestant heritage, with its abhorrence of the confessional and its insistence that confession is made to God alone, has made it uncomfortable for clients to express feelings and attitudes other than those clothed in sweetness and light. The physician cannot possibly employ therapy for a wound which the patient stubbornly shields with a contaminated hand.

4. Absence of Moralizing or Preaching

Freedom on the part of a parishioner who comes for counsel may be blocked by the pastor who begins making moral judgments which are often a substitute for understanding. Intentional or unintentional moralizing can destroy a spontaneous relationship which is vital to a wholesome interview. Instead of clarifying an ethical issue a minister will

sometimes use the device of moral coercion which results in an artificial or superficial decision on the part of the parishioner. Seward Hiltner has some interesting and enlightening comments that are relevant here.

It is tempting to speculate on why we pastors have such a predilection for moral judgment even when its exercise clearly defeats our larger purposes. To some extent it is the expression of a general habit pattern built up partly out of our real concern to view what is right and wrong about the world in which we live and partly out of the fact that people unconsciously expect us to approach things through the avenue of moral judgment. We preach about the criteria of right and wrong, and properly so. But subtly, unless we are careful, this becomes our dominant perspective. We forget, "Judge not, that ye be not judged," and become more concerned with the sin than with the sinner.

.....
Similarly we tend to have a vaguely uncomfortable feeling if a situation looks as if it required a moral judgment and we fail to speak up. Of course there are situations when we should speak out. But we may be suspicious when we hear someone who has spoken out say afterwards, "I just felt I had to get myself on record," or "I just had to clear my conscience." There may be deeply ingrained selfishness in the insistence on clearing one's conscience regardless of the consequences to other people. It may or may not be the thing to do, but there should be some standard involved other than the degree of tension which we feel inside ourselves. In counseling, moral judgments, in place of understanding and clarification are especially likely to be disastrous.¹

5. Appropriate Use of the Resources of the Christian Faith

The minister does have certain resources available which the Christian faith affords him. This is not to say that they are exclusively the minister's. They are offered to anyone else who chooses to use them, and there are many counselors who do. It is expected that the pastor, more than any other counselor, will take advantage of these tools of the Christian faith for two rather obvious reasons. By the very fact that a man is a minister there is the assumption that he is dedicated to the Christian Church and therefore believes in the efficacy of its resources.

¹Seward Hiltner, Pastoral Counseling (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1949), pp. 49-50.

Then, too, his theological training should have provided him with skills in the use of these distinctive resources of religion in his own life and in the lives of those he is called upon to counsel.

These tools of the faith are prayer, the Bible, religious literature, and Christian doctrine. Some would include the sacraments and rites of the Church but these will not be considered in this study because the vast majority of the men who participated are Baptists and therefore accept only two sacraments which they refer to as ordinances. Even though Baptists are an exceedingly heterogeneous group, theologically speaking, there is widespread agreement that Baptist churches perform no rites such as those practiced in some of the more liturgical churches.

Prayer.--There are few ministers who would question the power of prayer in a counseling interview. The question of the use of prayer as a spiritual resource in an interview has to do with when to pray and then, perhaps the more difficult question, how to pray. The answer to these queries is dependent, the writer believes, upon the relationship of the client to the counselor, the attitude of the client toward the Church or toward the Christian faith (occasionally these two attitudes are not identical), the nature of the problem brought to the counselor, and finally, the environmental conditions. Very often there are distracting factors in the home, hospital ward, or wherever the counseling is being done, that would suggest that prayer at the given moment may be inappropriate.

Everett B. Leshner, in his pamphlet, Strength in Our Sickness, writes:

The bedside prayer is not a magical rite. It is a tested method of helping to bring to our stress and anxiety the quieting

influence of the Eternal--of making available to us the spiritual resources from which can come peace of mind and, very often, healing strength for the body.¹

The Bible.--Appropriate use of the Bible in a counseling situation would consider the knowledge and the attitude that the client already has concerning the Scriptures. An isolated verse which is taken out of context and hurled at a young person with little knowledge of Biblical facts may cause embarrassment and quickly place a barrier between the minister and the youth. Or the quoting of a Scripture verse to a man who completely rejects the Church and the authority of the Bible may make his rejection more severe. The pastor should always ask himself, "What is the readiness of this person for the acceptance of a passage from the Bible, and what is the relationship of the portion that is to be used to the problem we are trying to solve?"

Religious literature.--There are many kinds of religious literature which can be used to a great advantage by the pastor as he seeks to counsel. A person inexperienced in prayer may be presented a small book of prayers or a card on which various prayers are printed. For the individual who is struggling with some issue in which there are theological aspects there are numerous inexpensive books by such writers as Elton Trueblood, J. B. Phillips, and C. S. Lewis. It may be that one of the most profitable gestures a pastor can make toward a person gripped by the drink habit is simply to leave with him a copy of Alcoholics Anonymous.

Christian doctrine.--Problems involving human relationships are often baffling but for those who accept the Christian faith, and often for those who do not accept it, insight is given through a study of the teachings of Jesus Christ. The ubiquitous problem (or perhaps it is more

¹Beverett B. Leshner, Strength in our Sickness, (New York: Federal Council, 1947).

accurately described as a mystery) of sin and suffering in a God-created world is frequently illuminated, though confessedly not completely solved, by the light of Christian doctrine. The judicious use of Christian teaching will insist that it be used as a means of revelation and discovery rather than as a weapon of threat or coercion.

6. Identification of the Client's Need With His Problem

Effective counseling will result in identifying the client's need with his real problem. Since all human beings have manifold needs the situation can be conceived in which a genuine need of the client is recognized by the counselor but it has little to do with the problem at hand. If an automobile mechanic repairs a broken windshield wiper and neglects to adjust the timing, for which purpose the automobile was brought to the garage, he is rendering some type of service but it is misplaced. So the counselor must relate the need to the problem.

Closely allied with the task of identifying the real need is that of sensing the specific need. It is one thing for a physician to make the diagnosis that a patient is in poor health and quite a different matter for him to state the physical disorder that, when corrected, will undoubtedly produce normal health. Does the counselor feel that the client who is estranged from his wife needs to love his wife more or does he see a specific need which, if met, will probably result in a better marital relationship?

7. Helping the Client Help Himself

In a course on counseling that the writer was teaching for a group of ministers about a year ago the question of a definition of counseling was raised. The majority of the ministers in the class felt that counseling had much to do with the giving of advice. The ideas

expressed by the ministers revealed the concept of counseling as being a situation in which the pastor had the answers and the persons who came for help could do no better than accept the proffered advice.

Very often there are counseling opportunities that involve a problem best solved by making a direct approach or giving factual information. Or it is possible to have as a client a person whose personality structure is such that he needs the support that a counselor offers by a directive approach. However, even in such a case the counselor's objective ought to be aimed at helping the client become self sufficient. Carl R. Rogers expresses this viewpoint in his opening pages of Counseling and Psychotherapy.

It aims directly toward the greater independence and integration of the individual rather than hoping that such results will accrue if the counselor assists in solving the problem. The individual and not the problem is the focus. The aim is not to solve one particular problem, but to assist the individual to grow, so that he can cope with the present problem and with later problems in a better-integrated fashion. If he can gain enough integration to handle one problem in more independent, more responsible, less confused, better organized ways, then he will also handle new problems in that manner.¹

8. The Ability to Recognize the Need for a Referral

One of the skills that a minister ought to possess as a competent counselor is the ability to recognize his own limitations. When he sees his own inadequacy to handle a particular problem he should attempt to refer the client to someone trained to deal with the kind of difficulty the client is facing. An intelligent referral is a mark of good counseling.

In the following pages the foregoing criteria will be applied to the interviews as reported by the respondents who replied to our inquiry as explained in Chapter II.

¹Carl R. Rogers, Counseling and Psychotherapy (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1942), pp. 28-29.

CHAPTER IV

APPLICATION OF THE EVALUATIVE CRITERIA TO ACTUAL INTERVIEWS

We now come to the evaluation of the interviews of thirty-eight counselors which our respondents sent at our request. By means of the evaluative criteria described in Chapter III the interviews were studied and placed in one of three classifications: good, poor, or questionable. The number assigned to each category is shown in Table X, Appendix A. To categorize interviews in this fashion means that value judgments had to be made, guided by the foregoing standards.

The accuracy with which counselors were regarded as being proficient, not proficient, or questionable in their counseling techniques was explored. A random sample of half of the counselors was chosen from each of the two participating seminaries. Twenty-six counselors were selected from Andover Newton and twenty-nine from Eastern. Three persons were then selected to read all of the interviews submitted by the fifty-five counselors included in the sample and, on the basis of these interviews, rate the counselors' techniques as good, bad, or questionable. These three individuals were instructed to rate as questionable the techniques of those counselors who in some interviews demonstrated poor judgment and unacceptable techniques on the basis of the previously mentioned criteria which they had read before they began their rating procedure. Two of the three persons who joined in these ratings have graduate degrees in guidance and counseling and the third

is a graduate of Colgate-Rochester Divinity School where he had training in pastoral counseling. Each of the three persons has done counseling on a college campus. The results of this procedure are found in Tables IV and V. The three categories, (1) poor, (2) questionable, and (3) good were given numerical values of 1, 2, and 3, respectively for statistical purposes. The amount of agreement between the group of three raters and the writer produced a coefficient of .74. These ratings corroborated those already established by the writer, thus tending to validate his judgment of the interviews. The agreement between the "three-person" evaluations and that of the writer was further statistically computed by means of the following formula:

$$r_{nn} = \frac{nr_{11}}{1+(n-1)r_{11}} \quad (\text{Spearman-Brown formula}).$$

In this case $r_{nn} = .85$.

As the result of a thorough study of each counselor's interviews in the light of the established criteria and statistical findings, it was possible to rate the 111 counselors and place them in one of three categories. (Difference: $\chi^2 = 68.90$ significant at .01. Table X, Appendix A).

It would be both painstaking and monotonous to analyze here every one of the 421 interviews which comprise the whole array upon which this study is based; in fact, such a procedure might add little or nothing to the significance of our project. Instead a representative number of interviews from each of the three categories has been selected for attention. Why they received the ratings assigned them will be explained. In this manner the merits and faults of these representative interviews can be displayed and if a correct evaluation has been made it is then a matter of arithmetic whereby we count the number of good, poor, and questionable interviews in order to learn which seminary has

TABLE IV
GROUP RATINGS OF A RANDOM SAMPLE
OF ANDOVER NEWTON COUNSELORS

Counselor	Rater A	Rater B	Rater C	The Writer
1	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
2	Good	Good	Good	Good
3	Questionable	Good	Questionable	Questionable
4	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable
5	Good	Good	Good	Good
6	Questionable	Poor	Good	Questionable
7	Good	Questionable	Good	Good
8	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
9	Good	Good	Good	Good
10	Good	Good	Good	Good
11	Good	Good	Good	Good
12	Poor	Questionable	Questionable	Poor
13	Questionable	Poor	Poor	Poor
14	Good	Good	Good	Good
15	Good	Good	Good	Questionable
16	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable	Poor
17	Good	Good	Good	Good
18	Good	Questionable	Good	Good
19	Questionable	Poor	Questionable	Questionable
20	Questionable	Good	Good	Good
21	Good	Good	Good	Good
22	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable
23	Good	Good	Good	Good
24	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
25	Good	Questionable	Good	Good
26	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable

(Spearman-Brown formula) $r_{nn} = .85$

TABLE V
GROUP RATINGS OF A RANDOM
SAMPLE OF EASTERN COUNSELORS

Counselor	Rater A	Rater B	Rater C	The Writer
1	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable
2	Questionable	Poor	Poor	Poor
3	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
4	Good	Good	Good	Good
5	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
6	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
7	Questionable	Questionable	Poor	Questionable
8	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
9	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
10	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
11	Good	Good	Good	Good
12	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
13	Questionable	Poor	Poor	Good
14	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
15	Questionable	Good	Questionable	Questionable
16	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
17	Questionable	Poor	Poor	Poor
18	Good	Questionable	Good	Good
19	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
20	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
21	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable
22	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
23	Poor	Questionable	Poor	Poor
24	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
25	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable
26	Poor	Poor	Poor	Poor
27	Good	Good	Good	Good
28	Questionable	Poor	Poor	Questionable
29	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable	Questionable

(Spearman-Brown formula) $r_{nn} = .85$

graduated the greater number of good counselors. Each of the counselors in the following analyses was rated by the three raters and the writer.

ANALYSIS OF POOR INTERVIEWS FROM ANDOVER
NEWTON THEOLOGICAL SCHOOL

The first group of interviews to be discussed are those classified as poor. A sample of those counselors who have graduated from Andover Newton Theological School whose interviews were unanimously rated as poor will be considered. In this category there are six counselors. See Table X, Appendix A.

Counselor A - Case 1

Situation.--Mrs. A is a married woman thirty-two years old. She is a member of the church of which the counselor is the pastor. She came to her minister because her husband abuses her and the children. Her own parents, who live in the same small village, give her no sympathy. The only solution, as far as she is concerned, is to get a divorce. Her basic problem, according to the counselor, is her parents. The counselor gave direct advice in that he "asked her to think through the situation as she outlined her intention and decide on its merits." The pastor was sympathetic in his feelings toward the client but he was uncertain of the client's feelings toward him. "The client's greatest need is for security," reports the counselor. There was no referral made.

Analysis.--The report did not indicate in what manner the husband abused the wife and children. Apparently it was concluded that the husband was cruel and the wife was an innocent bystander who got no sympathy from her parents. In effect the counselor seemed to say, "Think through your decision and weigh its merits. If it seems like a good idea go ahead with it." The counselor did not probe for any feelings on the part of

the client but he acted as though he ought to play the role of the sympathizer since the parents had neglected to do so. In this interview we find the need for the proverbial "security" but the counselor does not get specific enough to be of much help.

Counselor A - Case 2

Situation.--The same client reported in Case 1 received her divorce and then came to her minister confessing that she had "much affection for her divorced husband and desired to express that affection for him--with obvious loss of 'face.'" However, the counselor writes that his verbalization of her problem does not express her real problem. Her basic problem is the "same as during the first visit--parental--parents did not want her--never was secure with them. Fought for affection." Her pastor "assured her of her proper or wise reactions in returning kindness for unkindness and in her prayerful attitude to solve whole matter." As before her basic need is recorded as being that of security. No referral was made.

Analysis.--The attitude of the client toward her former husband raises a question concerning the necessity of the divorce. With proper guidance it appears as though the divorce might have been forgotten. Again the parental aspect of the problem is mentioned but the reason this looms so large in the thinking of the counselor is not revealed. If this is so fundamental why is it that the counselor does not assist the client in understanding this situation and its manifestation in her total behavior? There appears to be no point in assuring the client that her returning kindness for unkindness was the proper thing to do. This kind of behavior may be definitely Christian but what does it have to do with the case in point?

Counselor B - Case 1

Situation.--This is the eighth interview the counselor has had with a woman who is eighty years old. At the beginning of the interview the client asked, "Do you believe that God would send my little son (age 7) to hell? Someone told me he was not a Christian and the Bible says only 40,000 will be saved." The counselor did not believe this query revealed the real problem. The counselor reports the real problem - "This woman is getting along in years and I believe she is afraid to die. She has no use for the church, thinks they are nothing but sinners of the worst order. But the problem of death keeps coming up." The counselor listened mostly and tried to find out what it was about death that caused her worry. He also asked her to read the Bible carefully. Even though the counselor felt sympathetic toward the client he writes that she demonstrated hostile feelings toward him. Neither prayer nor Bible reading was participated in on the part of the counselor. He claims that the old lady "has few people to talk to. Needs to feel wanted."

Analysis.--One of our criteria we are employing dealt with the appropriate use of the Christian resources. In this case either the first stated problem or the one the counselor identified as the real one should call for the use of Christian resources such as prayer, Bible reading, or Christian doctrine. If, in previous visits, the counselor has brought as little spiritual ministry as on this occasion it can be seen why there may be some hostility on the client's part. Even though she may have no use for the church because of some of its members she probably expects the minister to play his prescribed role. By using Christian doctrine he could have helped her to see that her abhorrence of hypocrisy was consistent with the views of Jesus. Even if the client disagreed with the church and had antagonism toward its members

it is reasonable to assume that after eight interviews of a loving and understanding nature that hostility would have disappeared. There is not even an indication that the counselor attempted to help the woman with her problem concerning her son who had died when he was a little boy. The Christian faith does not have clear answers to all difficulties but in this situation the counselor missed an opportunity to render helpful service. Rather than ask the old lady to read the Bible carefully after he had gone he might better have read an appropriate passage to her and explained what he had read.

Counselor B - Case 2

Situation.--Mrs. S is a thirty-year-old married woman. This is the fifth interview she has had about her family problem. The counselor describes, "The husband drinks too much, spends most of his money for drink; has no time for the four children. Husband gives the wife very little money to run the house. Beats her. Will not buy children clothes. Does not want wife earning money by selling Avon Products. She wanted a divorce." The counselor insists that the problem is the husband's. "He drinks too much, but the wife does not want the minister to call. Wife may be partly to blame and she admits it." For over an hour the counselor listened and hardly spoke a word. Since this was the fifth interview he suggested that a social worker be consulted. There was no praying nor reference to the Bible. The conclusion of the counselor is that Mrs. S needs a sense of security.

Analysis.--Why is it that a husband who is supposed to do all of the wicked things Mrs. S's husband does would react unfavorably to his wife's selling products to support the family? Is his sense of dignity being threatened? Why is it that Mrs. does not want the minister

to call on her husband? Has there ever been an attempt to get him to see the counselor with his wife? After five interviews there ought to be some indication of the place of the wife in this marital disagreement. If she admitted that she was partly to blame the counselor should have encouraged her to express her feelings toward her husband and explained in what way she was to blame. In view of the fact that the client desired a divorce one questions her reasons for refusing to let the pastor call on her husband. Was she fearful that her husband may say something about her she did not want her minister to know? It looks as though there are too many unexplored areas to make a referral to a social worker. Unless the social worker is well-trained in counseling a psycho-therapist would be a more appropriate referral.

Counselor C - Case 1

Situation.--The client, Mrs. L, is a widow in her sixties. This is the third interview. Her husband's recent death throws upon Mrs. L the responsibility for the sale of the house, the necessity of making an unaided decision concerning a surgical operation suggested by her physician, and the problem of what to do with her grandson who is now in her custody. The counselor listened attentively and then "sought to find an avenue she could travel upon." Prayer was offered for the client. Her deepest need, reports the counselor, is to have "somebody in whom she can find friendship and encouragement." No referral was made.

Analysis.--Mrs. L's problem has many angles which make it complex. Simply to say she needs somebody in whom she can find friendship and encouragement is minimizing her conflicts. These problems do not have to be clarified very much. She does not have to find "an 'avenue to travel upon'" but a "few" avenues. What about a place to live if

the house is sold? Are there children or other relatives with whom she can live? Is there any possibility of employment for Mrs. L? Did her husband leave any insurance? Friendship and encouragement may be helpful to the woman but she needs the kind of friendship that will offer practical help. The decision to have the operation needs much study and advice from a physician rather than friendship. The disposition of the grandson requires the answers to many questions such as the grandmother's feeling toward the boy, whether or not there are other relatives who would take him, will it be necessary for him to be in an institution, etc.? The client needs support and perhaps the services of a lawyer as well as a minister. The counselor did pray with the client.

Counselor C - Case 2

Situation.---Mrs. S is a widow seventy-three years of age who, during this first interview, revealed "a feeling that her expression before people is not what she feels inside. She feels perhaps a little hypocritical and that she is frozen up inside." The counselor believes this is an expression of her true problem. He "listened and tried to ascertain what brought about this present condition. The client had the Bible read to her and prayer was offered also. According to the counselor she needs to see these problems in their true light. The interview lasted two-and-a-half hours. No referral was made.

Analysis.---The main criticism of this interview is that after two-and-a-half hours the counselor ought to be able to say something more than "the client's greatest need is to see these problems in their true light." This is one of those generalizations that would be condemned by our criterion concerning the identification of the client's need with the problem. How many of us do not have the need to see our

problems in their true light? The task of the counselor is to aid Mrs. S in seeing her problems in their true light. Surely he could have at least started on the road to discovering what her real problem is. He is identifying the symptom as the problem itself. Since the client did not request seeing the counselor again the question of the amount of help he gave is an important one. Whether or not a client asks for another interview is no criterion of good counseling procedures but in this case it is reasonable to assume that her problem was not solved and that another interview would have been suggested by the client.

Counselor C - Case 3

Situation.--The client is a married man fifty-three years of age. The counselor had never known the client before this first interview. The client takes care of the house and gets the meals while the wife works. He feels this situation disturbs him as does the fact that his wife "nags" him about little things around the house. The counselor believes his problem to be "an unrealistic attitude concerning his ability to perform the type of work he did during and preceding World War II. There is, I believe, a personality maladjustment with which I am not able to cope." The counselor listened and sought to lead him to see some alternative possibilities. Before the interview was concluded the counselor prayed and read portions of Scripture to the client. The client's greatest need, states the counselor, is "the alignment of his personality with reality and a focus upon God's ability." No referral was made and the interview lasted two hours.

Analysis.--Since the counselor admits he felt inadequate to cope with the situation why did he not make a referral to someone who could? The counselor's use of the Bible may have been appropriate but

this is not readily seen. Just what is meant by focusing upon God's ability in this situation is a statement that needs clarification. A realistic view of the client's ability would probably be more meaningful. It is surprising, too, that the client's wife does not enter more into this interview other than in the stating of her part in creating the problem.

ANALYSIS OF POOR INTERVIEWS FROM EASTERN BAPTIST THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

In this category there are thirty-two counselors who, it was judged, employed unacceptable techniques in their interviews. All of those included in this sample were unanimously rated by the four judges as violating the established criteria to the extent that they could be rated as poor counselors. See Table X, Appendix A.

Counselor A - Case 1

Situation.--The client is a young man, a Baptist, eighteen years of age, and in his first year of college. This is the second interview. He wants to break off with a Roman Catholic girl who was his "steady" during high school. The counselor states that he "helped him to think out for himself several solutions." During the interview there was prayer. The client did most of the talking. According to the counselor the client's greatest need is a "closer spiritual walk with Christ." The counselor reported that he admired the young man for his stand.

Analysis.--There apparently was no attempt to learn the reason for the young man's desire to stop keeping company with the Catholic girl. This severance of relations seemed like a good idea to the minister so he immediately proceeded to implement the youth's desire. How can there be several solutions to a problem like this? If the client,

in his own mind, is certain that this relationship ought to be broken. why not have the young man approach the girl and simply state his reasons. If there is no possibility of either person's changing to the faith of the other, and if they both reject a compromise suggesting that they stop attending any church, then it is a matter of sitting down in an intelligent manner and having the two young people come to an agreement.

Whether or not prayer is appropriate in this interview would depend upon the content of such a prayer. Since the counselor declares that the client's greatest need is a closer spiritual walk with Christ it can be conjectured that the prayer might have been unrelated to the difficult task of informing the young lady that it would be best if they no longer saw each other except as friends. The prayer ought to include a request for mutual understanding and the lessening of any heartache that the "break" may cause. There was nothing mentioned in the report that would reveal the reason for stating that the client's need was a closer walk with Christ. Even if some type of Christian commitment were the greatest need of the client it could be expressed in a more helpful way by suggesting concrete examples of how to put into everyday living the kind of behavior the counselor described as "spiritual walk with Christ."

Counselor A - Case 2

Situation.--A man and his wife in their thirties visited the pastor on three occasions to discuss their marital incompatibility. The husband works unusual hours and thinks his wife should be home whenever he is at home. The wife claims that she takes good care of the home and family but never knows when her husband will be coming home from work. There is general unhappiness at home. The counselor

indicated his feeling toward the client as a combination of sympathy and resentment. "Deeper personal problems, mainly spiritual and both needing Christ" was the real problem in the lives of this married couple as far as the pastor was concerned. Their greatest need was "to take Christ into their hearts and home." The pastor "asked two fine Christian couples to call in their home."

Analysis.--How can a counselor be helpful to clients by simply stating that the real problem relates to deeper personal and mainly spiritual difficulties? How is this evidenced? If the counselor recognized these deeper problems he should have tried to clarify them for the clients. He claims he tried to get Mr. and Mrs. X to see both sides of the matter. What kind of behavior was manifest that caused the minister to come to the conclusion that they both needed to take Christ into their hearts and home? Instead of helping the couple to identify the real reasons for their incompatibility the counselor takes the easy way out by indicating that Christ can blandly solve all problems apart from human cooperation. Whether or not the clients desired having "two fine Christian couples call in their home" is not indicated in the report. If the couple, lacking marital harmony, had not been consulted about this supposedly therapeutic measure it is likely that the minister's further opportunities for counseling were completely blocked.

Counselor A - Case 3

Situation.--A fifteen-year old girl conferred with her minister about her parents who "are too strict and who do not understand her." The counselor analyzed the girl's problem as being brought on because she is a "rather selfish girl who doesn't really want to live 'all out' for Christ." He tried to be sympathetic with her problem but pointed

out the viewpoint of the parents also. He was uncertain about his feeling toward the girl and uncertain about her feelings toward him. Above everything else the counselor believes the client needs a "less selfish outlook on life." According to the minister the girl "wants the crown without the cross." He confessed that he felt like spanking the girl. The interview lasted for twenty minutes.

Analysis.---Apparently the counselor knows very little about adolescent psychology or else he would have helped the client to see why she believes her parents are too strict and why she thinks "they don't understand her." It may quite possibly be true that her parents do not understand her or any other fifteen-year-old girl. Maybe some time should be spent in counseling with the parents in an effort to help them understand the normality of so-called adolescent behavior. Perhaps such an obvious fact as the extreme pressure exerted on the typical adolescent by the peer group is an unknown psychological fact to her parents. It seems to be a rather harsh indictment against a fifteen-year-old girl to declare that she "doesn't want to live 'all out' for Christ and wants the crown without the cross." An overly critical attitude toward the girl is likely to make her more selfish and less interested in the Christian faith because of the negative, restrictive connotation she may develop. At this stage she probably needs more understanding and happy fellowship from her pastor than she needs theology.

Counselor B - Case 1

Situation.---An eighteen-year-old girl came to her minister for guidance concerning what college she ought to attend. The counselor believed the client was actually seeking his approval of the college of

her first choice because she felt guilty for not wanting to attend the Christian college which her parents had chosen. The pastor wrote, "I asked her to be settled as to a life profession first." In addition to praying with the young lady the counselor read the Bible to her. The client's attitude toward religion is very favorable. The counselor says the girl "needs to make up her own mind about many things." The interview lasted one-hour-and-a-half. No referral was made.

Analysis.--Why is it necessary for a girl to be settled as to a life profession before choosing a college? If she does not decide on a career by the time she is ready to enroll in college what does the counselor do then? The interview report did not even hint that the counselor tried to learn what college the girl had chosen and why she had made the choice. If the minister felt it a proper action for the girl to settle on her professional career he should have explored her interests and aptitudes on a verbal basis and suggested visiting a guidance clinic where further help could be given in a more scientific manner. Since the client lives in Chicago such a referral would seem logical in view of the numerous clinics available there. If the girl comes from a home that is basically Christian and the girl herself has given no evidence of waywardness or rebellion against the church, the counselor might point out the fact that there are thousands of young people from Christian homes who every year go to colleges and universities which are not church-related and yet their faith is not destroyed. It could be further elaborated that on practically every campus there are religious organizations that offer inspiration and spiritual counsel.

Counselor B - Case 2

Situation.--A young lady seventeen years old came to her minister

to discuss a serious disagreement she had had with her very close girl friend over the client's parents who are not Christian. This is the real problem that disturbs the client and which she revealed to her minister. However, the counselor insists that the girl's basic problem is a "lack of understanding in human relations." He gave no direct advice but explains, "I sought to help her see that she and her friend could come to me and talk things over." The client's greatest need is "growing up physically, mentally, and spiritually." Prayer was offered during the interview.

Analysis.--Just what is meant by the client's lack of understanding in human relations is vague. Nor is it clear what prompted the counselor to make the statement. The various parts of this interview seem to be disjointed. It is not very clear why the pastor declares that growing up physically, mentally, and spiritually is the girl's greatest need. What is the relationship of her need to grow physically to her problem? It appears as though the counselor did little except seek to help the client to see that she and her friend could come to him and talk things over. If his attitude is friendly and understanding he does not have to "seek to help the client see that she and her friend could come to him and talk things over" -- all he has to do is invite the two of them to come for a simultaneous interview. Since this was a disagreement between two people perhaps this should have been his objective right from the start.

Counselor C - Case 1

Situation.--The client is thirty years old, mother of two children, and has come to her minister because she has been sick and believes she has cancer. She is also concerned about her husband who is

not a Christian. The counselor "advised her to use this (her belief that she has cancer) to reach her husband." At the present no tests have been made which would make it possible to say for certain that she does have cancer. The minister prayed and read the Bible to the client. During the thirty-minute interview it was determined that the client's greatest need is "stability of emotions." A referral was made to a physician.

Analysis.--One of the criteria we have adopted states that good counseling will be specific rather than general in describing an individual's needs. Here is a thirty-year-old mother of two young children who is threatened with the fear of cancer and disturbed about her husband's faith and the counselor briefly indicates her greatest need as stability of emotions. Her greatest need is good medical care. But the most disturbing element in the interview is the counselor's suggestion that the woman's uncertain physical condition be used as a ruse to get her unsuspecting husband into the Kingdom. This is stooping to the unethical in counseling. One wonders how much genuine concern the minister has for the sick mother in comparison with his evangelistic zeal.

Counselor C - Case 2

Situation.--The client is a married woman fifty years of age. She is a member of the counselor's church. This is the first interview. Her husband went away with another woman and has returned to the small community in which they live. Shall the client remain in the same community in which her husband is employed, though not living with his wife, or should she move to a nearby town and seek employment? After the problem was mentioned the counselor wrote, "I believed her idea good." The interview report does not indicate what her idea was. The

counselor feels the client needs encouragement and humility. During the interview the counselor prayed with the client.

Analysis.--Apparently no investigation was made into the possibility of a reconciliation between the client and her husband. Before the client acted it might have been well to refer her to a lawyer to make certain that she was not doing anything unwise in case there would be court procedure later on. If the client were the innocent party in this separation it can be understood why encouragement and true sympathy would be needed but there is nothing in the interview itself that suggests the client needed humility. This whole experience would be humiliating enough. In order to compensate for a deep feeling of humiliation the client may have demonstrated a false bravado and devil-may-care attitude. It appears as though the counselor treated this problem rather superficially.

Counselor D - Case 1

Situation.--The client is a married man twenty-four years old, a member of no church, and previously unknown to the counselor. The wife of the client is a member of a Sunday Church School class taught by the counselor's wife who suggested that her husband, as the minister of the church, visit the client. The only information given about the client is that he needed help. The type of help needed was not mentioned. Whatever the client spoke about during the first part of the interview was not revealed in the interview report. However, the counselor claims that the real problem was not revealed in the early stages of the interview. As far as the counselor is concerned he feels that the real problem is selfishness. A few suggestions were made to the client but what they were is not known. Most of the talking was done by the

counselor who admits that he was uncertain of the client's attitude toward him. The outstanding need of the client is to "put God first in home and heart." The client demonstrated little interest in the interview. Prayer was offered before the forty-five minute interview concluded. The counselor requested that client come to see him again.

Analysis.--Anyone who has a knowledge of the bare essentials of counseling and voluntarily consents to participate in a study of counseling methods would surely indicate the type of problem that was bothering his client. This counselor simply states that he went to see the client because help was needed. Then he states the client's problem as selfishness but does not explain what factors caused him to come to that conclusion. It would seem wise for the counselor to allow the client to do the greater amount of talking to enable the former to learn something about the person he is endeavoring to assist. The comment that the client's greatest need is to put God first in his home and heart appears to be an easy way out of a fairly difficult situation. The use of prayer may be out of keeping with a client who manifests no interest in the church, little interest in the interview, and whose feelings toward the counselor are interpreted as uncertain. It would be interesting to know what the client felt like responding to the minister when he told the client he would like to see him again.

Counselor D - Case 2

Situation.--Mr. X is twenty-nine years old, married, and a member of the counselor's church. In this first interview, which was sought by the client, there is the confession that he is "after another woman." The counselor was convinced of the fact that when the client first explained what his problem was that he did not reveal what really

disturbed him. In the counselor's opinion his real problem was selfishness. The counselor writes that he gave no direct advice but he listened. This is surprising in light of the acknowledgment that the counselor did more talking than the client. Above everything else the client needs to put "God first." The counselor felt as though the client had not been listening while he was talking. In answer to the question on the interview report concerning the client's attitude toward religion the rating was antagonistic. Prayer was offered before the interview was completed.

Analysis.--This counselor seems to hold his nose and jump in feet first rather than to tiptoe into the counseling atmosphere and slowly get acclimated to the temperature. As in the previous case, here is another situation in which the real problem is camouflaged at the outset of the interview. Before long the counselor detects that the client's real concern is not that he is going counter to the mores of society but that he is basically selfish. Regardless of the antagonistic attitude of the client toward religion the counselor offers prayer because the client needs to put God first. Apparently God can be put first in one easy lesson. This counseling technique is so deficient that further comments would be superfluous.

Counselor D - Case 3

Situation.--The client is a man thirty-five years of age. He is married, has children, and is a member of the counselor's church. The problem is a "domestic" one. The client "had driven the wife and children away and was plain he wanted them back at any cost." The counselor "listened and asked wife to come." In this case the client spoke more than the counselor. Here, too, the client's greatest need

was to put "God first in heart." Prayer was offered. A note added to the back of the interview report read, "We were able to effect a family altar and the home is saved."

Analysis.--If the husband, wife, and children are all together once more and "the home is saved" perhaps the purpose of counseling is achieved. But this whole treatment smacks of the practice of treating the symptom and not the disease. In addition to employing the power of prayer and establishing the family altar with its wholesome influence if conducted properly, an investigation into some of the reasons why the husband had driven his wife and children away might have proved very beneficial.

Counselor B - Case 1

Situation.--A man forty-eight years old had been in the hospital. A disagreement had arisen between his wife and him over the expense involved in his being hospitalized. They are buying a home and need all the money they can get. As a result of this disagreement the client "wanted to chuck everything and get a divorce." According to the counselor "the basic problem is the personalities of both wife and husband, aggravated by their new home situation." The interview took place while the client was convalescing in his home. The counselor suggested that the client wait to see how his wife reacted upon returning from her place of employment. Before leaving the home the counselor prayed with the client. When the wife returned she apologized to her husband. In answer to the question, "What do you consider to be the client's greatest need?" the counselor responded, "A change in his wife's over-all attitude toward life."

Analysis.--The report of this interview sounded as though the apology on the part of the wife solved everything. The basic problem in this conflict is reported to be "the personalities of both wife and husband, aggravated by their own home situation" but the client's greatest need is related only to the wife's over-all attitude toward life. It does not appear to be very helpful if a counselor makes a sweeping statement such as the one about the necessity of the wife's changing her total attitude toward life. The counselor would do well to counsel the husband and wife together and attempt to clarify some of these personality difficulties.

Counselor F - Case 1

Situation.--The client is an eighteen-year-old lad who desires to be a minister or missionary. The young man came to talk to his pastor about "problems concerning his desire to be a minister or missionary, such as financial, spiritual, personal, and intellectual." Most of the talking was on the part of the client. The counselor "asked him to pray about this matter; gave him a catalog of my school to give him a better grasp of this work." The interview lasted about one hour during which time the counselor concluded that the client "was sincere but needed much guidance." His greatest need is "to be more industrious - is lazy intellectually and physically."

Analysis.--When a young man has as many problems as his pastor reports him to have it is rather superficial to offer prayer and a school catalog. Why not talk to the boy about the personal qualifications and academic preparation needed in order to become a minister or missionary. Nor would it be out of place to talk intelligently about what constitutes a call to Christian service. Reading and thoroughly understanding a

college or seminary catalog is not the best method for revealing what the Christian ministry entails. Why could not the counselor tell from his own experience what is involved in being a minister? Seeking for some way to motivate this boy properly may remove his lack of industry.

Counselor G - Case 1

Situation.--A forty-five-year old woman, who remarried after her divorce, called on her minister exclaiming, "I am living too much in the past. I am full of doubts." The counselor confesses that he "could not tell just what was causing her to speak as she did. She was not well. She had much debt, that is her husband is deeply in debt." Prayer was offered and Bible texts were quoted. The interview lasted one-half-hour. "An unwillingness to give herself completely to God" was the client's greatest need, according to the counselor. An offer was made by the counselor to take the client to a Christian psychologist or at least someone better trained than he in counseling.

Analysis.--It seems reasonable to expect a man who has graduated from college and seminary and has been in the active ministry ten years to be interested enough in a client to try to get some insight into her problem instead of suggesting a referral after an interview of thirty minutes' duration. One part of the interview report indicates the major problem as being psychological and another part points to a religious origin. If the client ought to give herself completely to God then why not let the minister handle the situation. If, on the other hand, the problem is emotional and psychological then it seems inappropriate to speak about the relationship of the client to God as the focal point. Even though the counselor may not have had very much training in psychology it is common knowledge that there are mental aberrations that

sometimes occur at menopause. This could be a possibility. At least the counselor recognizes his own inability to a certain degree. The whole problem is not well defined.

Counselor G - Case 2

Situation.--A seventeen-year-old boy is "going steady with a girl who is an unwed mother. This fellow is seventeen and the girl is fifteen and I called him to see me, for I wanted him to face up to his problem and all that was involved." The real problem according to the counselor's own words has to do with impurity of motive. "Frankly, I suspect an impure motive in his going with a girl who has already yielded to another. My understanding is that he saw the girl alone and not in the company of other young people." The counselor gave no direct advice, he writes, but he did ask the youth to consider those factors that should guide a young man in making friendships with the opposite sex. The client's attitude toward the minister was described as uncertain. Some Bible verses, not quoted verbatim, were given to the client. His greatest need is "to follow the Lord rather than his own desires." Literature (the kind was not mentioned) was promised the young man and the interview was concluded after ten minutes. The counselor did most of the talking.

Analysis.--This interview sounds as though it completely disregarded the criterion about preaching and moralizing. The preaching tone permeates practically every part of this communication between pastor and young parishioner. Apparently the counselor did not consider the possibility of hearing the young man's side of the story. This sounds like a case of prejudgment. The youth was dead wrong in the minister's opinion and he was going to straighten him out whether he wanted to be straightened out or not. If what the counselor interpreted about the impure motives is

correct then the lad did need help but there is not the slightest indication that the minister's prejudgment may be faulty. If it seemed wise to do so the counselor might have, in a non-directive manner, tried to get the young man to bring the young lady for a joint counseling session.

Counselor H - Case 1

Situation.--This is the third interview with a thirty-year-old man who "had become involved in a sexual act with a twelve year old boy." The interview gives no other information except that the client did more talking than the counselor and an expression of the client's basic need which is "a normal marriage following proper treatment." The client was not referred to a psychiatrist or anyone else who could offer him the help needed.

Analysis.--Recognizing the necessity of proper treatment, one finds it strange that the counselor did not make a referral to a clinical psychologist or a psychiatrist. One also wonders why the minister felt that marriage after treatment is going to solve the problem if the client is a genuine sexual deviate. According to Arthur P. Noyes,

The sexual psychopath's behavior is not a substitute for normal heterosexual relations. It is a form of sexual activity all its own and satisfies some very specific need that normal sexual activity cannot give.... In general, sexual psychopaths are people with deep seated personality disorders of which sex deviation is but one manifestation.¹

It is wise to make no suggestions, such as the one about getting married, to a person with as severe a personality disorder as the one the client probably had.

Counselor I - Case 1

Situation.--Mrs. A is the client. Her age was not given nor was

¹Arthur P. Noyes, Modern Clinical Psychiatry (Philadelphia: W. B. Saunders Company, 1953), p. 509.

any mention made of her husband or children yet she is married. This is the fourth or fifth interview. "This lady spent some time in a state mental institution. She received shock treatment there. She is a person born out of wedlock and her daughter was born out of wedlock though Mrs. A married the father. She was concerned over this situation - wished she knew her parents." The real problem was expressed in this manner, "I couldn't seem to catch it but there is, I feel, a sex problem in the home. She wanders away for days at a time seeking some satisfaction. Her appearance was in poor taste. This lady comes to 'just talk' about every three or four months. I listen and she goes away seemingly satisfied." Her counselor thinks she needs mental stability most of all coupled with a realization that she can be happy in spite of the past. The length of the interview was one hour with a referral made to a "lawyer in case of her desire to follow up on who her real parents were." On the back of the interview form there is this notation: "I had tried to encourage her previously to go to a mental clinic for therapeutic treatment following her return from the State Hospital. She has always refused to do this. I feel she was helped but such a hatred was built up that it is difficult for her to have anything to do with the institution. I wish I could help her see she is improved and that the doctors might be able to help her further. By the way, since she was last here, I have been told by her foster mother that Mrs. A has settled down and is living relatively a normal life."

Analysis.--The counselor admits some confusion relative to the sex problem in the home and the client's wandering away from home for days at a time. It would have been good strategy to try to probe into this situation as it may have uncovered some useful information. The counselor might have tried to get Mrs. A to think through the advantages

of not knowing the identity of her real parents. What is to be gained by such knowledge? The fact that the counselor had made a notation to the effect that the client was reported as having settled down and living a relatively normal life, suggests that he seems to feel that his job has reached a successful conclusion. One wonders how normal behavior can follow so soon upon the heels of abnormal behavior. How long will this normal behavior last? Maybe this is the time, if her behavior is normal, to appeal to Mrs. A to go to some mental hygiene clinic for preventive treatment.

Counselor I - Case 2

Situation.--The client is sixty-two years of age, a member of the counselor's church, and coming for his first interview. The minister says, "After forty years of married life this man tells me his wife is putting him out. He asks me to attempt to get at the basis of his problem and attempt a reconciliation." The counselor also stated that even though the client, Mrs. J, had been married for almost a half-century he and his wife had lived relatively independent lives. Now the problem was to get to doing things together and share finances as well as time. The talking during the interview was about evenly divided between counselor and client. Prayer was offered. "Love from his wife - not sex - more of companionship" was the way the counselor diagnosed Mr. J's most urgent need. The counselor desired to get the client and his wife together for a talk but there was no indication that such plans were made.

Analysis.--On the basis of one interview involving the problem of lack of harmony in human relations it is better to go slow in coming to conclusions as to who is to blame. The counselor, in expressing the client's need intimates that the wife is the one responsible for marital

discord. After an interview in which Mrs. J is taking part the situation may take on a different hue. The counselor fails to see the complexity of this problem. Before getting the husband and wife together for an interview it would be wise to learn about the willingness of the wife to come for an interview.

Counselor J - Case 1

Situation.--Mr. D, whose age was not revealed, proposed to a girl who had refused his proposal. After the refusal he wanted to give her a very nice Bible. The client asked the counselor whether or not he ought to offer the gift of the Bible to the girl. During the interview the client said he "thinks a neighbor has been telling tales on him to this girl and has been trying to break up the match." The counselor believes the crux of Mr. D's problem revolved about the neighbor's gossip. "Apparently this feeling of antagonism to neighbor X builds up in him until he must get it off his chest by talking it out." Three suggestions were made to the client, "(1) recommended he return when the build up reaches the boiling point, (2) recommended he definitely commit their thoughts to the Lord in prayer when they arise, and (3) remain on friendly terms with the girl." Prayer and reference to several scriptural passages were offered. The counselor considers the principal need of Mr. D to be "a practical application of Romans 12:1-2." An added note by the counselor indicates that the client is definitely of retarded mentality or "bound" by some pressure.

Analysis.--Few comments need be made about this interview. Obviously here is a case of mental deficiency and it therefore seems meaningless to state his basic need as being a practical application of Romans 12:1-2 which reads, "I beseech you therefore, brethren, by the

mercies of God, that ye present your bodies a living sacrifice, holy, acceptable unto God which is your reasonable service. And be not conformed to this world but be ye transformed by the renewing of your mind" This kind of exhortation was written for people who have all of their faculties. What does the counselor mean by suggesting that Mr. D definitely commit the neighbors' thoughts to the Lord in prayer when they arise? This sounds like the recitation of pious platitudes which will avail little or nothing. If the counselor is suggesting plain, everyday, forgiveness why not say so.

Counselor J - Case 2

Situation.--Mrs. Y, a member of the counselor's church, had received "a letter in which I indicated that her extra-marital relations had become public scandal and the Deacon Board was very much concerned." In response to this letter Mrs. Y called her minister on the phone and insisted that she did not want any public disturbance and therefore offered to withdraw her membership from the church. A number of weeks previously the counselor called on Mrs. Y to find out why she had not been coming to church but he got no answer that satisfied him. Following the telephone conversation the minister called on Mrs. Y in her home. During the pastoral call the client confessed that she had been keeping company with another man for over two years. "Then she told a tale of her unhappy marital situation in which her husband came home from work, ate a great deal, sat in front of television, and never went anywhere with her - even church." There is one child in the family. The husband, who is fifteen years older than his wife, is a member of the Lutheran church but never attends because of "a private peeve" against the minister. After concluding her recital of her unhappy family life Mrs. Y

assured her pastor that she had broken off with the other man and had confessed her sin to God and knew His forgiveness. In order to prove her sincerity the counselor asked the client to come to church. "She is resentful of some in the church but agreed to pray about it. What she needs most is satisfaction in her married life - physically and spiritually."

Analysis.--A pastoral counselor ought to love people very genuinely. This entire episode seems to reveal a concern about church attendance over and above the one who attends the church. He also seems more disturbed over the public scandal at his church doorsteps than he does about the woman involved. It might have been better to inform the woman of the fact that there were rumors which she ought to know about and that the minister had not approached her as a judge but as a pastor. He also should have gone to her home in person rather than to write to her. His insistence that she "prove" her sincerity by attending church sounded like a threat to get one more person to swell the size of the congregation. Apparently there is no empathy at all on the part of the pastor. The simple and naive prescription that she needed physical and spiritual satisfaction in her married life amplifies the counselor's need for some insight into the dynamics of human personality.

Counselor K - Case 1

Situation.--The client is a married woman twenty-five years old. She is a Baptist but not a member of the counselor's congregation. This is the first interview and the first time the client and counselor have ever met. "Husband is Roman Catholic, she is under stress to give children spiritual training, but husband refuses to let her take them to Baptist church. Husband is not a practicing Catholic." In the interview

report the question is asked, "If you gave no direct advice what did you do?" To this query the counselor responded, "Had her accept Christ as her Savior and Lord." The counselor did most of the talking and he confesses that he was uncertain of the feelings of the client toward him. Prayer and Bible reading during the interview. According to the pastor's words the client's greatest need is begin church again herself, and seek to have husband discuss problem with me."

Analysis.---The counselor would surely disagree with the many writers of counseling texts who declare that the counseling relationship takes time. This counselor obviously felt that he could accomplish his objective in one easy lesson. One definition of pastoral counseling is, "A religious ministry to individual persons in dynamic relationships, arising from insight into essential needs and mutual discovery of potentialities for spiritual growth."¹ In the situation described above there is no attempt at any dynamic relationship nor is there a desire for insight into essential needs. What about the feelings of the husband when he hears what has happened? The counselor "had her accept Christ as her Lord and Savior." It sounds like coercion. Does anyone "have" people make this kind of a decision or is it a matter of spiritual need and voluntary choice? The counselor displays his complete confidence in his own persuasive ability by remarking that the wife should "have the husband discuss the problem with me." Is the Christian faith a matter of statistics or of personal relationship to God and one's fellows?

SUMMARY

The poor interviews are characterized in the main by slight effort to get at the real problems. Many times the counselor takes for

¹Paul E. Johnson, Psychology of Pastoral Care, (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1953), p. 24.

granted that the verbalized problem is the true one. There is evidence, too, that the counselor is trying to treat a symptom rather than the fundamental illness. The etiology is poor. These interviews are further characterized by a lack of genuine love or concern for people; or just the opposite, a very subjective approach which has a "smothering" effect. Indications of preaching or moralizing are to be found in a number of the client-counselor relationships. Perhaps one of the most serious and most prevalent violations of the established criteria is the tendency for the counselor to generalize the client's greatest need. To use a physical analogy it is similar to a physician's telling his sick patient that his greatest need is to get well without properly diagnosing the case and prescribing a course of therapy.

ANALYSIS OF QUESTIONABLE INTERVIEWS FROM ANDOVER NEWTON THEOLOGICAL SCHOOL

In this category there are twelve counselors who were considered to have employed questionable techniques, i.e., a combination of good and poor techniques. Some of the counselors combined evidences of good and poor counseling in the same interview while others carried on one interview in which they observed good counseling practices but in another violated many of the accepted methods and principles according to our criteria. All of the counselors analyzed in this section were unanimously rated as questionable except Counselor D who was awarded a split decision. Two raters judged him as questionable, one rated him good, and the other as poor.

Counselor A - Case 1

Situation.--Mr. S is married and is thirty-five years old. He is a member of the church of which the counselor is the pastor. His

daughter has just come down with polio and he is worried. He thought his minister might do something so he has come for the first interview. The counselor writes that he does not think the client's concern is basically that of his daughter's physical condition but "he has a feeling, I believe, that God is punishing him through his daughter because he has been so lax in attending church. He seems to feel that I might have some greater control of God's will than he has so he wants me to make God forgive his sins and cure his daughter." The client did most of the talking. Amiable feelings were held by the counselor and client toward each other. The Bible was not read but prayer was offered before the interview was finished. The most pressing need of the client was described as "the gaining of a more mature, Christian view of God and of the age old problem of how to deal with or accept evil in a God-created universe."

Analysis.---Counselor A has dealt rather well with this client in the beginning of this interview. He has attempted to identify the real problem. The client undoubtedly made certain comments that led the counselor to believe that he was dealing with a guilt problem prompted by an inadequate view of God. However, there are weaknesses in this interview. There is no record of the counselor's trying to help the client after he has identified the real problem. Most certainly here, with a man whose attitude toward religion is favorable, was an opportunity to use more of the resources of the Christian faith than prayer. Why not use well-chosen passages from the Bible and make use of Christian doctrine, not by preaching but subtly? Twenty minutes, unless the client voluntarily brought the interview to a close, seems like too brief a time for a problem of this magnitude.

Counselor A - Case 2

Situation.--Mrs. G is a twenty-eight-year-old woman who has a marital problem. Her husband "has a girl friend. He wishes to continue the home relationship as well as the extracurricular activities. Mrs. G doesn't like it, but doesn't know what to do. He refuses to discuss the matter with anyone." The counselor states that he listened and prayed with the client. There is nothing else in the report which would tell of any other participation on his part. The client's greatest need is "a good lawyer." The counselor wrote, "I felt sympathetic but inadequate to do much more than listen since I couldn't hear her husband's story." A referral was made to a lawyer. The interview lasted twenty minutes.

Analysis.--After twenty minutes of the first interview the counselor concludes that the whole problem will be solved best by referring the client to a good lawyer. There is no effort made to find out why it is that the husband feels the need for a girl friend and "extracurricular" activities and still wishes to continue his home relationships. The criterion suggesting the wisdom of clarifying the problem has not been brought into play. With the other client, Mrs. S, Counselor A does a good job of analyzing the real problem but here he acts as though there is nothing to do but get a divorce. The real problem is not identified nor is there any indication on the counselor's part to try to have some further interviews to see what the possibilities are of investigating the reason for this marital discord.

Counselor A - Case 3

Situation.--Miss E is thirty-three years old and is single. This is her fourth interview with the counselor who is her pastor. "She is nervous, feels frustrated because of partial deafness, has dizzy

spells, headaches, depressed feeling, doesn't know what to do to help herself, very indecisive." She lives with her father and mother each of whom is not well and very eccentric. She has become increasingly frustrated over her inability to attract a husband and to regain her teaching position which she lost because of deafness. The counselor believes "she is definitely psychotic--imagines things, aimless in her conversation, never finishes a sentence." The counselor listened to her and later had a confidential visit with a friend who is Miss E's physician. The physician is considering suggesting she be institutionalized for treatment. After this conference with the client's doctor the counselor suggested Miss E visit her physician.

Analysis.--This is good counseling. Obviously the client needs psychiatric treatment so the counselor conferred with her family physician who would be the likely one to make a referral to an institution where she could get the kind of therapy she needs.

Counselor B - Case 1

Situation.--Jane is a twelve-year-old girl who has been known by the counselor for three months. While in the counselor's office about another matter she mentioned "her problems with sex and her inability to get the help she needs at home." The counselor writes, "Besides the stated problem there appears to be further difficulty with early sex development and with repressive parents who are unwilling to discuss sex matters at the present time." No direct advice was given but the counselor promised to suggest indirectly to the parents that they purchase one of the books on the subject of sex written for teen-agers. Neither prayer nor the Bible was used during the interview. The client's greatest need is an understanding of her problems. She needs to grow

emotionally and mentally on a par with her physical growth, according to the counselor's viewpoint. It was "suggested that the doctor could help her with part of the problem."

Analysis.--This interview combines good and poor counseling techniques. It is commendable that the counselor would create so permissive an atmosphere that a twelve-year-old girl would feel free to speak to her minister about sex matters. It is proper, too, for him to try to approach the problem through the girl's parents. However, there are weaknesses as well as strengths in this interview. Instead of indirectly suggesting a book to the parents why did he not talk to them very openly about sex and the necessity of education in this regard for their daughter. The counselor could have used this incident as a springboard for teaching the parents something about the attitudes and interests of children passing into adolescence. To state that Jane needs to grow emotionally and mentally on a par with her physical growth is to reveal an ignorance of adolescent growth and development. If she is a normal girl, and it can be assumed from what the counselor states that she is, there would be fewer problems for her, as well as for most other adolescents if she could match her emotional and mental growth with her physical development, as the counselor has suggested.

Counselor B - Case 2

Situation.--Mrs. R is about forty-five years old. She has come to see her pastor about her son, age sixteen, who has quit school in the eighth grade. Her second husband (her first husband died) is strongly antagonistic toward his step-son. "Mrs. R fears for her boy's immediate welfare, as well as for his future without an education." The counselor reports that "there apparently is also an underlying disharmony between

Mrs. R and her husband, but this did not emerge except indirectly in the matter of relationship between the boy and his step-father." A promise was made by the pastor to call upon the boy's present, temporary employer to see whether the boy's work would continue through the winter. Mrs. R's greatest need is "to see an acceptable (to her and to him) future for the boy."

Analysis.--It appears as though the counselor has taken the attitude that nothing can be done about the problem. There is no attempt to clarify the issue between the step-father and the boy or between the mother and step-father. Nor does the counselor register any interest in seeing the boy. Another interview followed not many days later. It is discussed below.

Counselor B - Case 2 (second interview)

Situation.--Mrs. R's son lost his job and did not return to school. She is concerned that he is never home. She is wondering about sending him to a trade school next year. The counselor does not indicate what he did or thought. He simply describes the client's greatest need to be "strength to take the heartbreak that appears to be ahead."

Analysis.--The attitude of the counselor still seems to be that of a defeatist. What about the boy? Is the counselor going to talk to him about his interests? An interview with the boy may reveal his attitude toward a trade school. It should not be too difficult to understand why a sixteen-year-old boy would not want to remain in the eighth grade.

Counselor C - Case 1

Situation.--Mr. and Mrs. H are about forty-five years old. They are members of the counselor's church. Their son interrupted a church

meeting to ask the counselor to see his mother who had just discovered that her husband was in New York for the week-end with a woman he had been seeing openly for months. When the pastor arrived Mrs. H was being comforted by her father-in-law, son, and daughter-in-law so the counselor did not stay long--about ten minutes. He offered a prayer and promised that he would sit with her later in the evening and wait for her husband's return. After another appointment the counselor returned about 10:30 p.m. and sat with Mrs. H and her son and daughter-in-law and awaited the return of Mr. H. At 1 a.m. the son and his wife went home. "At 1:30 the husband arrived baffled by my presence. I explained that we had proof of what he had been doing (he previously admitted he had sexual relations with this woman) and informed him that his wife had decided a legal separation was necessary." The counselor explains that he further "urged Mr. H to choose between a legal separation and a severe attempt on his part to abandon this woman and rebuild his marriage. His complete abandonment of any moral code and brazen activity in the community cause us to feel that he may be disintegrating mentally." The counselor adds, "Mrs. H appeared grateful and surprisingly enough did not seem to resent my very frank appraisal of her husband's activities." Both Mr. and Mrs. H agreed to see the counselor in about a week to discuss further the possibility of a legal separation. "I have tried several times to get this couple to a professional counseling agency in the hope that a psychiatrist might be called in but he (Mr. H) refuses to talk to anybody but me." At 4:45 a.m. the counselor left the home.

Analysis.--It appears as though the counselor thoroughly enjoyed this whole episode. He probably would not have missed it for anything. The most exciting part of the whole drama undoubtedly came when Mr. H sneaked in, unsuspectingly, at 1:30 in the morning. After this

nocturnal escapade he must have been quite surprised to find his minister waiting for him in his own home. It must be admitted that there are certain moral standards which a minister should recognize. There are codes of ethics which cannot be violated with the minister's sanction. However, there are more understanding and genuinely sympathetic ways of handling a situation than the counselor demonstrated. Why should he wait for the husband to come home when the son and daughter-in-law do not even await the arrival of the father? The dogmatic way the counselor "urged him to choose between a legal separation and a sincere attempt to rebuild his marriage" is not in keeping with good counseling. Under the circumstances during which this ultimatum was issued it is to be wondered how valid any decision could be. The counselor showed some common sense when he made a referral.

Counselor C - Case 2

Situation.--Mrs. M is thirty-three years of age, married. This is about the twenty-fifth interview. The client has fainting spells. Church music makes her dizzy. Going to sleep scares her. She is afraid she will kill herself. Being alone in the house frightens her. She is ashamed of her treatment of her children and her husband. "Client has terrible resentment toward her status in life--has artistic talent but she is an unattractive woman. She has used imaginary sickness to get revenge on her family and sympathy from others. She is thoroughly confused about her conflicting emotions. The counselor pointed out to her, as he has done many times before, some of the factors in this situation that the client cannot see for herself. He made her promise not to resort to bed no matter how sick she felt. She was urged to go out and take some of her art work (ceramics) to some of the members of the church who are

shut-ins." My wife and I had rushed to the home of the client after she had telephoned--crying into the phone that something terrible was about to happen, after which she threw the telephone to the floor. I discussed with her what she should do in crises of this type. No referral had been made.

Analysis.--Only one or two comments need to be made about this interview. This client is definitely in need of psychiatric treatment and here is a counselor carrying a client for twenty-five interviews without a referral to a professional person much better prepared to handle the case. The counselor is trying to give advice to a client who is not stable enough to take it. This case is beyond the average minister even though he may have had extensive pastoral counseling.

Counselor C - Case 3

Situation.--The client is a thirty-eight year old woman who has come for her tenth interview. The counselor says, "She first came to me fearful of what she might do to herself or her family. She had been depressed for months but has come out of her depression...gradually revealed a very difficult family situation...abusive husband who is a tyrant with the family. The oldest boy is in the hands of a psychiatrist. Since the husband won't cooperate his wife is contemplating leaving him." The counselor claims the real problem to be "the disintegration of her family, her husband's drinking, children getting into trouble with juvenile authorities, boy running away to Florida for a week and showing other signs of abnormal behavior. The doctors say the boy has suffered a brain injury." The economic difficulties involved in a hasty separation were pointed out by the counselor. He also urged her to offer her husband the choice

of going to a marriage counselor or accepting the possiblility of losing the family.

Analysis.---The situation described above deals with the general problem as seen by the counselor over the period of ten interviews. The counselor has a notation on the back of his report revealing the fact that as a result of the counseling interviews the client has lost her fears which so completely dominated her when she first came to him. In spite of some of the inferior counseling methods there must have been some good done by this counselor if the client has lost her fears. He is also demonstrating good counseling procedure by referring the client to a professional family counselor.

Counselor D - Case 1

Situation.---Mrs. Mc is a married woman forty-eight years old. A difficult home situation brought her to the counselor. She is not a member of his church but he has known her approximately one year. Her husband drinks. The two of them have few interests in common. They seldom go anywhere together. She reports that she is generally miserable and adds, "I believe that I am on the verge of a nervous breakdown." The counselor listened most of the time but spent the latter part of the hour talking about possible interests which would create a common ground for the family. The counselor did not pray with the client nor did he refer to the Bible. Her greatest need was expressed by the counselor as "the ability to accept her situation and to establish a broader perspective of life." At the present time the client is under the care of a physician. Her attitude toward religion is favorable.

Analysis.---The counselor did well to listen in a situation like this rather than spend most of his time talking. There is an assumption

that the counselor has made that can be questioned. He seems to believe that the way to solve a problem between a husband and wife who have few interests in common is to investigate the possibilities of finding new interests. Undoubtedly the poor relationship between the two is much deeper and more severe than can be corrected by offering a few new interests for them to try. In view of the client's favorable attitude toward religion it would have been helpful to her to have prayed a warm and sensible prayer to God for support and assurance. Another criticism of this interview is the casual manner in which the counselor states that the client needs the ability to accept her situation and establish a broader perspective of life. What would the counselor have said if the client asked how this could be accomplished?

Counselor D - Case 2

Situation.--Miss C is twenty-one years old and is contemplating marriage in three weeks. She has been known by the counselor, who is her minister, for three years. She came to see her pastor because she feels a certain uneasiness as she approaches the time of her wedding. She wonders if she really loves the man. Should she wait or break the engagement altogether? The counselor reports, "She stated the problem as it manifested itself, but I feel that the essence of the trouble is a superior feeling on the part of the young lady. Her description of the boy is that of a stable, good person, but not too exciting." A greater understanding of the real values in life constitute the fundamental need of Miss C.

Analysis.--There would be a strong temptation on the part of a counselor in a case like this to suggest directly that the client postpone the wedding until there is more certainty about it. He apparently

allowed the girl to make the decision herself. Should the counselor have picked up the comment that the young man she was going to marry was a "stable, good person, but not too exciting"? Helping the girl clarify her concept of love and marriage, which probably was highly romantic, may have been an acceptable approach. Some of the excellent books on preparation for marriage could have been recommended.

Counselor D - Case 3

Situation.--Mrs. A is a young woman twenty-one years of age who is not a member of the counselor's congregation. The counselor did not know her until she arrived for this first interview. According to her story her husband was jealous because of an interest which she had demonstrated toward another man. "He was making life miserable with continuous acts of suspicion," writes the counselor as he describes what Mrs. A told him. In the opinion of the counselor the underlying factor was a feeling of inferiority caused by the early divorce of Mrs. A's parents and also the fact that Mrs. A was pregnant before she was married. The counselor informs that he listened and also gave some good advice. Forty-five minutes was the length of the interview during which the amount of talking was shared equally between client and counselor. "She needs a deeper concept of herself as a person," writes the counselor about Mrs. A.

Analysis.--Our criterion suggesting the wisdom of identifying the real problem has been observed by the counselor but the fact that he uncovered the genuine cause of disturbance so quickly, in one forty-five minute interview in which he talked as much as the client, is rather astounding. It may well be that the client's problem is definitely related to her broken family and her premarital pregnancy but this idea

ought to be kept in the back of the counselor's head for possible reference instead of being announced so assuredly as the real problem. It must be a source of satisfaction for a counselor to know that the advice he gave was "good" advice. Should he have given any advice at all? Whether or not the basic need of Mrs. A is a deeper concept of herself as a person is difficult to say on the basis of the limited knowledge the counselor would be able to gather in one interview.

Counselor E - Case 1

Situation.--A twenty-four-year-old woman, upon the referral of her doctor, went to see her minister in view of her desire to get a divorce. This is the second interview with her minister. Her real problem was need of security which her husband was not providing. After six months of marriage she discovered she did not love him. She had no basic set of values with which to judge life. She wanted a husband to provide her with an inner security which can only be provided by God. If she did not receive sex satisfaction she was unhappy so as a result she was contemplating ending her second marriage and confessed several acts of fornication and almost a year of adultery. The counselor says that she is now burdened with guilt which he feels inadequate to release. The counselor led her to see that divorce is no solution until the reasons for her feelings are solved. He suggested a three-month separation until he and the client are able to work out a new foundation for the relationship. Prayer was offered. The client's greatest need is "inner security possessed only by those with a firm working relationship with God." A referral was made to a psychiatrist.

Analysis.--There are good and poor elements combined in this counseling pattern. The counselor tried to get at the root of the

problem and permitted the client to express herself. There undoubtedly was a permissive atmosphere created for the woman to speak as freely as she did. No moralizing or preaching is suggested by anything in the report. It was wise of the counselor to try to get at the reasons for her feelings about her husband. On the other hand some evidences of inferior counseling are observed. How did he attempt to release the guilt feelings that the client had? Certainly a minister with the resources at his disposal ought to have a relative degree of success in this regard unless there are other factors, deep-seated, which make it difficult for the client to believe in and accept God's love and forgiveness. It would be interesting to know on what basis the three-month separation was suggested. Ordinarily this may be the kind of a decision best made by the client, not the counselor. The counselor settles the problem very simply by remarking, "The client needs inner security possessed only by those with a firm working relationship with God." The client is not told how to realize this "inner security."

Counselor B - Case 2

Situation.--The client is a twenty-four-year-old man whose wife is seeking a divorce which he is trying to prevent. There is a reason why his wife wants the divorce but the client is sure the reason does not have anything to do with himself. The counselor writes, "In the opening session I did not have much assistance from him but I was armed with his wife's feelings. He admitted he leaned too heavily on his wife for decisions. He had no central purpose around which to build his life or give direction to his marriage. He admitted this but was not prepared to accept it." The counselor does not indicate that he did anything except listen, pray, and "asked him to return hoping we could lead him

to an acceptance of the reality of his situation." The counselor gives as the client's fundamental need the statement that "the world revolves around his wishes and this must be replaced with God as focus." The interview lasted for thirty minutes.

Analysis.--The counselor does not indicate it but the client may well be the husband of the young woman mentioned in Case 1. Since fictitious names are used it is not possible to identify the two as husband and wife. They have both been known by the counselor for one month. If they are husband and wife would it not have been well to attempt some counseling sessions with the two of them present at the same time? Maybe the counselor was going to have them together after a few sessions with each of them privately. An interesting and probably very revealing statement to investigate is the one in which the client assures the counselor that he is certain the wife's reasons for wanting a divorce are not within himself. In this interview, as with the previous one, the counselor makes another one of those easy generalizations when he indicates, "The world revolves around his wishes and this must be replaced with God as focus." There was no effort reported by the counselor to help the young man get God in focus.

ANALYSIS OF QUESTIONABLE INTERVIEWS FROM EASTERN BAPTIST THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

In this category there are eighteen counselors who are considered as employing questionable techniques, i.e., a combination of good and poor techniques. Some of the counselors combined evidences of good and poor counseling in the same interview while others conducted one interview observing good counseling practices but in another interview violated many of the accepted methods and principles according to our criteria. Each

of these counselors, whose interviews are to be analyzed, was rated unanimously by the raters as questionable with the exception of Counselors D and B who were judged by three of the four raters as questionable.

Counselor A - Case 1

Situation.--The client, Miss B, is twenty-one years old. She is single and is not a member of the counselor's church. The counselor's acquaintance with the young lady is a little less than two years. This is the second interview. Her problems are described as a mixture. "Loss of mother by death. While the mother was still living the father lived in a distant city with another woman. Miss B has an offer of marriage from a service man stationed in Germany. There are tensions where Miss B works. An added problem is that of an inheritance." The counselor feels that the problems as stated are the ones actually disturbing Miss B but she has failed to sense the danger of "bottled up" emotions and fears that mount from constant indecision. The counselor writes, "I suggested that we pray first, even before beginning any discussion of the problem, then list the simplest problems first and work up to the more complex." The client spoke more than the counselor. There were prayer and Bible reading. The client's greatest need is to realize God's concern in each life and in each situation. The interview lasted nearly two hours.

Analysis.--The use of prayer before any discussion of the problem is begun may be questioned as a proper technique. Would it not be better to pray after the problem has been discussed in order that the prayer may be more specific and meaningful? There is no indication that the counselor made any attempt at all to clarify the problems for the young lady. It is doubtful that there is any good purpose to be achieved in the listing of problems according to their increased complexity. In this interview

we see once again an irrelevant generalization of the basic need of the client. It is perfectly possible for the young woman to realize quite fully God's concern in her life and still be perplexed concerning the problem she brought to the counselor.

Counselor A - Case 2

Situation.--Mr. J is thirty-four years old. This is his first interview with the counselor who is a Baptist minister. The client is disturbed about an anticipated change to become a Presbyterian. At the present time he is a Baptist but his wife is a Presbyterian. He thinks it would be well for them both to belong to the same church but he feels he would be "giving up his faith" if he became a Presbyterian. The counselor suggested the client avail himself of the opportunity of meeting Presbyterian young married couples and to look for an opportunity to serve in the Presbyterian Church. The client spoke more than the counselor. There was an amiable relationship between the two. During the hour-and-fifteen-minute interview prayer was given and various passages from the Bible were quoted. The counselor indicates the greatest need of Mr. J to be a realization that "denominations are instruments in God's hands to further the work of the church, and individual Christians are specific tools in God's work." Before Mr. J left the counselor suggested that he talk to the local Presbyterian minister.

Analysis.--This counseling situation is handled much more acceptably than the previous one. The counselor was very objective about the problem. Many ministers are so very jealous for their own local church and the particular denomination they serve that they would be tempted to help the client realize that maybe he was giving up his faith if he decided to become a member of another church. This interview is completely

free of any such notion. The counselor apparently is more concerned about the happiness of Mr. and Mrs. J than he is increasing his own church membership. The suggestion that the client become better acquainted with young married couples in the Presbyterian Church is a good one. The referral to the local Presbyterian minister is also commendable.

Counselor B - Case 1

Situation.--This is the only interview submitted by this counselor. His client is forty-five years old, married, and a member of the counselor's church. The client and counselor have known each other four years. This is the fourth interview. The client, Mr. B, is portrayed as a confused person. He felt that he had committed the unpardonable sin. He was convinced in his own mind that he was a lost man and that God had forsaken him. Even his own family was against him, he thought. The counselor writes, "When he first approached me he desired simply to have me pray with him. He stated that he wasn't right with the Lord. He would never relate to me what it was that was bothering him. I sensed immediately that it was a mental disorder." Concerning what he did in the way of helping Mr. B the counselor suggested to Mrs. B that she take him somewhere for medical treatment. "He was beyond anything I personally could do for him. He just couldn't reason anything out. He definitely needed outside help--medical help," writes the counselor. Prayer was offered and the Bible was read. The client's greatest need was described by the counselor as being a religious one. "The client was confused in his faith. He began to wander from denomination to denomination and felt finally that the Pentecostal group had all that he needed. His greatest need was to become stable in his faith." In a note on the back of the Interview Report the counselor informs, "after twelve shock

treatments in a local private hospital, I find Mr. B quite a normal person. He reasons well and is now very faithful to his own church."

Analysis.--In general, this interview was handled well because the counselor recognized his own inability to deal with the client's problem. A referral was made and after proper psychiatric treatment Mr. B responded well. A good counselor recognizes his own limitations and makes a wise referral. This the counselor did. His diagnosis that Mr. B's problem was one needing psychiatric treatment was correct as substantiated by the results of shock treatment. However, there is one major point at which this interview was weak and therefore caused it to be classified as belonging to the questionable category. In view of the fact that Mr. B was definitely a mental case why did the counselor state that his greatest need was a stable faith? The client may have had a religious need but his most fundamental problem was mental. This is a good interview except for the one aspect relating to the client's greatest need.

Counselor C - Case 1

Situation.--The client is a man forty-five years old. He is a Roman Catholic whose attitude toward the Protestant faith is one of opposition. The client and counselor have known each other for one month. This is the second interview revolving about marital discord. The client's problem related to his wife who always is nagging. She is a very poor housekeeper. The five children in the family are always poorly dressed. There is general hostility toward his wife and her way of life. The counselor believes the real problem is the client himself. "He is very egotistic, self-centered. Doesn't see that his own actions, reactions, and personality are the cause of his wife's feelings and

attitudes." The client was encouraged to talk as much as possible. Both prayer and the Bible were utilized during the interview which lasted an hour. The counselor was uncertain of the client's attitude toward him. The client's most pressing need is to be born again, to be converted, the counselor asserted.

Analysis.---This interview is a mixture of intelligent and not too intelligent counseling. It appears to be an unwise practice for a Protestant minister to pray and read the Bible (unless it were a version acceptable to Roman Catholics) in the presence of a man whose feelings one is not certain about and whose attitude toward the Protestant faith is unfriendly. The counselor may be right but how does he know so assuredly that the client needs a conversion experience? But let us suppose that this counselor does need a genuine conversion experience and it is effected. Does this solve the problem of an unkempt house and poorly dressed children? It may, but it must be admitted that there is no guarantee that this "born again" experience will solve all of his difficulties. The counselor shows some insight into the client's real problem by describing his self-centeredness and seeing the relationship between the husband's personality difficulties and the wife's uncooperative behavior.

Counselor D - Case 1

Situation.---Miss R is a fifteen-year-old girl who is a member of the Roman Catholic Church. This is her first interview with the counselor, who is a Baptist minister. She had become involved with a young man and was expecting a baby. Her aunt contacted the counselor about his willingness to perform the wedding ceremony under the circumstance of pregnancy. When Miss R came for the interview she simply stated that

she wanted to get married but did not confess that she was pregnant. The counselor, upon learning about the necessity of the wedding because of pregnancy, invited both the young man and Miss R to come for the interview. Only Miss R appeared for the interview so the counselor reports, "All I could do was give what little direction I could in one interview on building a happy marriage." The counselor did most of the talking. His feelings toward Miss R were uncertain. Prayer was offered but the Bible was not read. The counselor described the client's feeling toward him as hostile. The most drastic need of Miss R was stated as that of getting married and building a successful married life. The interview took twenty minutes.

Analysis.---The counselor is to be commended for not preaching to the client and spending a great deal of time telling her that she should not have done what was already accomplished. He surely did the right thing in agreeing to marry the young couple even though the young lady is a member of the Roman Catholic Church. The brevity of the interview is to be questioned. For an important conference such as this one how could anything be done in twenty minutes? What was wrong with the relationship between counselor and client? The counselor was uncertain about his feelings toward Miss R. Was he inwardly disturbed because the girl had illicitly engaged in intercourse? Did this attitude reveal itself and produce hostility in Miss R? Why did he not plan to have more than one interview? With the proper kind of attitude the counselor probably could have had a series of premarital interviews which would have included the young man who was also involved.

Counselor D - Case 2

Situation.---An eighty-five year old widow called for her pastor,

whom she has known for four years, in order that he might advise her concerning her son's marital difficulty. The son is in Korea in the service and had written to his mother about the fact that he was contemplating getting a divorce. The counselor, however, did not feel that this was the real purpose in calling him to her home. The pastor says, "She was anxious for her son to get a divorce. She did not want advice but confirmation. The divorce was desired by her because of her inability to get along with her daughter-in-law." The incompatibility of the mother and daughter-in-law was due to an exceedingly close attachment which the mother had for her son. The client's husband died when her son was only seven years old. For forty-three years (the son is now fifty years old) the mother cultivated and nourished her son's dependence upon her and her dependence upon her son. Her real problem is that of reconciling her own conscience and her true feelings about the desire to see her son's marriage dissolved. Her greatest need according to the counselor is to find a life of her own but at her age and after so many years with just her son and herself this is an almost impossible situation. The interview lasted about an hour. A referral was made to a lawyer and physician.

Analysis.--Here is another interview which combines excellent counseling with poor counseling. The strength of this interview lies in the counselor's analysis of the real problem. He not only identified the real problem but he also clarified it. He is realistic enough to see that a very encouraging prognosis is not likely in view of the client's age. Since the divorce is of prime importance to the wife it might have been well to try to involve her in some way. Was she aware of the fact that a divorce was in the offing? One might question the

referral, after one interview, to a lawyer and a physician. What did the physician have to do with the problem? In view of the fact that the son is fifty years old a better approach to the mother would be that of helping her to see that the problem is not hers but her son's and his wife's, and they are old enough to solve it themselves.

Counselor D - Case 3

Situation.--A fifteen-year-old girl, a member of the counselor's church, had been brought by her parents for the interview. "She had become involved with a fifty-eight-year-old man. She went to his house on the way home from school and he gave her fifty cents each time to allow him freedom to handle her." The factor that was most disturbing to the parents and the girl was the court action and the publicity of the whole affair. The real problem "was conflict with an ailing father who had little love and demanded explicit obedience. It was the conflict that drove her to seek the companionship of an older more fatherly man, though certainly a less discreet one." After consultation with the judge who sentenced both the fifty-eight-year-old man and the client, she was put on probation. The counselor advised her to see a psychiatrist or a social worker. During the interview the counselor did most of the talking. He prayed with the girl and her parents. Love and affection from the home and parental understanding of her growing needs are the client's basic need, the counselor reported.

Analysis.--The counselor wisely remarks that the home situation, particularly the relationship between father and daughter, is largely responsible for the unusual behavior of the client. There is no evidence that the counselor has displayed a feeling of righteous indignation about the entire affair. He has not moralized but has seen the problem

referral, after one interview, to a lawyer and a physician. What did the physician have to do with the problem? In view of the fact that the son is fifty years old a better approach to the mother would be that of helping her to see that the problem is not hers but her son's and his wife's, and they are old enough to solve it themselves.

Counselor D - Case 3

Situation.--A fifteen-year-old girl, a member of the counselor's church, had been brought by her parents for the interview. "She had become involved with a fifty-eight-year-old man. She went to his house on the way home from school and he gave her fifty cents each time to allow him freedom to handle her." The factor that was most disturbing to the parents and the girl was the court action and the publicity of the whole affair. The real problem "was conflict with an ailing father who had little love and demanded explicit obedience. It was the conflict that drove her to seek the companionship of an older more fatherly man, though certainly a less discreet one." After consultation with the judge who sentenced both the fifty-eight-year-old man and the client, she was put on probation. The counselor advised her to see a psychiatrist or a social worker. During the interview the counselor did most of the talking. He prayed with the girl and her parents. Love and affection from the home and parental understanding of her growing needs are the client's basic need, the counselor reported.

Analysis.--The counselor wisely remarks that the home situation, particularly the relationship between father and daughter, is largely responsible for the unusual behavior of the client. There is no evidence that the counselor has displayed a feeling of righteous indignation about the entire affair. He has not moralized but has seen the problem

as stemming from an unfortunate home situation. He may have done well to let the girl and her parents do most of the talking instead of usurping the occasion to do so himself. He may have learned something that would be of great value as he seeks to help the girl. Rather than merely suggest that the girl see a psychiatrist or social worker it would have been better to get the client's consent and the approval of her parents and take her to the psychiatrist after an appointment had been made.

Counselor E - Case 1

Situation.--Mr. S is fifty years old. He is a member of the counselor's church but the pastor and client do not know each other very well in view of the fact that the pastor has just recently become the minister of the church. The client is a fine Christian man. His wife has been passing through the menopause for the past few years and has been affected mentally. She has not needed institutional care but has become an extremist in some of her religious views. As a result of these views she will not come to her husband's church because she feels it is too modernistic and hence of the devil. The counselor suggested that, in view of his being a new minister at the church, he try to get his wife to come for a few Sundays to see what the new minister is like. The counselor adds, "I also promised to call in the home to try to convince her of the need of a united home in the church." The counselor prayed with the client. The greatest need on the part of the client is "sympathy plus an attempt to make Christian fellowship possible in his home by reuniting the family in one church, or at least removing her hostility toward his church." The interview extended for forty-five minutes.

Analysis.--It appears as though this is a rather superficial approach to the whole problem. The counselor ought to try to find out why the wife feels as she does about the modernistic views of her husband's church. No doubt the best method of helping the client's wife is that of visiting with her in the home and leading her unobtrusively to the place where she develops some confidence in the new pastor at her husband's church. Another approach to the problem may be for the husband to go to his wife's church. This concession may make her more amenable to the suggestion, later on, that they worship for a few weeks in her husband's church. The fact that these bizarre religious views are, in a large degree, due to certain biological factors must be kept in mind. This is not primarily a theological issue.

Counselor E - Case 2

Situation.--The client is a young man twenty-four years old, and a member of the counselor's church. Due to the recent arrival of the minister to this parish he is not acquainted with the client. This is the first interview. The client has felt called to the ministry but refused to accept the challenge of the Christian ministry because it would mean giving up his present job which affords him an attractive income. "He is unable to break some habits he feels are unchristian--smoking, etc." After gaining from the client a decision that he wanted to begin training the counselor advised that he write to a nearby university for admission requirements. The counselor also talked about the power of Christ to overcome sin and indicated that the client's experience would benefit him later on when he became a minister. The counselor spoke more than the client. Prayer and quotations from the Bible were used during the interview. The fundamental need of the young

man is "sympathetic support, which he does not get at home, and assurance that it is not too late to answer God's call." The interview lasted for thirty minutes. The client was referred to the registrar at a university.

Analysis.--In view of the problem the help proffered by the counselor does not appear to be very significant. Here is a young man who claims to be struggling with a very important vocational choice. His conflict centers in two areas, (1) his reluctance to give up a lucrative job and (2) disturbance over certain personal habits which the client feels are incompatible with the role of a minister. This kind of a conflict demands that the client express his feelings and attitudes very openly. The counselor could learn a great deal if he were to listen. He reports, however, that he spoke more than the young man. It seems as though the counselor ignores the significance of the problem and accepts as genuine the decision of the young man to begin training for the ministry. This young man has some problems to solve before making so important a decision that will take more than an interview of thirty minutes duration to clarify. Time could well be spent in discussing what constitutes a call to Christian service, or how one can know if God is sanctioning his desire to study for the ministry. Is smoking a sin or has the young man been so conditioned that he thinks it is a sin? The entire interview failed to get at the basic problems even though the counselor may have concluded that the interview was a success because the young man decided to begin his training.

Counselor E - Case 3

Situation.--Mr. W is sixty years old. He is a member of the counselor's church and has come to his pastor wanting to get better acquainted. Mr. W was on the committee responsible for suggesting the

name of a new pastor to the church. He told his pastor that he dropped around to assure him of his loyal support. However, the pastor feels that the real purpose of the visit was to inform the minister that under the former pastor Mr. W started a youth choir which was taken from him during the interim when the church was without a pastor. He resented this and wanted it returned to him. The counselor writes, "Since I am new at the church and do not know all the problems I sympathized with him but told him that, until I was better acquainted, the music committee would have to supervise all matters dealing with the music of the church." The minister prayed with the client. "He seems to be a lonely man who needs outside interests to occupy his leisure time. Also he wants to feel a special relationship to the new pastor." The interview lasted an hour-and-a-half.

Analysis.--The counselor acted judiciously when he announced that he felt he should permit the music committee to supervise all matters dealing with the music of the church. This might be a good policy for his entire stay as pastor. However, it was not too wise of the counselor to sympathize with the client for the simple reason that the counselor did not get the whole story. His well-meaning sympathy could cause the client to feel that the minister was on his side and against the person or persons responsible for his not continuing to lead the youth choir. The counselor did well to recognize the fact that the client is a lonely man. Perhaps a friendly attitude toward the client from his minister will heal the wound made by the sharp-edged music controversy.

Counselor F - Case 1

Situation.--Mrs. H's age is not recorded by the counselor. She is a member of the counselor's congregation and has been acquainted with

the pastor for six years. This is the second interview in which she is seeking counsel because of her very unhappy home life. She has a great deal of trouble getting along with her husband. This incompatibility has been continuing for a number of years. There are two children in the family. Mrs. H feels that much of the difficulty centers about her mother-in-law and the fact that her husband works seven days a week at his business. The counselor wants to have a counseling situation involving both husband and wife but he is not very successful in his desire to reach the husband. During the interview prayer was offered before the hour came to a close. The client's greatest need is reported to be "personal spiritual stability." A referral was made to a social worker.

Analysis.--This counselor does not reveal any details concerning the problem other than the mention of the mother-in-law and the husband's work schedule. By this second interview there should have been some other revealing information given. The very fact that the counselor is having so much trouble trying to see the husband may indicate something of the husband's attitude toward the counselor. Perhaps the pastor ought to have a few more interviews with Mrs. H and forget the husband for a while. If the husband is somewhat hostile in his feelings toward the pastor and resists an interview this may be the best procedure. As Robert O. Blood suggests:

Counselors generally agree that little can be done for the client who comes under pressure. A person must want counseling to be able to benefit from it. Therefore, the interested partner can only wait patiently for the spouse to get interested too. Sometimes the stay-at-home's curiosity gets the better of him. Sometimes he is so impressed with changes in his partner's behavior that he decides counseling is worth looking into. But pressuring a reluctant individual is likely to stiffen his resistance and increase domestic tension.¹

¹Robert O. Blood, Anticipating Your Marriage, (Glencoe, Illinois: The Free Press, 1955), p. 270.

It would be worth a try for the counselor to work with Mrs. H for a number of weeks in an effort to help her understand her own contribution to the marital problem and also to endeavor to gain some insight into the personality of the husband who is not too well known to the counselor. It is commendable that the counselor wants to get the husband and wife together for an interview but he may be going about it in a way that will bring further disagreement between them. His comment that the client's outstanding need is "personal spiritual stability" is rather weak and meaningless in the light of the basic issue of marital discord. The referral to a social worker is a bit puzzling.

Counselor F - Case 2

Situation.--A married woman, whose age is not revealed, came to her minister to discuss the problem of a husband who drinks excessively. This is the only description of the problem. How he behaves when he is drunk or when he is sober is not mentioned. This is the first interview. The counselor states that he felt his first task was to let the client do the talking while he listened. He wanted to discover, if possible, something of the background of the problem. Why did the husband drink? How long had excessive drinking been going on? What measures had the wife taken to correct his drinking? The counselor prayed with the client at the end of the interview. The greatest need of the client is "personal spiritual stability." After an hour-and-a-half the interview came to a close.

Analysis.--Here is a counselor who appears to be anxious to get at the crux of the problem. He treats drinking as a symptom, as an indication of some deeper problem. He wants to know what factors lead to this behavior which is causing so much unhappiness in the home. Yet,

after such a wholesome approach to the problem he states the client's greatest need as personal spiritual stability. The poor fellow seems to be in a rut. He made the same kind of diagnosis on the previous client. It may be that he thinks all problems are due to personal spiritual instability. On the one hand he shows excellent insight and then he demonstrates practically no knowledge of the fundamentals of counseling.

SUMMARY

Interviews that are classified as good or poor can be described as having a predominance of certain characteristics which make it possible to classify them as belonging to one group or the other. The inferior interviews seemed to fall into definite categories on the basis of their having violated certain of the criteria by which they were judged. The pigeon-holing of the questionable interviews is not done in so neat and orderly a fashion. These were considered as questionable because they did not adhere to the criteria in a number of patterns. Some of the counselors combined good and poor techniques in the same interview, while others who were fewer in number dealt rather effectively with one client and then disregarded the rule book almost entirely in subsequent interviews. After studying the questionable interviews the rater's reaction was the same in each case -- "I just don't know!"

ANALYSIS OF GOOD INTERVIEWS FROM ANDOVER NEWTON THEOLOGICAL SCHOOL

In this category there are thirty-five counselors whose interviews, it was judged, demonstrated good counseling methods and philosophies. Two of the following counselors, B and H, received three out of four ratings as good, but the others were rated unanimously as good.

Counselor A - Case 1

Situation.--The client, Mr. W, is fifty-four years old. He is a patient in a hospital operated by the Veterans Administration. The counselor is the chaplain at the hospital. This is the third interview with the client. The problem centers about the client's disturbance over the fact that he senses "no forgiveness for his many sins, chief of which is hate. He is troubled because he knows he cannot hate and hope to know forgiveness." The chaplain, however, believes that the patient's statement of the problem is not identical with the real one. The counselor describes the real problem as "a depressive, who refuses to accept his own mental illness, rather believing his condition is religious in nature." The counselor listened and then gave some direct advice. "I told him to forget about forgiveness altogether and learn to live first." This involves, for him, learning to express his hatred openly. This we can afford to allow in a mental hospital since we are geared to handle such episodes. This advice would never work in a regular parish. In this process he would first learn to know the measure of his own hatreds, and other potentials, then he could learn how to handle them constructively. After a period of time he would be in a position to face forgiveness with some hope of understanding what it means. At this point forgiveness is still 'pure magic' to him in the childish sense of the word. He seemed startled at this advice, but also relieved--and I sent him back to his psychotherapist toward whom he has been feeling hateful the past few days."

Analysis.--This counselor recognizes the necessity for clarifying the problem. He very intelligently differentiates between the client's verbalization and what is actually the case. The use of the directive approach with this kind of a client is perhaps the best one to try. The

client, being a mental patient, obviously needs a more structured interview which will provide him with some type of support. He is not capable of making fairly difficult decisions at this stage in his illness. The encouragement of the expression of hostility is significant. As the counselor admits, this is not the kind of therapy that can be employed in a normal situation. The counselor is to be further complimented for endeavoring to make forgiveness meaningful and not mere magic. It is important to notice, too, that the counselor does not preach nor condemn but simply sees the problem as having a relationship to the Christian faith but being fundamentally the distortions of a sick mind.

Counselor A - Case 2

Situation.--The client is also a patient in a Veterans Administration hospital. He is thirty-six years of age and a 100 per cent disability war casualty. He came to the hospital chaplain saying, "They say I'm crazy because I call myself the son of God." The client listened and asked questions. He also checked on the patient's history. The case records received with the transfer of the patient from another hospital indicated some psychotic behavior such as calling himself the "son of God." The counselor writes, "His plea to me is, 'I'm not crazy just because I call myself the son of God.' His reasons are as follows: He is colored but his skin is very light. He is the illegitimate son of a very black mother, hence, why is he so light? Did he have a white father? Perhaps, but in any case he did not know for a certainty just what to think. He never saw his father nor knew his name. He uses his mother's family name. In view of this background he one day asked a Catholic Sister in another hospital what he should do and think since he really did not know his own name--or who he was. The Sister consoled him by

saying, in effect, 'you are a son of God, as we all are.' So to settle his perplexing problem he has called himself a 'son of God' because that is the most honest and satisfying answer he knows." The counselor claims this to be an intriguing case in that it points up what often happens in a neuro-psychiatric hospital--that religious language, with solid cultural or situational referents, is often mistaken for psychotic language. The greatest need of the client, according to the counselor, is a simple job (because of his war injury) which will enable him to feel that his life has some purpose and usefulness.

Analysis.--This counseling interview is considered good because of the counselor's attempt to get at the heart of what bothers the client. His investigation of the reason for the client's willingness to accept the sobriquet of "son of God" was very rewarding and his statement concerning the readiness with which religious language is sometimes mistaken for psychotic language is well taken. The counselor is willing to admit that the client needs treatment but his interview dealt mainly with the conflict the client had when individuals objected to his calling himself "son of God," when he felt he had a perfect right to do so. It was more of a semantic problem than some other kind. Some ministers or chaplains may feel constrained to reprimand a client, even a psychotic, for apparently being so blasphemous but this counselor found the reason and saw nothing intended as irreverent or disrespectful on the part of the client.

Counselor B - Case 1

Situation.--The client is a girl sixteen years of age who is a member of the counselor's church. This is the fifth interview concerning the young lady's dissatisfaction with the church. She thought the church to be too formal and not "spiritual" enough. It was during this

present interview that the counselor received some intimations from the girl that what she had been speaking about in the previous interviews was not the real problem. According to the counselor the "client appears to have a crush" on another girl. "The other girl has definite lesbian characteristics and a reputation as a 'queer.'" Her particular brand of religion, viz. fundamentalism, has been accepted by the client as her own." The counselor gave no direct advice. He listened and then asked the client to return so they could talk more about the problem. During the interview the pastor made it clear that he was not in agreement with her appraisal of the church. The client spoke more than the counselor. Prayer was offered before the girl left. Since she comes from a home which was broken a year ago, the counselor feels that she needs love in which she can have confidence. The young lady returned for another interview. No referral was made.

Analysis.--Generally speaking this particular interview has merit although there seems to be no point in the counselor's expressing his own opinion that he does not agree with the client in her appraisal of the counselor's church. He is aware of the fact that this objection to the lack of spiritual warmth in the church is the result of another problem even though it is not clearly and directly related to it. The counselor sees a girl wanting affection and getting it from another girl but in a manner which, if it is not unnatural now, may become so in the future. The minister was not so indignant about the girl's accusations of the church that he could not and would not look for some reason for the outburst.

Counselor B - Case 2

Situation.--A young married couple in their late twenties came

to the counselor after having met him on another occasion. This is the first interview, however. The problem they presented was the husband's disaffection with Roman Catholicism and a general questioning attitude toward all or most of the aspects of Christianity. The husband is a Roman Catholic and his wife a Congregationalist. The counselor attempted to interpret certain Christian teachings in a manner that would not offend the husband's intellect. The Bible was referred to from time to time in an indirect manner rather than being held open and read before the couple. The interview, which lasted two hours, was concluded by the husband's making the significant move to ask for membership in the Baptist Church of which the counselor is the minister. In view of this new relationship with the Protestant faith the counselor feels that the client's greatest need is "a relationship with a Church fellowship in which his questions will be recognized as honest, and in which he can experience those conditions which make for communion with God."

Analysis.---The very fact that the counselor makes reference to the "questioning attitude" of the client and states that he "does not want to offend his intellect" and further adds that he needs a "church fellowship in which his questions will be recognized as honest" is an indication that the client must be a rather intelligent person. It would take a large quantity of tact and a fairly good measure of intelligence to be able to counsel in such a way that the interview would end with the client requesting membership in the Baptist Church. It is good that there were no comparisons between the Roman Catholic Church and the churches of Protestant persuasion. Such a presentation might have alienated the client and caused him to be hostile to the point of making it difficult for his wife and refusing ever again to have anything to do with any church. The client is described as the type of person who would not

make such a move as asking for membership in a Protestant church unless he were rather sure of his decision. It is worthwhile to note that the counselor does not interpret this joining of the church to be the end of an experience but the beginning of a new and growing relationship.

Counselor B - Case 3

Situation.--Miss S, age twenty-two, a member of the counselor's church, one day called her pastor on the telephone and requested an interview. The client is engaged to a young man whom she had planned to marry in about six months. She is now having doubts. Her fiancé seems to be indifferent or downright antagonistic toward her family. This is the way Miss S related her problem and the reason for desiring an interview with her minister. However, the minister believes the client subconsciously had decided to break the engagement before she ever came to see him and she really came for confirmation of that which she had already made up her mind to do. She wanted the minister to encourage her to break the engagement and support her in her decision on the basis that it was justifiable. The counselor writes that he listened and after a while attempted to help the client understand that she had already made up her mind but was having difficulty verbalizing and accepting her own decision. He also tried to help her see the results of her decision. The interview, marked by an amiable relationship between the client and counselor, lasted for an hour-and-a-half during which time the client did most of the talking. Neither the Bible nor prayer was used with the client. Her greatest need is "sufficient maturity to be able to accept the consequences of her own actions."

Analysis.--The redeeming feature of this interview is the counselor's ability to see the fact that the client had already made a

decision but could not very easily express or accept it. There were real reasons why she subconsciously had decided to follow a specific course of action but could not bring it to the level of consciousness. The counselor attempted to bring this conflict to the surface by allowing the client to do most of the talking and endeavoring to clarify issues for her.

Counselor C - Case 1

Situation.---The client is a married woman about forty-eight years old. She is a member of the counselor's congregation. This is the first visit. She requested a pastoral call because she is disturbed by the lack of attention from the church during a recent period of illness. She felt resentful toward the church and at the same time, guilty for not having gone to church after she became well. She called her pastor because she desired both to unload her hostility and ask "Why don't I want to go to church?" In answer to the question on the Interview Report concerning the counselor's opinion as to whether or not the apparent problem was the problem that really disturbed the client, the counselor responded with, "Yes and No." He went on to explain, "While there is a small basis for complaint about lack of attention there is a deeper aspect of the problem. The client has a domineering and rigid personality. At present she is passing through her change of life. Up to six months ago she was a 'doctor butterfly' until coming under the care of an internist who is also a deacon in our church. I believe physiological changes are exaggerating latent emotional problems." The counselor tried by using a non-directive approach to lead the client to some self-examination while also encouraging the expression of hostility. He found that after she had been able to state her complaints her attitude

began to change and she was willing to admit that perhaps she, after all, had been making a mountain out of a molehill. She needed basically to have someone with understanding to whom she could say whatever she wanted, and then her need was for personal insight into her own make-up. A verbatim account of the most important part of the interview reveals something of the counselor's technique.

Client: I'll tell you what's bothering me, I have no desire to go to church.

Counselor: Our church or do you mean any church?

Client: No, just our church. This summer in all of the heat we travelled way down to our former church and I enjoyed it.

Counselor: Why don't you want to come to our church?

Client: I'll tell you. Ever since I became ill, I have received no calls, no card, not even a call from the pastor.
(Tears) Now, I'm going to cry, I don't know why. My doctor tells me to just cry when I feel like it.

Counselor: Go ahead, cry.

Client: ...I couldn't go to Circle for several months. When I did go, not one bothered to ask how I had been.

Counselor: Had they known you were ill?

Client: Yes, definitely...When Miss X and her mother moved into their new house they gave her a currency bouquet for a plant. Now she could buy and sell us. She didn't need that. But, they didn't even give me a measly potted plant. They only think about those in their own little circle. Don't misunderstand, I have nothing against Miss X. We are friends.

Counselor: Do you think they realized your sickness was as bad as you know it to have been? I know you were in church occasionally, and you did continue to work. Perhaps they felt that if you could work, you were not too sick.

Client: My doctor gave me orders to rest in the evenings though he permitted me to continue working. I think they should have known I was ill. As I say, they have their own little group of old-timers and we are made to know that we are new.

Counselor: Do you feel resistance?

- Client: Yes. They have been running things all these years. Mrs. M, president of the Association, cannot stand a new idea that is not her own....Why, I was in church secretarial work for three years. We used to send everyone a card on their birthday.
- Counselor: Our deaconesses try to keep abreast of those who are ill, I've been to their meetings and know they remember the new folks as well as the older members. Of course, that's always a hard thing to do. At times no one tells us of their need.
- Client: Well, perhaps it's not all their fault though I believe there's cause for complaint. (Client less tense now)
- Counselor: I do hope you'll come to church since you wouldn't want to fall into self-pity which would not be well.
- Client: (The suggestion of self-pity caused client to raise eyebrows. I do not think I injected the thought in the proper way, but I was pressed for time due to a meeting and did want that brought out)....Oh, I'll probably come, though we feel kind of guilty."

Analysis.--The counselor shows knowledge of counseling techniques and personality structure. His willingness to permit the client to express her hostility is worthwhile. He is understanding, too, in his recognition of the relationship between the client's physical condition and her emotional conflict. His permissiveness, in an attempt to aid the client in self-examination, is indicative of good counseling since a more direct approach might have caused her, in view of her rigid personality, to become antagonistic toward the counselor. The last remark of the counselor relative to self-pity was perhaps rather unwise but the counselor is alert enough to sense this breach of counseling etiquette.

Counselor C - Case 2

Situation.--Mrs. B is about fifty years of age and a member of the counselor's church. This is the fourth interview with her. The client wished to explain why she had been avoiding church functions. Her reason was "because of the attitudes of others toward her and their

gossip about her." The counselor said that he and Mrs. B had talked about this problem on three other occasions. The genuine problem, however, the counselor describes as follows: "This lady, until recently, has been under the care of a psychiatrist. He has told her that the final solution to her problems lies in her hands. Actually, this is a case for a psychiatrist because of her severe persecution complex. She believes that she is a victim of the conspiracy of her Jewish, Catholic, and Christian Scientist neighbors. She has a sense of guilt which I believe is of imaginary origin. Mrs. B tends to be a religious fundamentalist." In relating what he did to help her he writes, "I let her voice her views and relate incidents about being snubbed, watched, talked about, etc., which were without any foundation. I then, very carefully, attempted to get her to see that there was no basis for her ideas about other people's treatment of her. I feel that I must not agree with her in every regard." He went on to say that she needs understanding, sympathy, and patient friendship. There was no referral because her psychiatrist has been in contact with the family. Mrs. B's husband called the counselor not long after the interview to let him know she seemed much better after the interview.

Analysis.--First of all, the recognition on the part of the counselor that Mrs. B is a psychiatric case is good. He is not trying to play amateur psychiatrist but sincerely attempting to fulfill his role as a pastoral counselor. She undoubtedly enjoyed sharing her delusions of persecution with her pastor. He admits that he does not know exactly how to handle the case. Since such delusions of persecution are often the result of a threat of unworthy desires and of aspects of the personality which are troublesome, the problem is too severe for the

untrained. The course of action followed by this counselor of showing understanding and patient friendship is probably the only, and therefore the best thing he can do.

Counselor C - Case 3

Situation.--Mr. C is the client. He is fifty-three years old, single, and a member of the client's church. This is the first interview. "The client, who is a trustee of the church, had made unkind remarks about the church sexton at a church meeting and now he was all upset." The client is basically insecure and possesses an immature personality, according to the counselor. Together the counselor and client outlined the steps the client ought to take to rectify his offense. First, a letter of apology ought to go to the sexton and second, Mr. C should express a personal word of apology to the members who were present at the meeting. This course of action Mr. C was willing to follow because he took the initiative in planning the approach. The counselor feels that Mr. C regrets his unkind remarks not so much because of the sexton but because of the opposition of the group to his unseemly behavior. The pastor believes the whole incident will have a didactic result for the client. "The client's greatest need," says the counselor, "is a good swift kick in the pants."

Analysis.--The counselor considers the client as one who does not have deep-seated problems but is thoughtless and inconsiderate of others. He is not a neurotic nor a psychotic. The minister's suggestion that they work out a plan of action together was effective. A scheme devised by the minister alone would probably be rejected by the client, and the minister undoubtedly felt he could not depend upon his immature client to work out anything very effective. The expression on the

counselor's part that he felt the greatest need of Mr. B to be a good swift kick in the pants may not indicate the keenest insight but the suggestion elicits an understanding response from all who have had much experience with people of this type and their problems.

Counselor D - Case 1

Situation.--The hospital called the minister asking him to contact the wife of a man who had just been in a railroad accident in which a train had run over him and had traumatically amputated both of his legs. The minister was asked to bring the wife to the hospital. When they arrived, the husband was in surgery and obviously would be in no condition to talk to for a number of hours. The counselor, who is the minister, took this opportunity to counsel the injured man's wife. He encouraged steady trust in the skill of the surgeon, spoke of the splendid facilities of the hospital, and mentioned the already evident loyalty of friends. During the three-hour stay at the hospital and in the next two weeks that followed, the counselor gradually led the woman to a realization of the results of the accident as they would be manifest in the pattern of daily living. This subject was not mentioned until the counselor felt the client was ready to talk about it. He reminded her of the vocational rehabilitation services that are available and assisted her in checking her insurance and accident claims. He prayed from time to time with the wife and her husband. He also counseled with the husband when the latter was well enough for such an experience. There was a referral to a rehabilitation officer. The greatest need of the husband and wife was expressed as "recognition of the fact that life and home and happiness can be continued--love and security are not lost when a man's legs are gone. Love is more than a certain kind of job and mobility."

Analysis.--The fact that these people were not members of the counselor's congregation or did not even have any church affiliation did not deter him from rendering a very helpful ministry to them. He was not overly sentimental. He offered as much comfort as he could under the circumstances and yet he helped the distraught wife to face certain factors very realistically. This kind of an interview is difficult to record. The benefits that accrue from it are the result, not only of practical assistance, but of intangibles which come from little gestures, an understanding glance, or a handclasp. In a situation like this a counselor is likely to forget what "the book" says, and if he is a man with genuine love for people, an experience of faith, and some good common sense he can be effective despite "the book."

Counselor D - Case 2

Situation.--A married couple with one child, a boy in the first grade, asked their minister to help them to arrange for the adoption of another. Two years earlier the husband and wife had discussed the question but had taken no action in that regard. The wife stated the reason for wanting to adopt a child the fact that their son was lonely without a playmate at home. The real problem, from the point of view of the counselor, is the need for the husband better to understand his responsibilities as a father. Furthermore, the husband and wife need to enjoy the companionship as well as the "convenience" of marriage. An invitation to the couple to speak freely about their reasons for wanting to adopt a child elicited the subject of marital instability. Apparently they felt another child would lend a certain degree of stability. The clients did most of the talking. The counselor reported that their greatest need is to realize that marriage is a give-and-take

proposition and not a one-sided affair. The couple is willing and anxious for the counselor to work with them in the task of trying to settle their marital problems and live together as a family.

Analysis.--The counselor may very well have concluded that their desire for another child was based solely upon the recognition that their son needed a playmate. By allowing them to talk they soon revealed their basic problem. Therefore, if the counselor had worked with them in the adoption procedure it might have resulted in more trouble if they had been able to adopt a child. It does not appear as though a playmate for their child would have diminished their marital strife and the son's loneliness. A note added to the Interview Report indicates that, as a result of a number of interviews with the couple, "the father was budgeted one night a week for recreation with his son. The negative attitude of the son has decreased and a happy mood has been created in the home."

Counselor D - Case 3

Situation.--A sixty-year-old man whom the counselor has known casually for two years, after about six interviews expressed his inability to verbalize affection and especially the word "love" for his wife. In the second interview it was revealed that the man was in love with his wife's sister. His case history reveals intense hatred for his father who lived by stern duty rather than familial affection. The client also expressed doubts over his own affection for his mother who had borne an illegitimate child. The counselor writes, "Suspecting that the man's love for the 'other' woman was a one-sided love, I have tried to indicate the difference between genuine love of man and wife as a total relationship as over and against another kind of love which

can be termed erotic." Considering the possibility that the man may be mentally unbalanced the counselor made a referral to a nearby state mental hospital. He was declared psychotic by the psychiatrists there. A psychiatrist at the hospital where the client became a patient worked out a procedure whereby the counselor at first subtly revealed and then later announced in bold fashion that his affection was a romantic illusion, for his sister-in-law had no such feelings toward him. This was done and the client snapped back to reality most favorably.

Analysis.--The referral was the turning point in this case. It is doubtful that the counselor would have made much progress if he had continued on his own. The referral was timely and seemed to solve the problem. The therapy employed by the psychiatrist appears somewhat bizarre but the counselor has little basis for questioning the treatment of a trained medical man. As a result of the counselor's referral things went well.

Counselor E - Case 1

Situation.--Mrs. W, a sixty-five-year-old woman, is a Baptist and a member of the counselor's congregation. During this first interview the client explained that her daughter, who had recently moved to another town in New Hampshire, was very much interested in the Jehovah's Witness movement. In a recent visit to her daughter's new home Mrs. W and another daughter were invited to attend a meeting of the Jehovah's Witness group. The invitation was refused by both. This refusal, however, was not very graciously accepted, whereupon the mother and sister went to the meeting in order to avoid conflict. The reason for seeking the counsel of the minister was to learn what to do about the daughter's interest in Jehovah's Witness. The counselor listened to the client's story and then suggested

that the daughter be permitted to find happiness in this faith if she so desired. The client did most of the talking during the twenty-minute interview.

Analysis.--The counselor realizes that religious preference is not something that can be forced. He feels that neither he nor anyone else can do anything to dissuade the daughter from attending and participating in the activities of the Jehovah's Witness group. Any attempt to get the girl to change her religious affiliation would probably result in a genuine family disagreement and more loyalty than ever before to the Jehovah Witness movement.

Counselor E - Case 2

Situation.--Mrs. M is the sister of the Jehovah's Witness affiliate mentioned in the previous interview. Mrs. M is forty-two years old and a member of the counselor's Baptist Church. She came to see the counselor because she had received a letter from her sister in which she poured out her heart and confessed that she had always felt different from the rest of the family and therefore unwanted by the rest of them. This feeling was due to a large birthmark covering one side of her face. The client did not know what to do about the letter. Should she answer it? If she did, what should she say? The counselor reported that the real problem may be that the client feels some guilt because the letter charged that she and the other children in the family made fun of the birthmark. In a non-directive way the counselor learned that the sister with the birthmark had always been very jealous of Mrs. M. They were not very close to each other as are many sisters. However, "the client never could (or would) recall to mind any single instance in which she ever hurt her sister because of the birthmark. The client has always been

very careful lest she hurt her sister by word or deed. She thinks she can do the best for her sister by always agreeing with her -- letting this be a substitution for real love and affection." The client was also accused in the letter of being ashamed of her "marked sister." The counselor prayed with the client and suggested that a personal visit to her sister would be much more satisfactory than an impersonal letter. He also tried to get the client to appreciate her sister's needs and her way of thinking. He concluded that the greatest need of the client is to express her true feelings about her sister. She claims that she never has been ashamed of her sister but the counselor is not so sure of this assertion.

Analysis.--This is a difficult problem. The counselor shows some ability by getting Mrs. M to clarify her own feelings. There is no use in getting her to write a letter or even make a personal visit until she knows how she actually feels about her sister. Maybe she is repressing certain feelings and attitudes that she knows are not socially acceptable. By having the one problem presented to him (the unhappy letter from the client's sister) he was able to sense another one (the difficulty the client is having to see herself as she really is in relationship to her sister). Surely the suggestion of the personal visit is a good one but it might better be made when her feelings toward her sister are clarified in her own mind.

Counselor E - Case 1

Situation.--Mrs. I is seventy-three years old. She is a Lutheran but has been attending the church of which the counselor is the pastor. He says, "I went to see her as the custom is in rural parishes. Fear of death and an insecure view of eternity were expressed by the

client during this sick call." The counselor sensed that the problem really bothered her but it was related to another factor. "She had at one time or other been subjected to a very harsh interpretation of salvation. She was living in fear that her life had not been 'good enough.'" The minister explained, "I asked questions of her which were intended to help her verbalize those things which I wanted her to say concerning that which she really believes." The client did most of the speaking. The counselor prayed and referred to various Scriptural passages that helped answer her questions. The minister believes Mrs. I needs the conviction that salvation is by faith. Forty minutes were spent with the client. In answer to the question, "How did the client's attitude affect you?," the counselor wrote, "Caused me to re-evaluate my presentation of immortality." The client requested the minister to return. On the back of his report the counselor wrote, "Knowing that Mrs. I attends church regularly, as do a number of other elderly people, I made a special point of preaching a series of sermons on the subject of immortality."

Analysis.--It probably did not require a great amount of ability to come to the conclusion that the client was worried about being "good enough," as well as having an insecure view of eternity. However, the praiseworthy aspect of this interview was that of getting the client to express verbally what she really does believe. The counselor acted as a sort of catalytic agent in the process of getting Mrs. I to come to the conclusion that she does believe certain essentials of the Christian faith and that salvation, after all, is basically a matter of faith. It is also commendable on the pastor's part that he re-evaluated his own presentation of immortality and then decided to preach a series of sermons on the subject for the benefit of his client and others in the church who may have the same doubts and uncertainties.

Counselor E - Case 2

Situation.--Miss X is a thirty-five-year-old single woman. She is a member of the counselor's congregation and has been known by him for one year. "The initial problem seemed to be an advanced state of confusion brought about by an extremely conservative religious background. It seemed that she was disturbed by her doubts concerning her own salvation. This, however, turned out to be secondary to the true problem." The counselor expressed the true problem to be, as far as he could determine it, as follows: "Through several discussions on related themes, it appears that she feels a crushing responsibility for her three nieces and nephews, children of her sister who died some time ago. I have been able to gather that she promised her sister, just before she died, that she would see that the children were brought up in the church. This promise has proven to be beyond her ability to fulfill completely and she is feeling very guilty because of her failure." Miss X has had some psychiatric treatment. According to the counselor the problem is not settled even though he has worked with the client on a number of occasions.

He thinks that through the church-school class, of which he is the teacher and Miss X a member, he may be able to be of some assistance. The problem is going to be that of giving her some grounds for security in the face of her failures. "She needs to realize that the failure with the nieces and nephew is not her fault." The counselor indicated the client's attitude toward him to be uncertain. He explained this attitude on the basis of his not being willing to help her force her charges to go to church. He prayed with her and used Bible references when they seemed appropriate. The pastor writes that her greatest need is "understanding of the Christian faith and release from self-reproach." "She also needs to recognize that failure is not sin," he adds.

Analysis.--The counselor views this client as needing psychiatric care yet also as being able to profit from the counsel and understanding of a Christian minister. His analysis of her real problem as feeling guilty for not being able to completely fulfill her promise made to her dead sister is probably getting at a very basic issue. His attempt to help her get release from self-reproach is worthy of note. As long as she feels as she does about her failure there is not much hope of her ever having a very wholesome outlook on life. As the counselor indicates, Miss X identifies her lack of success in getting the children to be faithful in their church attendance as sin on her part. The counselor shows wisdom in not forcing the children to go to church. Whether or not the client should insist on their attendance, at least in the Sunday-school, would depend upon their ages. The counselor does not say anything about working with the psychiatrist in order to present him with some helpful information or for the purpose of checking on his own means of therapy. Such a conference might prove very beneficial to the client.

Counselor G - Case 1

Situation.--Instead of using the regular Interview Report the counselor sent carbon copies of a few interviews. The outline as arranged by the counselor is reproduced verbatim.

Fifth Visit

Factual Information.--The patient is a female, white, age 51, married (separated from husband), six daughters and one son. All of the children are married except one daughter who is the youngest, age 12. The patient is a member of the Methodist Church but does not attend regularly. Two weeks ago the patient was admitted to the hospital for a gall bladder condition but she was not operated on until yesterday.

Preliminary Plans.--My visit today will take the form of prayer with the patient if her condition warrants. I shall not endeavor to carry on any extended conversation unless the patient shows sufficient strength. My purpose is to show an interest in the patient during this hour of need.

The Visit.--When I arrived on the ward I inquired of the head nurse concerning the condition of the patient and the advisability of a call. She informed me the patient was still quite weak after the operation but that it might be possible for me to visit her. I waited in the hallway until the nurse had gone in to check the condition of the patient, and when she came out she said it was all right for me to enter. I entered the ward and walked toward the bed of the patient. She was lying flat on her back with her eyes closed. A dextrose bottle was on the stand near the bed. The patient had a rubber tubing in her nose. As I neared the bed she opened her eyes slowly and looked at me and held out her hand. I grasped her hand, stood near the patient, and leaning over I spoke to her:

C: Hello, Mrs. _____.

P: I knew it was you. (I inferred from this that when the nurse had come in to check on the patient she had possibly spoken of a visitor.)

C: I just wanted to stop by to have prayer with you this morning. I don't want to stay too long for you need all the rest you can get.

P: It's all over now, and I'm so glad it is.

C: It's over now and you'll be getting better as time goes along. Shall we have just a word of prayer? (Held the hand of the patient and bent low over her while praying in a rather quiet tone.) We thank Thee, our Father, that Thou hast brought Thy child safely through this operation. We pray Thy special blessing upon her during the days that lie ahead that she may feel healing strength returning to her. May these be good days to her. We pray Thee to remember her family and bless and care for each one of them. Our Father, we leave ourselves in Thy hands, and ask Thy guidance and blessing over us. In Jesus' Name, Amen.

P: Thank you. (The patient slowly brought my hand to her lips and kissed it.)

C: I'll stop in to see you again in a few days, Mrs. _____. God bless you.

Conclusions.--The patient was in such a weakened condition that there was no possibility of any conversation. Therefore the ministry of prayer, I felt, was the best and only thing for this occasion. I had the feeling the patient had expected me to come and was very appreciative that I did come at this time.

The primary long range plan at this stage will be to make the patient's experience in the hospital a deeply spiritual one. As time goes along and other interviews are held problems in the patient's life may arise that may seek further solution.

Immediate plans will include prayer and possible Bible readings during her period of convalescence.
Length of visit about 3 minutes.

Analysis.--In this strict sense of the word this is not an interview but it does manifest something of the counselor's ability to sense the tone of certain situations, his sensitivity to the client's feelings, and his possession of common sense. This is an intelligent and, undoubtedly very helpful, pastoral call. He exhibited wisdom and courtesy by inquiring of the head nurse the condition of the patient and the advisability of a call. Two other commendable items in this call are the brevity of the visit in light of the patient's condition and the appropriateness of the prayer. The counselor did not seize the opportunity, through the medium of prayer, to preach to the patient or reprimand her for not being regular in her church attendance. The patient's response to his visit indicates the value of it to her.

Counselor H - Case 1

Situation.--The client is an eighty-year-old widow who is a member of the counselor's congregation. This is the first interview on this problem. She is "obsessed with phobias. Fears that she is not as good as she should be or professes to be. Deadly fear of contamination from germs which actually do not exist. She realizes this to some extent on an intellectual level but emotionally the problem is a very real one to her. The client cannot touch or handle anything that has been touched by any person, or relative of that person, if she considers him to be immoral." The counselor suggested that the client consult a physician in order to have a physical examination. He believes it is wise to rule out any organic cause of her problem. The interview lasted forty-five minutes. Before she left the counselor prayed with the client.

Immediate plans will include prayer and possible Bible readings during her period of convalescence.
Length of visit about 3 minutes.

Analysis.--In this strict sense of the word this is not an interview but it does manifest something of the counselor's ability to sense the tone of certain situations, his sensitivity to the client's feelings, and his possession of common sense. This is an intelligent and, undoubtedly very helpful, pastoral call. He exhibited wisdom and courtesy by inquiring of the head nurse the condition of the patient and the advisability of a call. Two other commendable items in this call are the brevity of the visit in light of the patient's condition and the appropriateness of the prayer. The counselor did not seize the opportunity, through the medium of prayer, to preach to the patient or reprimand her for not being regular in her church attendance. The patient's response to his visit indicates the value of it to her.

Counselor H - Case 1

Situation.--The client is an eighty-year-old widow who is a member of the counselor's congregation. This is the first interview on this problem. She is "obsessed with phobias. Fears that she is not as good as she should be or professes to be. Deadly fear of contamination from germs which actually do not exist. She realizes this to some extent on an intellectual level but emotionally the problem is a very real one to her. The client cannot touch or handle anything that has been touched by any person, or relative of that person, if she considers him to be immoral." The counselor suggested that the client consult a physician in order to have a physical examination. He believes it is wise to rule out any organic cause of her problem. The interview lasted forty-five minutes. Before she left the counselor prayed with the client.

Analysis.--There is not very much that can be said about this interview. The counselor followed the most sensible course of action by making a referral to a physician. Since she had not been to a physician since the onset of the phobias there is a slight chance that the word of a professional medical man may impress her. The second interview follows.

Counselor H - Case 1 (second interview)

Situation.--The client had gone to see a physician who did not give her a physical examination. He merely gave her some medication which must have been some kind of sedative for it did reduce tension. After the visit to the doctor the client's fears were somewhat retarded at various times. She had made an appointment to see the doctor again but the doctor became sick and could see no patients. The client desired to see another doctor. The counselor feels she still should have a physical examination to determine the basis of the problem, i.e., organic or physic, or both. Through the efforts of the counselor the client agreed to submit to a complete physical examination. The reason she did not have a complete physical examination by the other doctor was her own reluctance. The basic need of the client, at the present time, is to locate the root of her emotional disturbance. This the counselor feels incapable of doing.

Analysis.--In view of the client's previous reluctance to submit to a physical examination it appears as though the counselor must have relatively good rapport with the client to get her to agree to be thoroughly examined by a physician. The counselor does not appear to have accomplished a great deal but he has done what is probably the only and best thing considering his own limitations which he is alert enough to recognize.

Counselor H - Case 1 (third interview)

Situation.--A physical examination revealed no organic cause for the client's condition. The physician (a general practitioner) advised the client to see a psychiatrist. The client did not respond very enthusiastically to this suggestion. She exhibited some fear and uneasiness at the thought of going to see a psychiatrist. The counselor writes, "I sought to help her face this task in all of its reality and to allay any false or bizarre notions concerning a psychiatric visit." In the twenty-five-minute interview prayer was offered. At the moment the client needs help in gaining enough courage to visit a psychiatrist.

Analysis.--This client needs psychiatric care which means she is beyond the ability of the counselor to do anything therapeutically effective. Recognizing this to be a fact he does the next best thing--make a referral to a psychiatrist. The client's reluctance in regard to psychiatric attention prescribes the role of the counselor rather well: His immediate task in the third interview was to help the client see the importance of visiting a psychiatrist.

Counselor H - Case 2

Situation.--Mrs. F is a forty-two-year-old woman who is a member of the counselor's church. This is the first visit which took place in a hospital. The client had entered the hospital for radical surgery of the left breast. The right breast had been removed several months before. The client had conversed with her minister for a short time following the Sunday morning worship service prior to her entry to the hospital the following Thursday. The counselor states that he "sought to give her encouragement and hope, and also endeavored to get her to relax and yield herself to the hospital experience and to God's keeping. The client spoke

more than the counselor. The greatest need of Mrs. F is "rest and relaxation so some measure of calm within can be acquired."

Analysis.--In a situation like this there is only one course of action for the counselor to take. The patient needed encouragement and hope which the counselor attempted to offer. From what he states about the patient's greatest need it can be assumed that his prayer would be a vehicle whereby the client would be aided in the acquiring of a certain degree of relaxation and calm.

Counselor H - Case 2 (second interview)

Situation.--Shortly after the operation the counselor visited the patient but she was very incoherent because of drugs and medication, so he left. The counselor returned the next day and found the patient very rational but restless. She was exceedingly pleased to learn that the tumor was not malignant but she exhibited some anxiety over the fact that she thought the healing would not take place so rapidly or so easily as the preceding radical surgery. The counselor reveals that he "endeavored to get her to think logically about the situation." He reasoned that Mrs. F is right-handed and naturally would have more activity on her right side. The previous surgery was done on the right breast, where more activity was involved. The present surgery was on the left, which meant less activity in the area where the healing would be taking place. The counselor indicated that he imagined the healing would be just as rapid and possibly less painful. Her greatest need was described as "adjusting to the period of convalescence."

Analysis.--First of all, the counselor demonstrated common sense by leaving when he found the patient incoherent because of certain medication that was given her. No purpose would be served by his staying

with her and talking or even praying. When he returned the following day she was prepared to have him talk to her. He handled her concern about the healing very acceptably. It is to be noticed that he did not speak with any degree of finality; he simply stated that he believed there may be some logic to what he said about the limited activity on the left side.

Counselor I - Case 1

Situation.--A member of the counselor's church came to his pastor greatly depressed. He is a man fifty years old and a very prominent lawyer. "He is the most cultured and intelligent person I have ever known--a good friend also. He is afraid of losing his mental powers. His work is suffering. Clients depend upon him and he is unable to render the service he should." Allowing the client to do most of the talking the counselor learned that the lawyer's father and brother had both experienced mental breakdowns. He was sure he was going to suffer a mental breakdown also. He went to a physician with his problem but the doctor told him that he personally doubted the value of psychiatric treatment in his case. The physician added that his was a condition that only he (the patient) could overcome. This advice tended to reinforce the client's fear and dreadful opinion of mental treatment. The client told of the time he visited his brother in "one of those institutions." He dwelt upon the locking and unlocking of doors. The counselor, in spite of the physician's advice, feels that the client definitely needs psychiatric care. The counselor states, "I realized from the beginning this was a very serious condition and saw it my duty to do everything I possibly could to encourage the client to seek psychiatric help. I tried to assure the patient that he could be helped and that his problem might

best be solved by getting someone trained to lend his skill. He knew, as a lawyer, that he was not 'committing himself' or 'locking himself up' just because he went to a psychiatrist." The final note penned by the counselor was, "I am happy to report that the lawyer presented himself for psychiatric treatment and is now improving nicely in the _____ Hospital at _____.

Analysis.--The counselor is to be complimented for seeing the seriousness of the client's condition and not taking the advice of the physician. There was enough evidence, such as a family history of mental disorder and the client's own anxiety, to disregard the notion that the client would have to solve the problem without any outside help. The final bit of information revealing the fact that the client was improving nicely under psychiatric treatment provides evidence that the counselor did his job well.

Counselor I - Case 2

Situation.--Mrs. T who is in her early fifties came to see her pastor because she is worried about her only child. The "child" happens to be a son who married a splendid Roman Catholic girl who is not interested in the Baptist Church in which her husband was brought up. The son and his wife never go to any church. The client, Mrs. T, wants "my boy" back in the Sunday Church School and in the regular worship services. She told the counselor that she knew he could not do anything about the problem but she just wanted to talk. The counselor explains that there are many reasons why "her boy" is not interested in religious matters as he ought to be but the mother does not see her relationship to his lack of interest. "It is regrettable," says the counselor, "that her daughter-in-law is the symbol of everything that is bad in her son's

life." The counselor listened for an hour. He considered his role in this interview to be that of providing an audience for Mrs. T.

Analysis.--In a matter such as a difference of religious backgrounds the counselor holds the philosophy that it is the prerogative of no one, not even the mother, to start interfering. The counselor showed good sense by not sympathizing with the client. He could have reasoned that it would help to establish himself with this prominent family in the church (the husband is a respected physician in the community) if he were to agree that the son's situation is unfortunate in that he married a girl who is of no real help, etc. Since the client admitted, however, that the counselor could do nothing about the affair he did the next best thing--he just sat back and listened.

ANALYSIS OF GOOD INTERVIEWS FROM EASTERN BAPTIST THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

In this category there are eight counselors whose interviews, it was judged, demonstrate good counseling methods and philosophy. Counselor B was rated by three of the four judges as good, but the other counselors were unanimously rated as good.

Counselor A - Case 1

Situation.--Mrs. L, age forty, a member of the counselor's congregation, came for her second interview concerning her eleven-year-old son who had a failure at school and a great deal of emotional tension. The client thinks her son's problems are due to the unsatisfactory relationship with his step-father who is an unreasonable disciplinarian. The mother also sought advice about sending her son to live permanently in a county institution for homeless and problem boys. The counselor elaborated as follows: "The readiness of this mother to send her boy

to the county institution created some doubts in my mind in regard to her motives. This institution recommended to her by the school guidance counselor would permit her to see the boy only once a month. I kept wondering to what extent the desire to be free from the care of the child motivated her."

The mother feels any change on the part of the step-father is hopeless. He is completely uncooperative. He had his own idea about what was wrong with the boy--he needed sterner and harsher discipline. The counselor asked Mrs. L if there were any possibility of her husband's coming for an interview. Her response was negative. The counselor and client discussed causes of problem behavior and together arrived at possible causes of action. The mother is reported to have shown considerable insight into the nature of her son's difficulty. The counselor writes, "I attempted to get her to have her husband talk to some other counselor if he would not talk to me." Mrs. L left with the idea of exploring and weighing the various alternatives we had talked about.

Analysis.--The counselor senses the serious nature of the problem confronting Mrs. L but he is desirous of having her examine every facet of it. It is evident that the counselor sees danger ahead if the boy is sent to the county institution yet he is anxious to have the mother think through the difficulty and come to a decision herself. He is not going to place his stamp of approval upon sending the boy away nor is he going to tell Mrs. L what to do. An open-mindedness and genuine desire to help are manifest in the counselor's suggestion that Mrs. L's husband see some other counselor since he refuses to see the one reporting. Leaving the interview with the idea of exploring and weighing alternatives will help the client be more discriminating in her choice of action

to the county institution created some doubts in my mind in regard to her motives. This institution recommended to her by the school guidance counselor would permit her to see the boy only once a month. I kept wondering to what extent the desire to be free from the care of the child motivated her."

The mother feels any change on the part of the step-father is hopeless. He is completely uncooperative. He had his own idea about what was wrong with the boy--he needed sterner and harsher discipline. The counselor asked Mrs. L if there were any possibility of her husband's coming for an interview. Her response was negative. The counselor and client discussed causes of problem behavior and together arrived at possible causes of action. The mother is reported to have shown considerable insight into the nature of her son's difficulty. The counselor writes, "I attempted to get her to have her husband talk to some other counselor if he would not talk to me." Mrs. L left with the idea of exploring and weighing the various alternatives we had talked about.

Analysis.--The counselor senses the serious nature of the problem confronting Mrs. L but he is desirous of having her examine every facet of it. It is evident that the counselor sees danger ahead if the boy is sent to the county institution yet he is anxious to have the mother think through the difficulty and come to a decision herself. He is not going to place his stamp of approval upon sending the boy away nor is he going to tell Mrs. L what to do. An open-mindedness and genuine desire to help are manifest in the counselor's suggestion that Mrs. L's husband see some other counselor since he refuses to see the one reporting. Leaving the interview with the idea of exploring and weighing alternatives will help the client be more discriminating in her choice of action

and aid her in the difficult task of revealing something of her true motivations concerning the disposition of her son.

Counselor A - Case 2

Situation.--A sixty-seven-year-old widower has been having a number of counseling sessions with the counselor. This is the tenth interview. The client, Mr. D is an alcoholic. He had been off drink for a year but today began drinking again. Utter discouragement has seized him. He is frustrated because of his lack of a really promising job. The counselor feels that the basic problem of the client, that which makes him drink, is his inordinate ambition to succeed. "This man has an almost unbelievable proclivity to be 'a success,' or 'make a million dollars,' or just be 'top dog.'" His whole life has been devoted to newspaper reporting, journalism, or some sort of canvassing connected with newspaper work. He has stamina and driving power superior to most men thirty years younger than he. All through his life he has ruined his opportunities, forfeited good jobs, and discouraged himself by six-month alcoholic sprees. It seems that these breakdowns occur just after his highest hopes were blasted. Although he is a man of unusual ability he appears to be almost fanatical about status. "My aim in this interview," says the counselor, "was mostly to be a listener so he could express his frustration." He continues, "There seems to be some emotional reason why he cannot accept lower, more realistic goals in life." The counselor endeavored to encourage the client by emphasizing some of his good points, admirable qualities, and actual successes. The interview lasted one hour.

Analysis.--The counselor has tried to find out what it is that is making the client resort to alcohol and he seems to have solved the

problem rather well as far as he has gone. In subsequent interviews it will be necessary to investigate the reason behind the client's inordinate desire to success and gain status. The encouragement given the client by emphasizing his worthy characteristics was a good approach. It is also commendable that the counselor was willing to listen, for by so doing he learned more about Mr. D and gave him a chance to express his feelings of frustration.

Counselor A - Case 3

Situation.--This client is a youth of seventeen. He is a member of the counselor's parish. He and his minister have known each other for three years. This is the first interview. The boy has made many enemies. At school he has antagonized both teachers and fellow students. The boy "doesn't understand why the world should be so against him" and he is extremely unhappy. The boy has the reputation for saying just what he thinks without any inhibition. The counselor has a rather complete knowledge of the boy's behavior over the past three years and he also is acquainted with the family background. It has been the habitual behavior of the lad to give expression to dominance over others whenever he gets the opportunity. As a result he has alienated all of his friends. He is physically well-developed for his age and is aware of the fact. His unusual strength has sometimes resulted in his injuring other people. The counselor says, "I explored for some lurking sense of inferiority for which he might be overcompensating but I found none." The counselor's plan for the future is that of letting the boy "talk out" his discouragement and hostility. By this free expression the counselor will get some new insights and the client may achieve a clearer understanding of his

own personality and a better personal balance. He indicates, "I think there would be therapy in catharsis."

Analysis.--It is worth noting that the minister gives no evidence of any preaching or moralizing. The greatest contribution that the counselor can make in the initial interviews will be that of encouraging the boy to express his hostility and frustration in the atmosphere of the counseling room where it can do little or no harm. The counselor did the obvious when he looked for some feeling of inferiority or insecurity. Even though he did not find it during this first interview it may come to the fore later on. In this early period of working with the boy the counselor's chief contribution is that of permitting and even encouraging the expression of hostility. This is an unusual note in most of the interviews by Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary graduates included in the study.

Counselor B - Case 1

Situation.--A single man twenty-one years old was called into the office of the registrar of the Bible School he is attending. He was called into the office because he had falsified his school attendance records. The young man did not volunteer this information; it was learned through another source. The real problem is one of deceit which has pervaded most of his life and actions. He had been orphaned at an early age and this was part of his plan of survival. Through his latest episode deceit was rearing its ugly head again. In addition his aunt, to whose care he had been committed after the death of his parents, was apt to be very sympathetic toward the boy and not insist that he face his uncooperative behavior. The counselor felt that the youth was struggling with a deep-rooted problem which would need skilled counseling so he suggested

that the young man have an interview with a psychiatrist so that his persistent problem could be explored. However, upon making this suggestion the counselor was informed that his client had already begun treatment. The counselor prayed with the client and referred to certain passages from the Bible from memory.

Analysis.--It is particularly important for the client to face up to the type of behavior of which he was guilty, first of all, for his own sake, and second, because of his interest in some type of Christian service as a vocational choice. The referral was an intelligent suggestion as borne out by the fact that the boy was already seeing a psychiatrist who felt that the boy needed the kind of help he could give. The counselor seems to be more genuinely interested in the boy as a person than he is concerned over the fact that some records have been juggled. This is good.

Counselor B - Case 2

Situation.--A student, twenty years old, in the same institution as the one mentioned above, desired to be excused from school for two days to do work for a Christian youth movement known as Youth for Christ. He was called into the counselor's office and told he could not be excused from school because he was on the verge of failure in his class work and he had excessive absences already. The chap said he had no idea his scholastic standing was in jeopardy.

The following description is given of the youth: "This young man has a very pleasing personality and he knows it. He is very attractive to other people and has done good work with them until they come to realize that there is so much sham to his make-up. He spends too much work on youth meetings and other Christian activities and not enough

time on his school work. Last year the youth falsified his attendance records. When the counselor talked to him about it he had a perfect excuse. Later in the year he was informed of his likelihood of failure in a certain class and he became belligerent and expressed the sentiment that he was perfectly in the right. During this interview the client was warned that failure again, due to excessive absences, would result in strict probation or possible expulsion. The strict probation would include the necessity of his living in the men's dormitory. At the present time he is living at home." Neither prayer nor the Bible was used during the interview. During the interview the counselor's secretary was present to jot down notes since the client had made untrue statements concerning previous interviews.

Analysis.--It sounds as though the counselor handled this "ecclesiastical playboy" rather well. Integrity is anticipated in any school and it should be found without question in the lives of young people who are going into Christian service. It is not that one should expect impeccable behavior from students in a Bible School or Seminary but it surely is reasonable to expect improved behavior after serious misdemeanors have been committed. One may reason that the client was undoubtedly having his ego inflated every time he appeared before youth groups and he was willing to pay the price of inferior school work and missing class sessions in order to get the "sanctified glamour" he so delighted in. For the sake of the Christian cause the counselor undoubtedly issued such a stern ultimatum to the young man.

Counselor B - Case 3

Situation.--Miss W came to see the counselor because she felt that she was being watched by invisible spiritual beings. She was also

in love with a married man who did not return any affection. Miss W is twenty-five years old, a student in a Bible School. She has been in the school one month. The counselor describes the client in the following fashion: "Miss W is most certainly psychotic." The decision of the counselor led to her being dismissed from school. However, before her dismissal she was sent to the school psychologist and also referred to a psychiatrist.

Analysis.--There is little that needs to be said about this interview. The quick referral to the psychologist and the psychiatrist was the only course of action to follow. Even before the psychologist or psychiatrist saw her the counselor realized that it would be very unwise to keep her in school so he notified her father to come get her immediately. When the father came he admitted that his daughter had been under psychiatric care before coming to the school.

Counselor C - Case 1

Situation.--Mr. H is forty-one years old, a member of the counselor's congregation, and a married man. This is the second interview. The client said he went to see a doctor who took the Holy Spirit away from him. He wanted the counselor to help him get it back, or recommend some doctor who would help him get the Spirit back. The counselor knew that Mr. H worked at a plant where there is an industrial chaplain employed. The industrial chaplain was contacted by the counselor and was requested to try to get an interview with Mr. H. Because the client had been frequently absent from work the industrial chaplain called him to talk about his absenteeism. After the interview the chaplain and the counselor conferred and quickly agreed that Mr. H was badly in need of psychiatric treatment. The counselor states that Mr. H is all confused

over religion but he adds, "I believe this is a symptom and not the cause of his illness." Arrangements were made to see a psychiatrist.

Analysis.--It was a rather good idea for the counselor to confer with the industrial chaplain. It would be assumed that anyone employed as an industrial chaplain would have a fair amount of training in counseling. The method of the referral was wise because the client might have been suspicious had he been referred to the industrial chaplain and not to a psychiatrist. The referral to a psychiatrist seems to be the only intelligent action to take.

Counselor C - Case 2

Situation.--The client is forty years old, married, and a church member who has come to her pastor a second time for counsel concerning her nervousness. She is unable to sleep and very unhappy most of the time. From the previous interview it was learned that her husband is a problem drinker. For some reason the counselor did not think his drinking was the basis of her problem. By encouraging the client to talk it was revealed that the client's unhappiness is caused by her single son, age nineteen, who is having an affair with a twenty-three-year old married woman. The counselor deduces that the client constantly nags her husband and son. The son wanted to go into the service but the mother raised such a furor that he reluctantly had to abandon the notion. The counselor believes it will take a considerable amount of time to help the client but he is willing to try. His method will be that of assisting her in the difficult task of seeing herself more realistically. At the close of the forty-five minute interview the counselor prayed with the client.

Analysis.--This counselor is observing the criterion regarding the importance of clarifying the problem. By adopting the role of a

listener the counselor was able to have his client reveal enough of her background and feelings so that he knew her problem was something other than her husband. The counselor's objective of helping the woman to see herself more realistically is good. She may come to the point where she sees a better way of dealing with her husband and son than by nagging them. The willingness of the counselor to accept the counseling relationship on a long-term basis in view of the depth of the problem is also commendable.

Counselor C - Case 3

Situation.--The client, Mr. O, is twenty-eight years old, a member of the counselor's church. In this initial interview he explained that his wife's affections for him are not what they should be. He is highly suspicious of her. The counselor encouraged the client to talk and as a result learned that Mr. O had confessed to his wife that he had had an affair with another woman several years ago. His wife was very much upset when she heard the confession and Mr. O feels she has never gotten over it. The counselor inquired about the wife's attitude toward a joint counseling session. The client was sure his wife would agree to such an interview. As a result of the joint interview the counselor is convinced that Mrs. O now considers her husband's former affair as an incident which is past and forgotten. It seems that Mr. O is the one who cannot forget what took place years ago. He still has deep guilt feelings and, as a consequence, reads into his wife's behavior certain attitudes and innuendoes that are not there. This joint counseling session took an hour and a quarter, which the counselor indicated is longer than most of his interviews. He prayed with the husband and wife before they left. The counselor believes the husband needs to

experience a greater faith in God's forgiving love. When this experience is realized it should produce a greater faith in others.

Analysis.--The client came to his counselor to learn what he could do about his wife's problem but after one private interview and a joint counseling session he realized a little more clearly that the problem is fundamentally within himself. The counselor's analysis of the situation, namely, that the husband is bound by deep feelings of guilt which he projects to his wife, is undoubtedly accurate. In the presence of the counselor Mr. and Mrs. O were able to clarify some issues more easily than they could have done otherwise. In this case the role of counselor fitted the minister rather well. The client's genuine guilt feelings were released best by his being graciously and intelligently introduced to God's forgiving love.

Counselor D - Case 1

Situation.--A sixty-year-old man called upon his pastor to discuss a problem. Nine months ago his wife was operated on for internal cancer. Recent symptoms again indicated the need for surgery. The client feared a recurrence of carcinoma. He was deeply disturbed as to why God would allow this to happen to such loyal church folk as themselves. Subsequent surgery revealed a hopeless condition. The client did most of the talking. During the hour-long interview the counselor prayed and referred to certain passages from the Bible that illustrated some truth the counselor was endeavoring to reveal. The counselor feels his client's greatest need is "the development of a Christian philosophy of life that will help him understand God's limitations, man's responsibility and the place and value of suffering." The counselor is helping his client investigate the

possibility of having the wife sent to some rather famous and relatively successful cancer clinics in the East.

Analysis.--In a situation like this the minister can do nothing for the cancer patient so he is limited to trying to help the husband in his perplexity. Since the inevitable must be faced there is only one approach for the counselor to make. He must assist the client in facing the inevitable in the most intelligent, satisfying manner possible. Evidently the counselor believes he has at his disposal certain Christian resources which can be drawn upon to help the client in his hour of despair. Our criteria listed Christian doctrine as an available resource in pastoral counseling. In this interview the counselor employed prayer, Bible material, and Christian doctrine. There is no note of God's visiting the client and his wife with judgment or punishment, which interpretation one occasionally reads or hears. Another commendable aspect of the interview is to be found in the counselor's realistic, yet genuinely sympathetic approach. He does not appear to "gush" with sympathy but he does seem to understand and attempt to make this experience an educational one.

Counselor D - Case 2

Situation.--Mrs. G is fifty-five years old. She has been having previous interviews concerning her husband. This is the fifth interview.

Her husband was recently released from a mental institution where he had been treated as a schizophrenic manic-depressive. She reported that his symptoms were recurring: dark moods, hopeless pessimism, threats to her life, belief that the family is against him. "However, her own story," the counselor writes, "and recitation of complaints are tending to become so stereotyped and contradictory that I am beginning to suspect

that she is suffering from some kind of a neurosis." The counselor continues, "Mr. G is undoubtedly ill but I believe his wife to be a contributing factor to any relapse on his part. She is aggressive, overly concerned about money, highly censorious of others' motives, eager to cover her own motivation with a whitewash of pious chatter and activity. Her real problem is shown in a bitter spirit which frustrates all who wish to deal with her in sincerity and good faith."

The counselor wrote to Mr. G's psychiatrist to discover if he had established the wife's role in relation to Mr. G's problem. Mr. G's greatest need, according to the counselor is for psychotherapy. He did refer her to Dr. _____ in _____.

Analysis.--In an excellent manner the counselor has clarified the problem. He recognizes the truth that the client's husband is a sick man but he also sees the wife's attitude and behavior as a contributing factor. It was exceedingly thoughtful of the counselor to write to Mr. G's psychiatrist in order to learn what he thought the role of the wife may be in connection with her husband's illness. The referral to a psychiatrist was a wise move. The outstanding feature of this interview is the counselor's ability to get at the real issue by a non-directive method combined with seeking information from a psychiatrist who knows the situation.

Counselor D - Case 3

Situation.--The client is the twenty-three-year-old wife of a young minister who was taking a few hours of seminary work to complete requirements for a bachelor of divinity degree. At the same time he was serving as pastor of a small mission church. The client had left her husband and had lived with another man for a period of a few weeks. She

believes that she no longer loves her husband but for the sake of convention and one child is attempting a reconciliation. The husband has withdrawn from the seminary and resigned from his church.

The counselor believes the client to be a victim of arrested psychological development. "She is constantly playing roles, wearying of the script, and looking for new phantasies. She is unstable in all of her loyalties and extremely selfish. This is manifested in social immaturity and sexual frigidity." Her greatest need is continuing psychiatric treatment that will result in a production of genuinely altruistic attitudes. She was referred to a competent psychiatrist in _____. The psychiatrist reports progress.

Analysis.--The counselor views his client as a sick person needing psychiatric help and therefore he does not preach to her nor make a big moral issue of the case. Obviously he does not condone what she has done but he is careful not to reveal anything to her that would create a barrier because she feels he is sitting in judgment upon her. The counselor has investigated her background enough to see the relationship of her past experiences to her present behavior. Apparently the counselor has a rather extensive knowledge of the dynamics of human behavior. Evidence of this is found in his statement that the client's sexual frigidity is a manifestation of her selfishness. English and Pearson support this idea in their well-known text dealing with emotional problems.¹ The referral to the psychiatrist was needed in view of the type of problem.

¹O. Spurgeon English and Gerald H. J. Pearson, Emotional Problems of Living, (Revised edition; New York: W. W. Norton Company, Inc., 1955), p. 407.

SUMMARY

These interviews are superior to the others because of a number of reasons. There is usually a definite attempt made to get at the real problem. These counselors treat the causes of the problem rather than the symptoms. If they cannot handle the problem themselves they make an intelligent referral. They seem to be quick to recognize their own limitations. The absence of preaching or moralizing, either in an open or surreptitious manner is quite refreshing. The counselors appear to be counseling their clients in a very unselfish way. They are not willing to do damage to a client in order to defend their own viewpoints or add another member to their church congregations. The use of the various Christian resources is usually very judicious. They do not pray or refer to the Bible in an indiscriminate fashion, yet they are keenly aware of their privileges and responsibilities as ministers of the Christian faith. In most of the interviews there is also an indication that the counselors are somewhat acquainted with psychological principles as they relate to inter- and intrapersonal relationships. Finally, there is a liberal sprinkling of common sense throughout these interviews.

CHAPTER V

FACTORS OTHER THAN INTERVIEWS INFLUENCING THE STUDY

It is very apparent that the interviews, per se, supply the most important material in this study. However, there are some other factors which should not be overlooked in order to get as total a picture of the counselors as possible. These factors are valuable by implication rather than by their explicit nature.

CHARACTER OF REPORTED INTERVIEWS

Most assuredly a counselor's effectiveness cannot be evaluated by the amount of writing he does in reporting an interview. One counselor may say relatively little in his report and yet do a much more efficient job than the counselor who uses reams of paper to describe what took place in the counseling relationship. Granting that there is this possibility, one must also acknowledge that the counselor who reports well is likely to recognize the importance of certain requirements of effective counseling. For instance, he would see the necessity of stating a number of observations that led him to believe that a particular client is neurotic rather than by simply writing, "The patient is a neurotic individual." Another example is to be found in one of the counselors who attempted to describe the problem that the client brought to him by merely writing the one word, "Domestic." Now it could be that this counselor was either lazy or preoccupied and just did not feel like writing any meaningful description of the problem. If the respective reports of the

two groups of counselors contained an occasional deviation from good reporting represented by limited notations there would be no point in mentioning such isolated instances. However, it was consistently found that the Eastern men wrote fewer notes and were less likely to describe a problem completely than the Andover Newton men. Certainly one cannot account for this situation by saying that one group is more industrious than the other. The inference is drawn, then, that for the purposes of this study Andover Newton graduates recognized both the value and the necessity of describing an interview more in detail than did the Eastern graduates. Also, could it be that these graduates reported in superior fashion because they have a better understanding of, and are more highly skilled in, the counseling process?

REASONS FOR NOT COOPERATING IN THE STUDY

From the counselors' expressed reasons for declining to participate in this study of counseling procedures, certain inferences can be drawn that reveal, to some extent, these persons' evaluation of the value and character of the counseling process.

Letters were received from many of the men who were invited to participate, in which they explained their reasons for not being able to cooperate. A few of these reasons will be examined. To that end the essential parts of various letters will be set down. The first will be from an Andover Newton graduate.

Letter 1

Thank you for your letter asking me to participate in a study on counseling theories and procedures. I find, however, it best to refuse since I am quite young and do relatively little counseling at present. Otherwise I would be most happy to cooperate.

This letter sounds strange. The pastor is a college and seminary graduate which means he must have been about twenty-four years old when he graduated from seminary. He has been in the active ministry about two years so it can be concluded that his age is approximately twenty-six. No one would deny the youth of the minister but it does seem unusual that, in view of his training (he has had clinical training) he would not have a different viewpoint. One should imagine that his youthfulness would bring many young people for interviews.

We shall now examine certain letters from graduates of Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary.

Letter 1

I am afraid that I can be of little help to you in connection with your counseling study. I do not seem to have the opportunity for personal counseling which is involved in your study, and therefore, I am returning the materials which you sent to me.

This man had agreed to participate so he was sent the counseling forms which he returned with the above-mentioned letter. The astounding aspect of his reply is realized when one reads in the left-hand corner of the letterhead, "Rev. _____, Director of Christian Education and Youth Activities." And he holds this responsibility in one of the largest cities in the United States. The present writer served in a similar capacity for the same denomination in the city of Detroit, Michigan. In light of such experience it is very difficult to see how there would be no opportunity for personal counseling. Perhaps it depends on one's definition of counseling.

Letter 2

Please forgive me for not answering your letter of August 12 in a reasonable time. I was not sure of the mind of the Lord in the matter, but I should have written sooner and told you that.

It may now be too late for me to participate, but I leave that decision up to you in the light of the following, also:

- First: The Lord's work through us here is still very very small numerically, although we are beginning to see His wonderful blessing spiritually. It would be possible that I would have no counseling situations during the period between October 1 and November 30, (except for soul-winning, and I assume you meant instead the personal-problem type of counseling.) Unless the Lord led me into counseling situations during that period, I would be unable to give a report, since I must follow His leading. The Lord has used me recently in two or three counseling situations, but the future is in His Hands.
- Second: You mention that Eastern men have had rather limited formal training in counseling. This is not true of those who have elected the courses which deal with counseling in the Christian Education department under Dr. _____. Dr. _____ may not be aware of the extensive amount of formal training in counseling given in these courses. It is my feeling that those seminaries which offer extensive formal counseling would be at least matched in material covered, by anyone electing a large number of these courses in the C. E. department, as I did.
- Third: At one time I used to a considerable extent the theories and methods taught by these C. E. courses, at least in group work. However, since then I have completely rejected them, believing that basically they are a substitution of Psychology for the Word of God, and of group dynamics for the work of The Holy Spirit. I hasten to add that I know they are not meant to be that, and I am casting no reflection on a fine man like Dr. _____. Nor am I saying that there are not certain facts which Psychology has discovered. But I am saying that the conscious or unconscious use of any system, theory, technique, or method in counseling is contrary to the Word and Work of Christ, which He wishes to bring to bear on the needy individual.

Therefore I do not believe in Pastoral Counseling courses. I believe that it would be possible to help pastors to be better counselors in the Lord, but not by pastoral counseling courses or practicums.

To be a good counselor, a man needs to know Jesus well, to be saturated with a thorough and experiential (I prefer this word to the word experimental) knowledge of the Bible, God's infallible Word, and then when God gives him an opportunity to council [sic], to yield himself completely to the Holy Spirit and pray continually

so that he will be under the moment by moment direction of the One whom Jesus tells us is The Counsellor, (John 16:13) and this Perfect Counsellor will then take the Word which He Himself has given (the Bible) and apply the appropriate passages to the needy heart.

One might say that this is my theory of counseling. But he would be mistaken, because it is instead the teaching of the Word of God-- and that is not theory.

I do not think that answers from the Word of God on counseling would fit very well into a set of questions framed on the basis of "the field" of pastoral counseling as it is usually understood. A distorted picture would be the result, since the mind of man (his theories) and the Word of God (the Bible) do not mix. However, if the questions are so framed that a consistent Biblical picture could be presented, then I will be happy to participate, subject to your decision on the basis of all that has been said thus far in the letter.

Is it necessary to make any comment? In all fairness to the splendid administrators and faculty members of Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary it must be acknowledged that the one who wrote this letter is far from a typical representative of the Seminary.

A letter in reply was sent along with the counseling forms but they soon were returned blank. Another letter from the pastor in question explained that he could not participate in the study because of the writer's unchristian view of the gospel ministry and his unscriptural concept of the Christian life. His particular objections centered about the use of the word "religious" rather than "Christianity" when the question was asked, "How would you rate the client's attitude toward religion?"

Letter 3

I regret very much saying that I would share with you the problems of my constituency. It was not until I began to put their secrets down on paper that I realized that the matters were personal and not to be shared. Pastors receive much in the way of confidence and I would not destroy that relationship.

In matters of counseling, it is my opinion that there is too much emphasis placed upon psychology and its kindred subjects.

It has been my experience that the basic need of every individual has been met when they accept the Lord Jesus Christ as their Savior and then yield themselves to Him as the blood brought children of God.

The Victorious Christian Life as set forth by the Apostle Paul in Romans and in Ephesians, once entered into has proved to be the answer in every case. Prayer and the feeding of the soul upon God's Holy Word have changed weak, defeated souls into glorious, happy Christians.

I find that ignorance of the Word, lack of prayer tend to produce weak Christians. But healthy happy Christians are not so often defeated, they can meet the temptations of the day, they can engage in spiritual warfare and come away victorious.

Most cases of a spiritual origin, or due to a lack of a spiritual relationship with Almighty God, are resolved when men and women are made to see their own inadequacy and the need of a Savior. God has answered prayer and has given us some mighty victories but as you say in your questionnaire they are highly confidential. If God has forgiven their sins and promises to forget them to remember them no more, I think I should also.

Apparently this young man believes that reporting an interview, in which certain problems and misdemeanors are mentioned, is equivalent to not forgiving the client. He could have given fictitious names or assigned the clients' numbers in order to hide their identity. His letter also indicates the idea that counseling is trespassing upon the prerogatives of God. This letter like the one that immediately precedes needs little or no comment.

SUMMARY

Two factors, amount and detail of description, plus reasons for refusing to cooperate in the study are indicative, by inference in some cases, of a given pastor's attitude toward the character and importance of counseling. As a basic component of his work a minister reveals, not only his philosophy of counseling but his competence fairly well by the manner in which he records his interviews.

The reasons for refusing to participate in the study, as indicated in the foregoing letters, likewise give a rather accurate view of the value attached to, and the type of, counseling one might expect to find if he were to observe the letter writers in their counseling roles.

CHAPTER VI

CONCLUSIONS

The hypothesis is supported that the graduates of Andover Newton Theological School as a group adhere to philosophies and methods of counseling which are more consonant with currently acceptable counseling techniques than do those of Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary.

This conclusion is evident from a very thorough analysis of 218 interviews submitted by fifty-three counselors who were graduated from Andover Newton Theological School, and 203 submitted by fifty-eight counselors graduated from Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary. These interviews were judged in the following manner:

The writer selected a random sample of the interviews submitted by twenty-six counselors from Andover Newton Theological School and twenty-nine counselors from Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary. These interviews, in the light of certain criteria, were then rated by the writer as "good," "questionable," or "poor." The criteria were selected on the basis of the writer's general acquaintance with the field of counseling which is the result of academic training and practical experience as a pastor, camp director, army chaplain, college dean, and counselor one summer in the Counseling Laboratory at the University of Michigan. Assistance in the formulation of a list of criteria was also derived from Carl R. Rogers', Counseling and Psychotherapy, and Seward Hiltner's text, Pastoral Counseling. It seemed wise to include some criteria which were

accepted by an authority in the field of pastoral counseling since practically all of the participants in the study would be functioning as pastoral counselors. The criteria are as follows:

1. Identification of the Real Problem
2. Clarification of the Problem
3. Encouragement of Free Expression of Feelings
4. Absence of Moralizing or Preaching
5. Appropriate Use of the Resources of the Christian Faith
6. Identification of the Client's Need with His Problem
7. Helping the Client Help Himself
8. The Ability to Recognize the Need for a Referral

The interviews constituting the random sample were then distributed to three persons who have had training in counseling. Two of them have graduate degrees in counseling and the third is a college and seminary graduate who had courses in pastoral counseling at an institution other than the two represented in this study. These three persons then independently rated the counselors as "good," "questionable," or "poor." They, of course, had no previous knowledge of the ratings assigned by the writer. The agreement between the "three-person" evaluation and that of the writer was statistically computed by the Spearman-Brown formula. The amount of agreement between the group of three raters and the writer produced a coefficient of .74. As a result of a thorough study of each counselor's interviews in the light of the established criteria and statistical findings, it was possible to rate the 111 counselors and place them in one of three categories.

Since it would be monotonous and repetitious to analyze all of the interviews of every counselor it was decided to select certain

counselors and analyze chosen interviews. Written analyses of the interviews of thirty-eight counselors are to be found in the study. This selection gives an indication of the types of interviews that generally are included in each of the three categories.

The counselors from Andover Newton were rated as follows:

	No.	Pct.
Good	35	66
Questionable	12	23
Poor	<u>6</u> 53	<u>11</u> 100

The counselors from Eastern were rated as follows:

	No.	Pct.
Good	8	14
Questionable	18	31
Poor	<u>32</u> 58	<u>55</u> 100

The statistical data show that there is little difference between the graduates of the two schools in the amount of talking during the interview by the counselor and by the client ($x^2 = 1.87$, not significant), the attitudes of counselor and client toward each other (counselor's attitude toward client-- $x^2 = 3.941$, not significant: client's attitude toward counselor-- $x^2 = 2.970$, not significant), number of interviews ($x^2 = .728$, not significant), and the types and frequencies of the problems confronted (Rank-difference correlation coefficient of .80). An investigation of all of the data that were gathered and analyzed makes it possible to conclude that regardless of the amount or type of their theological training most ministers, if not by their own choice then by the very needs and insistence of the people to whom they minister, are compelled to be counselors.

In view of the above facts it seems logically imperative that theological schools that do not offer much training in the field of counseling should seriously consider the inclusion of such training in their curriculums.

FURTHER RESEARCH

As a result of the study the writer believes that genuine profit might come from an investigation of the theological aspects of pastoral counseling. Some of the Andover Newton men appeared to miss opportunities to use theology and the resources of the Christian faith, while Eastern men occasionally seemed to introduce aspects of the Christian faith in an irrelevant manner. How does a pastor utilize theology in a meaningful fashion in the counseling situation?

An analysis of 421 interviews revealed only one counselor who indicated a relationship between his counseling and his preaching ministry. As an outcome of a counseling experience he preached a series of sermons on a subject that he believed must be disturbing to a number of persons in his congregation. This leads one to the question of group counseling. Most of the ministers who responded interpreted the counseling function as one pertaining to individuals rather than to groups. A study of the role of the minister in working with groups should present many helpful suggestions.

Closely related to the above problem is another which might be of value to investigate. An intensive study might be attempted to discover the practicality of using psychodrama or sociodrama as a tool in the therapeutic ministry of the church.

APPENDIX A

TABLE I

SIGNIFICANCE OF DIFFERENCE BETWEEN NUMBER
OF RESPONDENTS WHO ACTUALLY REPORTED
AND THOSE WHO AGREED TO REPORT

	Andover Newton	Eastern	
Agreed to participate	87	88	175
Actually participated	53	58	111
Total	140	146	286

$f_e - 86$	ratios - .011	
$f_e - 54$	.018	df = 1
$f_e - 89$	.011	Not significant
$f_e - 57$	<u>.017</u>	
	.057	<u>$\chi^2 = .057$</u>

TABLE II
SIGNIFICANCE OF DIFFERENCE BETWEEN
THE NUMBER OF COUNSELORS AND THE
NUMBER OF INTERVIEWS REPORTED

	Andover Newton	Eastern	
Number of counselors	53	58	111
Number of interviews	218	203	421
Total	271	261	532

$f_e - 57$	ratios - .280	
$f_e - 214$	.075	df = 1
$f_e - 54$	.296	Not significant
$f_e - 207$	$\frac{.077}{.728}$	$\chi^2 = .728$

TABLE III
SIGNIFICANCE OF DIFFERENCE IN THE
CLINICAL TRAINING OF THE TWO
GROUPS OF PARTICIPANTS

Clinical Training	Andover Newton	Eastern	
Yes	50	7	57
No	3	51	54
Total	53	58	111

$f_e - 27$	ratios - 19.59	
$f_e - 26$	20.34	df = 1
$f_e - 30$	17.63	Significant at .01
$f_e - 28$	$\frac{18.89}{76.45}$	$\chi^2 = 76.45$

TABLE IV

SIGNIFICANCE OF DIFFERENCE IN THE AMOUNT
OF TALKING DURING THE INTERVIEW BY
THE COUNSELOR AND BY THE CLIENT

Spoke more during the interview	Andover Newton	Eastern	
Client	171	133	304
Counselor	47	50	97
Total	218	183	401

 $f_e - 165$

ratios - .20

 $f_e - 53$

.68

df = 1

 $f_e - 138$

.18

Not significant

 $f_e - 44$

$$\frac{.81}{1.87}$$
 $\chi^2 = 1.87$

TABLE V

SIGNIFICANCE OF DIFFERENCE IN CLIENTS' ATTITUDES
TOWARD COUNSELORS--ANDOVER NEWTON AND EASTERN

Clients' attitude toward counselor	Andover Newton	Eastern	
Amiable	117	111	228
Sympathetic	30	35	65
Hostile	6	7	13
Resentful	1	3	4
Uncertain	43	35	78
Total	197	191	388

$f_e - 116$	$f_e - 112$	ratios - .008	
		.272	df = 4
$f_e - 33$	$f_e - 32$	.142	
		.5	Not significant
$f_e - 7$	$f_e - 5$	.222	
		.009	$\chi^2 = 2.970$
$f_e - 2$	$f_e - 2$	.281	
		.8	
$f_e - 40$	$f_e - 38$	.5	
		.236	
		<u>2.970</u>	

TABLE VI

SIGNIFICANCE OF DIFFERENCE IN COUNSELORS'
 ATTITUDES TOWARD CLIENTS
 --ANDOVER NEWTON AND EASTERN

Counselors' attitude toward client	Andover Newton	Eastern	
Amiable	85	79	164
Sympathetic	100	95	195
Hostile	8	2	10
Resentful	1	1	2
Uncertain	15	17	32
Total	209	194	403

$f_e - 85$	$f_e - 79$	ratios - 0.	
		.009	df = 4
$f_e - 101$	$f_e - 94$	1.8	
		0.	Not significant
$f_e - 5$	$f_e - 5$	.062	
		0.	$\chi^2 = 3.941$
$f_e - 1$	$f_e - 1$	.010	
		1.8	
$f_e - 15$	$f_e - 15$	0.	
		.26	
		<u>3.941</u>	

TABLE VII

SIGNIFICANCE OF DIFFERENCE IN THE USE OF
PRAYER DURING THE INTERVIEW BY THE
TWO GROUPS OF RESPONDENTS

Prayed during interview	Andover Newton	Eastern	
Yes	95	154	249
No	123	49	172
Total	218	203	421

 $f_e - 129$

ratios - 8.96

 $f_e - 89$

12.98

df = 1

 $f_e - 120$

9.62

Significant at .01

 $f_e - 81$

$$\frac{12.64}{44.20}$$

$$\underline{\underline{x^2 = 44.20}}$$

TABLE VIII

SIGNIFICANCE OF DIFFERENCE IN THE USE OF THE
BIBLE DURING THE INTERVIEW BY THE
TWO GROUPS OF RESPONDENTS

Bible reference used	Andover Newton	Eastern	
Yes	21	61	82
No	197	142	339
Total	218	203	421

 $f_e - 42$

ratios - 10.50

 $f_e - 176$

2.50

 $df = 1$
 $f_e - 40$

11.02

Significant at .01

 $f_e - 163$
 $\frac{2.70}{26.72}$
 $\underline{\underline{x^2 = 26.72}}$

TABLE IX

SIGNIFICANCE OF DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE NUMBER
OF REQUESTS FOR ANOTHER INTERVIEW
BY CLIENTS AND BY COUNSELORS

Person requesting	Andover Newton	Eastern	
Client	122	88	210
Counselor	100	111	211
Total	222	199	421

 $f_e - 111$

ratios - 1.09

 $f_e - 111$

.009

df = 1

 $f_e - 99$

1.09

Significant at .15

 $f_e - 100$

$$\frac{.009}{2.198}$$

$$\underline{\chi^2 = 2.198}$$

TABLE X

TEST OF THE SIGNIFICANCES OF DIFFERENCE BETWEEN
THE CLASSIFICATION OF ANDOVER NEWTON AND
EASTERN COUNSELORS ACCORDING TO THE
RATINGS OF THEIR INTERVIEWS

Classification	Andover Newton	Eastern	Combined
Poor	6	32	38
Questionable	12	18	30
Good	35	8	43
Total	53	58	111

$f_e - 18$	ratios - 24.00	
$f_e - 15$	.60	df = 2
$f_e - 20$	11.25	Significant at .01
$f_e - 20$	7.20	
$f_e - 16$	.56	
$f_e - 38$	$\frac{25.29}{68.90}$	$\chi^2 = 68.90$

APPENDIX B. INTERVIEW REPORT FORM

(To be filled out immediately following interview)

Client's name (real or fictitious) _____

Age _____ Sex M ___ F ___ Marital status Married ___ Single ___ Divorced ___

Religious Affiliation _____ Is the client a member of your

church or organization? Yes ___ No ___. How long have you known the

client? _____ Did you ask the client to come to see

you? Yes ___ No ___ What interview is this? (1st, 2nd, 3rd, etc.) _____

Please describe the problem that the client brought to you.

When the client first explained his problem do you think he revealed
that which really disturbed him? Yes ___ No ___

If not, what in your opinion, was his real problem? _____

If you gave no direct advice what did you do? _____

Who did most of the talking during the interview? Counselor ___ Client ___

How would you describe your feelings toward the client?

Amiable ___ Sympathetic ___ Hostile ___ Resentful ___ Uncertain ___

How would you describe the client's feeling toward you?

Amiable ___ Sympathetic ___ Hostile ___ Resentful ___ Uncertain ___

Did you pray with the client? Yes ___ No ___ Did you read the Bible?

Yes ___ No ___

What do you consider to be the client's greatest need? _____

How long did the interview last? _____

How did the client's attitude affect you? _____

Did you ask the client to come back to see you? Yes ____ No ____

How would you rate the client's attitude toward religion?

Antagonistic ____ Opposed ____ Neutral ____ Favorable ____ Highly favorable ____

Did you refer the client to anyone? (Physician, psychologist, social worker, lawyer, etc.) _____

Do you keep records of counseling interviews? Yes ____ No ____

(Please write any other pertinent information on the back of this sheet)
Please send postcard to Dean George E. Riday, Alderson-Broadus College,
Philippi, West Virginia, if additional interview report forms are needed.

If you have verbatim interviews you would care to send they will be appreciated.

APPENDIX C. COUNSELOR INFORMATION SHEET

(Please be as accurate as possible. This information is strictly confidential)

Name _____ Age _____

Address _____ City _____ State _____

Present occupation Pastor _____ Hospital Chaplain _____ Armed Service Chaplain _____ Teacher _____ Other _____ (If, other, please describe)

How long have you been in the active ministry? _____

What undergraduate college did you attend?
College _____ Major _____ Minor _____ Degree date _____

What graduate school or seminary did you attend?
Graduate School or Seminary _____ Major _____ Minor _____ Degree date _____

Please list the courses you have had in counseling or psychology.
(List on back if necessary)

Title of Course	Hours Credit	Title of Course	Hours Credit
-----------------	--------------	-----------------	--------------

_____	_____	_____	_____
_____	_____	_____	_____

Have you ever had any clinical training in counseling? (Hospital or some other institution) Yes _____ No _____

Where? _____ How long? _____

Please list the books in counseling or related fields that you have read in the past five years. Books such as The Art of Ministering to the Sick, Cabot and Dicks; Pastoral Counseling, Hiltner; Our Inner Conflicts, Horney; Counseling and Psychotherapy, Rogers; etc.

_____	_____
_____	_____
_____	_____

(Please list additional pertinent information on the back of the sheet)

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Blood, Robert O., Anticipating Your Marriage. Glencoe, Illinois: The Free Press, 1955.
- English, O. Spurgeon, and Pearson, H. J., Emotional Problems of Living. Revised edition; New York: W. W. Norton Company, Inc., 1955.
- Hiltner, Seward, Pastoral Counseling. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1949.
- Johnson, Paul E., Psychology of Pastoral Care. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1953.
- Leshner, Everett B., Strength in our Sickness. New York: Federal Council, 1947.
- Mills, Paul C., "An Evaluation of the Clinical Pastoral Training Program at Andover Newton Theological School with some Suggestions for Teaching Techniques in the Seminar Sessions." Unpublished S.T.M. thesis, Andover Newton Theological School, 1954.
- Noyes, Arthur P., Modern Clinical Psychiatry. Philadelphia: W. B. Saunders Company, 1953.
- Rogers, Carl R., Counseling and Psychotherapy. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1942.

Other Sources

- Andover Newton Bulletin. Newton Centre, Massachusetts: (No. 3; February, 1951), Vol. XLIII; (No. 2; February, 1948), Vol. XL; (No. 2; February, 1949), Vol. XLI; (No. 2; December, 1949), Vol. XLII; (No. 2; December, 1953), Vol. XLVI.
- Eastern Baptist Bulletin. Overbrook, Pennsylvania: (March, 1955), Vol. XXX.