Negative microfilm received from university

Mic 61-2794

SMITH, Marguerite Anderson. COMPLIANCE AND DEFIANCE AS IT RELATES TO ROLE CONFLICT IN WOMEN.

University of Michigan, Ph.D., 1961
Psychology, clinical

University Microfilms, Inc., Ann Arbor, Michigan

COMPLIANCE AND DEFIANCE AS IT RELATES TO ROLE CONFLICT IN WOMEN

by
Marguerite Anderson Smith

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree
of Doctor of Philosophy in
The University of Michigan
1961

Doctoral Committee:

Associate Professor Joseph B. Adelson, Chairman
Professor Robert C. Angell
Doctor Gerald Gurin
Assistant Professor Sarnoff A. Mednick

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author wishes to express her gratitude to Dr. Joseph Adelson, Dr. Gerald Gurin, Dr. Robert Angell, and Dr. Sarnoff Mednick for their help and encouragement throughout the preparation of this thesis. She would particularly like to thank Dr. Adelson and Dr. Gurin for many hours of patient discussion during the planning and development of the research.

This research was supported in part by the Monteith Study Program of Wayne State University. The author would like to express her indebtedness to Dr. Carol Kaye, director of this program, for the opportunity to undertake this research in conjunction with that program, and for her continued help and advice throughout the course of the study.

The author would also like to thank Dr. Daniel Katz for many helpful suggestions in the planning stages of the research.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS		ii
LIST OF TABLES		iv
CHAPTER		
I.	THE PROBLEM AND ITS THEORETICAL SETTING	1
II.	DESIGN AND EXPERIMENTAL PROCEDURES	17
III.	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION OF GROUP I HYPOTHESES	30
IV.	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION OF GROUP II HYPOTHESES: ROLE VARIABLES	52
V.	SUMMARY AND IMPLICATIONS	79
APPENDIX		
A.	QUESTIONS FROM THE INTERVIEW SCHEDULE AND PERSONAL HISTORY QUESTIONNAIRE	91
B.	CODING CRITERIA AND DISTRIBUTION FOR TESTS AND SCALES	111
BIBLIOGRAPHY		128

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE		Page
1.	Distribution of Probabilities Associated with the Compliance-Defiance (C-D) Correlations	28
2.	Distribution of Probabilities Associated with the Impulse Expression Scale (IES) Correlations	28
3.	Relationship of Compliance-Defiance and IES to Hypothesis II: Masochistic Orientation	37
4.	Relationship of Compliance-Defiance and IES to Hypothesis III: Narcissism-Exhibitionism	40
5.	Relationship of Compliance-Defiance and IES to Hypothesis IV: Sexual Identification	42
6.	Relationship of Compliance-Defiance and IES to Measures of Hypothesis V: Superego	47
7.	Relationship of Compliance-Defiance and IES to Hypothesis VI: Ambitions in Addition to Marriage	53
8.	Relationship of Compliance-Defiance and IES to Measures of Hypothesis VII: Education Plans	57

TABLE Page

9. Interaction of Social Class with Compliance-Defiance in Relation to Education versus Not-Education As a Future Occupation 61

10. Relationship of Compliance-Defiance to Attitudes toward Working Mothers As Expressed by the Daughters of Working Mothers 63

11. Relationship of Compliance-Defiance and IES to Measures of Hypothesis VIII: Feminine Interests 66

12. Relationship of Compliance-Defiance and IES to Measures of Hypothesis IX: Competition with Men 67

13. Relationship of Compliance-Defiance and IES to Measures of Hypothesis X: Expected Behavior 69

14. Relationship of Compliance-Defiance and IES to Measures of Hypothesis XI with Respect to Social Class 71

CHAPTER I

THE PROBLEM AND ITS THEORETICAL SETTING

Role conflict, when it occurs in men, can usually be attributed to some highly individual circumstance which is largely extraneous to the general cultural norms and expectations. For example, economic difficulties, dissatisfaction with one's career choice, or inability to gain admittance into the desired occupational group, are representative of some of the common sources of men's role conflict.

While such factors are, of course, applicable to women, they are often secondary to another and more general circumstance—one that is not extraneous to cultural norms and expectations, but which forms an integral part of these norms. When one considers cultural expectations regarding women's roles, two divergent role images emerge: one of the wife and mother, and the other of the career woman. While the adoption of a dual adult role (husband and father, and career man) is consonant with cultural expectations for men, no such consonance is present in the adoption of a comparable dual role by women. The two roles—wife and mother, and career woman—are rarely seen as overlapping by society at large. For instance, society may condemn the "working mother" at the same time that an appeal for women to enter a large variety of work areas continually increases. Such attitudes tend to create an ambiguity regarding role expectations in women.

This conflict, presented as a cultural circumstance, must, of course, be considered here in the context of American society. In cultures with different values and institutions, the expectations surrounding women's roles may present no such conflict over adoption of a dual role. In Russia, for example, where expectations concerning women in working roles seem not to differ from those of men, this kind of ambiguity in role expectations may not arise. Zilboorg cites the Russian birth-rate as evidence of the lack of conflict over the merging of working and mothering roles in that society. He says:

> On the other hand, in Russia, where for the past twenty-five years women have lived on the basis of full equality with man in politics, in science, in the factory, and on the farm, the birthrate has not fallen but has been high enough to increase the Russian population to the level it had attained before the first World War. . . . Evidently, the "masculine" gains of women were not accompanied here by a corresponding reduction of her fundamental libidinous drives to become a mother; nor did these gains interfere with actual gratification of these drives [Zilboorg], 1944, p. 265].

One would assume that the merging of the two roles is directly related to the attitudes of the culture. In a culture where these attitudes are ambiguous, the merging of the two roles would remain primarily an individual adaptation. In such a situation the possibility of conflict over adjustment to divergent role images would be expected to be much more prevalent than in the situation where such adjustments are supported by the general culture.

In American society, it seems probable that ambiguous attitudes concerning the feminine role exist more clearly in the social norms and expectations of the middle class. Apart from the general freedom from sanctions that great wealth allows in all cultures, the upper class of American culture has always been relatively free

of the constraints of child-rearing in that it is expected that adjuncts to the parent role in the form of governesses, tutors, private schools, and the like, will be provided. In the lowest class, on the other hand, freedom from the sanctions of the middle-class ideals of family life is granted on the basis of economic necessity. In the lower-class family, the working mother occupies a position that permits and encourages her to work (perhaps largely on the assumption that she does so against her will) for the purpose of maintaining the family unit. There is, in any case, no overt conflict over working versus not-working, when the choice does not exist.

The feminine role-conflict, in this society, then, may be largely relevant to that segment of the population where the economic level is such as not to require the woman to leave the home to work, while it does not reach a level where adequate substitutes for the parent roles can be satisfactorily applied, or are expected as a matter of course. If this is so, it would mean that the hypotheses upon which this study is based are primarily relevant to the middle-class woman.

There is, however, another factor to be considered. The very ambiguity that perpetuates the conflicting role images for the individual woman may also provide the means for her individual role adjustment, in terms of the values of the society. For example, the same mass media (magazines, radio, television) that project the image of the family-oriented wife and mother as the dominantly-valued role of women in our society, give countless examples of individual solutions to the merging of working and mothering roles. Flexibility of role adaptations thus becomes a secondary feature of the national cultural expectations. Since the mass media are available to all classes of society, it may be assumed that awareness of

flexibility of role adaptations is conveyed in some degree throughout all classes of the society.

It is for this reason that personality variables were introduced in this study of role conflict. The variety of adjustments open to the young woman in our society leads to the assumption that in some degree the particular choice an individual woman makes regarding her future must be related to some characteristics of her personality structure. The role itself presents a variety of problems; the society provides a variety of solutions. It is reasonable to assume that different personality types will respond differently to both. This thesis is devoted to trying out some of the particular personality variables that may add to our understanding of how the individual woman may react to the conflicting role images.

One might expect that conflict resulting from ambiguous expectations concerning the future would be particularly salient in young women just entering college. For these young women, the choice, if a choice is to be made, would be a present and relevant feature of their educational plans.

The study was therefore designed to explore the nature of role conflict, as it manifests itself in the goal orientations of freshman college women, and to relate this to some characteristics of personality structure and development derived from psychoanalytic theory.

Theoretical Background

According to psychoanalytic theory, individuals fixated at the later anal stage (the so-called anal-retentive) differ characterologically from those fixated at the earlier anal stage (the so-called anal-expulsive). These may be seen as the extremes of a continuum to which, by the nature of the characteristics to be described

below, the terms "compliance" and "defiance" may be applied, as representing a dominant orientation of the individual to his environment.

Characteristics of the Compliant individual

The characteristics of the Compliant (or anal-retentive) type are those which, in the extreme, describe the obsessional neuroses. The characteristic form of ego organization of individuals fixated at this stage involve, primarily, the development of defenses against aggressive, sadistic impulses. The prominent defenses of this group are reaction-formation, undoing, isolation, and intellectualization.

Historically, aggressive impulses arising from the parental demands for regularity and cleanliness are controlled by making "a virtue out of necessity," as Abraham says (1953a, p. 373), and identifying with the educator's demands. The sacrifice of omnipotence is compensated for by pleasure in achievement, by being "good," and thus winning parental approval and praise.

The maintenance of these defenses, however, results, in varying degree, in a loss of adaptive flexibility, particularly in the affective sphere. Such individuals are generally rigid, conforming, and authority oriented. They tend to hold up definite standards of behavior for themselves and to maintain these with considerable obstinacy.

Due to the nature of the defense structure that makes intellecual activity relatively conflict-free, the cognitive style of this group tends to be directed toward organization and elaboration rather then inspirational and creative, or "original" thought. The essential conservatism and conventionalism that characterizes the intellectual activity carries over into the area of goals and

ambitions and in the general social adaptation of the individual. Such individuals are little interested in moving outside the conventional role society provides.

Retentiveness and possessiveness, often associated with this type of individual, may be presumed to show themselves in an orientation toward goals of acquiring standard "middle-class" status symbols (own home, husband, children, adequate income, etc.) and a prematurely "jelled" life plan.

Characteristics of the Defiant individual

The characteristics of the Defiant (or anal-expulsive) type are not as easy to categorize as those of the Compliant type—perhaps reflecting the relative disorder and lack of organization of the personality of the individuals themselves.

Fixation at the earlier stage of the anal period means that defenses against aggressive, sadistic impulses are not so well developed, nor omnipotence wishes so completely given up, as in individuals fixated at the later stage. The Defiant type tends to be more impulsive and more rebellious, more often unrealistic about her goals and more unable to adapt to the demands of social conformity.

The dominant defenses of this group are aim-inhibition and displacement. Denial and repression are also prominent. There is a continuation of the infantile struggle between parent and child over the issue of aggression. This relative failure to neutralize aggressive energy probably results in an occasional break-through of the aggression as well as a tendency to feelings of depression or a somewhat depressed attitude toward life and its problems.

The continuation of the struggle over aggression in relation to the parents results in a different and less adequate solution of the oedipus conflict. Unresolved aggressive, hostile impulses toward the mother tend to prevent identification with her and thus with the feminine position as a whole. At the same time, and for the same reason, competition with the mother is accentuated. The result may be a more pronounced identification with the father, or the father's goals, especially with the autonomous aspects of masculinity, and thus with masculine aims and values.

However, competition with the mother for the father's affection and attention requires that the girl compete with the mother as a woman. Thus the more provocative and exhibitionistic aspects of femininity are accentuated. These may later, probably depending upon the degree of the rejection of basic femininity, be put to sadistic use as a defense against envy of masculine autonomy, or against the threat of sexuality. Since the identification with the father can be only partially realized, the girl will, at some point, be disappointed in her attempt to maintain a masculine identification. A great deal of the hostility and resentment felt toward the mother may then be transferred to men. The girl identifies with and competes with different aspects of each parent. An ambiguous identification is developed and maintained, and the conflict remains relatively overt.

Because the Compliant girl will adapt herself to the "traditional" feminine role in this society, she may appear far less conflicted than the Defiant girl. This is, of course, true to the extent that the fixation occurred at a higher level of maturity in the development of the personality, and, additionally, in that such an individual may find more channels of conflict-free expression open to her. But the freedom from conflict may be more apparent than

real. For example, in giving in to the mother's demands, the girl may retreat from any competition with her and also from a widening exploration of the environment. At the later oedipal stage, the girl may retreat from the rivalry with the mother for the father's love. Thus, the identification with the mother and her aims and goals may be made at a cost of a solution of the oedipus conflict which achieves a real change of love-object from the mother to the father (Freud, 1953b, p. 258).

In view of the surface adoption of the feminine role, this level of conflict is relatively hard to tap. However, one possible avenue might be found in what Sanford calls "a premature and brittle structuring of the personality" (Sanford et al., 1957, p. 1). This might be reflected in a reduction of the ability to expand horizons in such areas as role adaptation, political beliefs, religious affiliations, experimentation with social groups other than the "approved" one—in short, in too much conformity.

In Defiant girls, the conflict may be more readily observable. The characteristic rebelliousness may be detected in a rejection of the traditional feminine role, and in an erratic life pattern. For example, she may choose a career-line that is more commonly regarded as masculine; she may show bitterness and resentment over the perceived "secondary" role of women in the culture; she may combine a more overt conflict in the sexual area with sexually provocative behavior. There may be an inconsistent or even rejecting attitude toward marriage and a family. On the other hand, there may be more access to genuine emotional involvement. Emotions may have a more determinant role in the behavioral choices of such individuals than intellect, thereby contributing to the erraticness of the life pattern. One might expect that problems in the area of sexual identification and increased conflict in adjustment

to the perceived social role would be more prominent in such individuals.

The hypotheses of this study are based on the differential manifestation of adaptation of these two types of individuals (Compliant and Defiant) to the perception of their eventual social role. The hypotheses concern primarily the relationship of the personality variables to anticipated role adaptations. The young women who form the sample of this study are not currently involved in either role (wife and mother or career woman), nor, presumably, will they be for some few years to come. The primary concern, then, might be stated as one of the relation of the different personality types toward a beginning awareness of these roles and of the possibility of conflict arising from incompatible goals. In view of the fact that the study does not directly involve the content of the role nor the role performance itself, literature on social role and role conflict was considered outside the central concern of the study and is not discussed in this thesis.

Since a major technique for assessing personality dynamics (and the one that is used in this research) is projective testing, a word should be said about some of the problems connected with the use of this technique. One of the major difficulties in making predictions to behavior from a dimension of personality is that one cannot infer a one-to-one relationship between these underlying impulses and defenses and their behavioral expression. Projective testing may reflect personality variables of varying depth in terms of the total personality structure. This means that such personality variables may be further removed from overt behavior. In making predictions from such measures, more inference is needed in regard to the behavioral expression of the trait. At any given time, other internal variables will be interacting with the particular

syndrome under consideration.[1] In addition to variations in internal dynamics, features of the environment, such as family pressures, peer-group standards, academic standing, economic status, or simply age, may be differentially salient at any given time in the life experience of the individual. It is logical to assume that such variables may interact in such a way as to mask or reduce the emergence in a given situation of any particular conflict area. The basic assumption in undertaking such a study is that, when the conflict area is relevant, a noticeable effect will occur wherever the situation allows for its expression; that is, apart from areas where other defense structures, or life events overshadow it.

In a given population, not all individuals will manifest enough conflict in any one area to make a neat division into two "types." One would expect that there would be a sizable group for whom this particular conflict area is irrelevant. The predictive hypotheses of such a study as the present one therefore apply only to that segment of the total population for which this conflict area is relevant, and are not intended to apply to that segment of the population for which the conflict area is not an emergent aspect of the personality.

Hypotheses

The hypotheses of this study are divided into two general groups. Group I hypotheses concern the personality characteristics that are predicted to be correlates of the Compliant and Defiant

---

[1] An attempt to indicate one of the major interactive patterns appeared above in the discussion of the effect of the Defiant and Compliant orientations on the solution of the oedipus conflict.

dimension and which are assumed, therefore, to underlie the differential role orientations of the two types of individuals. This group of hypotheses represents an attempt to assess the association of Compliance and Defiance with such other aspects of the personality as masochism and sado-masochism, narcissism-exhibitionism, impulse expression, submissiveness, sexual identification, and one aspect of the superego, namely, degree of internalization of the behavioral standards of the parents.

Group I hypotheses

Hypothesis I. Compliance is associated with constriction of impulse expression, whereas Defiance is associated with lability of impulse expression.

Hypothesis II. Compliance is associated with a masochistic orientation.

Hypothesis III. Compliance is associated with non-erotized narcissism-exhibitionism, while Defiance is associated with erotized narcissism-exhibitionism.

Hypothesis IV. Compliance is associated with feminine sexual identification, whereas Defiance is associated with an ambivalent or conflicted sexual identification.

Hypothesis V. Compliance is associated with a strongly internalized superego, while Defiance is associated with a more unformed, incompletely internalized superego.

Since Hypothesis V relates to a general area that is somewhat more difficult to translate into empirical terms, data from several questions were used to test it. A series of predictions were made concerning these questions through which the assessment of support for the hypothesis could be made. The questions and the rationale behind their choice as measures may be found in Appendix A. The predictions are as follows.

1. Compliant girls indicate general family encouragement to come to college, whereas Defiant girls more often cite a particular individual as the source of encouragement.

2. Compliant girls more often state that they are "on their own" regarding rules of conduct, while Defiant girls more often state that they are subject to parental rules.

3. Compliant girls name internalized values as ways in which they would like a daughter to differ from themselves, while Defiant girls name recognition-seeking attributes as ways in which they would like a daughter to differ.

4. Compliant girls prefer suburban living, while Defiant girls prefer city living.

5. Compliant girls wish for a moderate number of children (between 2 and 4), while Defiant girls tend to fall at the extremes (none or many) in stating preferences for family size.

Group II hypotheses

The second group of hypotheses concerns the attitudes toward future role resolutions that are expected to correlate with the Compliant and Defiant positions. Specific predictions are subsumed under several hypotheses concerning the traditional feminine role in this society. "Traditional feminine role" refers to the role previously noted as the dominant role image for women in the society—that of wife and mother.

Actually there is one basic hypothesis from which the four hypotheses of this group derive. This basic hypothesis may be stated as: Compliant girls tend to accept the traditional role of wife and mother, while Defiant girls indicate a desire to continue with career goals and tend to be conflicted over the exclusive adoption of the wife-and-mother role.

Four hypotheses were formulated to test this basic hypothesis. These hypothesized relationships emphasize the role-conflict aspect of this research.

Inasmuch as the role of wife and mother is one which is almost universally desired by young women, an attempt to assess the amount of conflict surrounding its adoption can only be made through investigation of the aims, ambitions, attitudes, and aspirations which might be seen as inconsistent with, or contrary to, the achievement of this primary goal.

The hypotheses of Group II were formulated on this basis. The translation of these hypotheses into empirical predictions perforce follows the same path. The hypotheses and the predictions by which they are tested are as follows:

Hypothesis VI. Fewer Compliant than Defiant girls have aims and ambitions in addition to marriage and a family.

Predictions:

1. Fewer Compliant than Defiant girls indicate a preferred time of marriage later than directly after college.

2. More Compliant than Defiant girls plan to stop work at marriage or shortly thereafter.

3. More Compliant than Defiant girls prefer to marry men who want them to be primarily wives and mothers, as opposed to continuing career interests as well.

4. More Compliant than Defiant girls indicate readiness to give up careers or working if the man they plan to marry asks them to do so.

5. More Compliant than Defiant girls indicate willingness to marry a man who disapproves altogether of women working.

The predictions are all aimed at assessing commitment to some kind of personal career or autonomous working area young women might have or want to have for the future.

The rationale behind the first prediction is that girls who have career aspirations will prefer a later time for marriage to allow for completion of necessary training or for establishing themselves in some kind of job area.

The second prediction represents an attempt to determine to what extent marriage and a family represents the only real aspiration of the young woman.

The last three predictions form a sequence to assess the degree of commitment to a personal career which the young woman might have, or see herself as wanting, in the future. Prediction 3, for example, concerns only the preference in choice of a mate. This allows for expression of career ambitions without bringing the marriage possibility into jeopardy. Predictions 4 and 5, in a sense, test the limits of such a commitment. Prediction 4 measures, in essence, whether a career is seen as important enough to the girl to cause her to give up a marriage possibility. Prediction 5 measures whether marriage is important enough to the girl that she will give up the possibilities of a career for it.

Of these three predictions, only the first (Prediction 3) is considered directly applicable to the support of Hypothesis VI. Predictions 4 and 5 are considered exploratory, in that it was felt that the wish to marry, for all girls, would be pre-eminent over any other conditions, where the choice between marrying and not marrying is introduced.

Hypothesis VII. Fewer Compliant than Defiant girls have education plans directed towards a personal career, independent of marriage and children.

Predictions

6. More Compliant girls than Defiant girls think of college in terms of self-enrichment.

The rationale for this prediction is that the Compliant girl will consider college as part of the expected pattern for the kind of life she is planning to lead. That is, a college education means fitting into the educational level of her husband and peers; not training for a career, per se.

7. Fewer Compliant than Defiant girls think of college in terms of preparing for a career for themselves.

8. More Compliant than Defiant girls have educational goals that lead to traditionally feminine careers (school teacher, nurse, etc.).

9. More Compliant than Defiant girls disapprove of mothers working.

10. Fewer Compliant than Defiant girls choose a time for returning to work after having children that falls within the earlier childhood years.

Hypothesis VIII. More Compliant than Defiant girls indicate primary interest in traditional feminine community activities and feminine interests.

Predictions

11. More Compliant than Defiant girls indicate that they anticipate with pleasure joining women's clubs and women's community activities.

12. More Compliant than Defiant girls prefer a girl as a first child.

Hypothesis IX. More Compliant than Defiant girls are reluctant to compete with men, intellectually or socially.

Predictions

13. More Compliant than Defiant girls show reluctance to compete intellectually with men.

14. More Compliant than Defiant girls show reluctance to compete socially with men.

The last hypothesis of this group is not directly related to the choice of the wife-and-mother role versus a career role, but concerns the association of Compliance with generally conventional behavior. This conventionality of approach is assumed to underlie the choice of the traditional feminine role on the part of Compliant girls.

Hypothesis X. More Compliant than Defiant girls are reluctant to depart from conventional standards or expected behavior patterns.

Predictions

15. Fewer Compliant than Defiant girls allow other interests to interfere with academic achievement.

16. Fewer Compliant than Defiant girls tend to choose new friends, over criticism from their old friends.

CHAPTER II

DESIGN AND EXPERIMENTAL PROCEDURES

Design

The design of this study is one which divides the population into three types of individuals—Compliant, Neutral, and Defiant—on the basis of a projective test, and then measures the differing attitudes of the two extreme groups (Compliant and Defiant) in the various criterion variables used to assess these attitudes. The predictor variable and the criterion variables are described in some detail in the remainder of this chapter.

The Compliance-Defiance Test

The test used in this study is the Compliance-Defiance Test developed by Adelson (1959). It was designed to measure those aspects of anality which were described in the discussion of the theory underlying this study and which were subsequently referred to as Compliance and Defiance. This test is similar to the Thematic Apperception Test (Murray et al., 1943), and, like that test, requires the respondent to tell a story to each of a set of pictures.

The Compliance-Defiance Test consists of four pictures. A brief description of these pictures follows:

Picture I. The picture shows a young woman sitting on an unmade bed in the midst of a messy room.

Picture II. The picture shows a young girl seated in front of a large table, on which is a "piggy bank" and many coins.

Picture III. The picture shows a mother figure standing over a very young child who is seated on a toilet.

Picture IV. The picture shows a young lady standing against an ambiguous background and holding a small knife in her hand.

In order to test both groups of hypotheses listed in Chapter I, several criterion measures were used. These are the Impulse Expression Scale (Sanford et al., 1957), the Caligor Figure-Drawing Test (Caligor, 1957), the Test of Critical Thinking (American Council of Education, 1953), A Personal History Questionnaire, and an Interview Schedule.

Since no intelligence tests are given as part of the routine admission procedure of the college involved in this research, the Test of Critical Thinking was used to give a rough estimate of the intellectual standing of the subjects. A further reason for including this test was to answer a possible question regarding the relationship of the dimension Compliance and Defiance, to intelligence.

A brief description of the criterion measures follows.

The Impulse Expression Scale

This scale is part of the Omnibus Personality Index developed at Vassar by Sanford, Webster, and Freedman. The Index is a multi-item pencil-and-paper test. The Impulse Expression scale is described as measuring such areas as rebelliousness, sensation-seeking, radical sentiments, and "endocathection" (the importance of fantasy in relation to concrete, practical action). It has to do with "impulse expression that is more or less spontaneous and free and

with impulse expression that is defensive and 'driven,'" according to the authors (Sanford et al., 1957, p. 17). It was used in this study to assess constriction versus lability in the expression of impulses.

The Caligor Figure-Drawing Test

This test differs from standard figure-drawing tests in that it involves the successive drawing of six human figures. Transparent paper is used, and the test is administered so that the subject is able to see only the preceding drawing through the following sheet. The subject is instructed to draw a picture of a whole person. On each succeeding drawing he may "add to, take away from, or change in any way he wants" (Caligor, 1957, p. 12) his present picture in relation to the one just finished. The test was used to assess sexual identification and narcissism-exhibitionism dimensions.

The Test of Critical Thinking

The test consists of fifty-two objective questions covering such abilities as the ability to define problems, select pertinent information, recognize unstated assumptions, invent and evaluate hypotheses, make valid inferences, and judge the validity of the inferences of others. Form G was used in this study. This test was developed by a committee of the American Council on Education.

The Personal History Questionnaire

This questionnaire is a self-administered short-answer type which covers the past educational experience and future educational plans of the respondents. There is also a major section on

demographic data (family background, parents' education, occupation, and religion, etc.). The questions relevant to this study are presented in Appendix A.

The Interview Schedule

This is a structured interview, using an open-ended questionnaire form. One section of this interview schedule includes questions concerning orientation toward future role resolutions with particular reference to career ambitions, hopes, and expectations regarding marriage and children, and attitudes about career and marriage plans. This section also contains five incomplete stories for which the respondent is asked to supply endings. These stories deal with typical situations of college life which present a source of conflict to women students. This section was given to women only.

Several questions from the general section of the total interview were considered pertinent to the present study and were therefore incorporated into the design of the study. These questions concern both the respondent's and the parents' attitudes and expectations about college. The full text of the questions used from the Interview Schedule may be found in Appendix A.

Experimental Procedures

The research population

The research was conducted on a sample of 107 young women, all entering freshmen at Monteith College, an experimental college in Wayne State University. This was Monteith's first year. The sample represents the entire group of freshman girls in that year's class with the exception of those inevitable few (10–12) for

whom the battery of tests and interviews was, for various reasons, incomplete. Unlike the general university population, this sample is made up almost entirely of high school graduates moving directly into college. Two individuals graduated more than three years ago, and three did not answer the question. Other information about these subjects may be found in Appendix A.

This research was conducted in conjunction with the Monteith Program Study, a general research program designed to explore the nature of this new experimental college. This program, under the direction of Dr. Carol Kaye, is to follow this beginning class through its entire college history.

Test administration

All of the measures, with the exception of the Interview Schedule, were given as group tests. The women were divided into two groups of approximately equal size and assigned to one of two consecutive testing days. The two day-long testing periods occurred at the end of the week of registration and before the beginning of classes.

In order to standardize the testing procedure as much as possible, the administration of all tests was done by the researcher. General instructions stressed the anonymous and confidential nature of the information gathered in the research project. The fact that there are no right or wrong answers was also stressed, except in the case of the Test of Critical Thinking were, of course, it does not apply.

The pictures for the Compliance-Defiance Test were projected on a large screen, and the following instructions were given:

> I am going to show you some pictures and I want you to tell a story about what is happening in the picture. Tell what

went on before the scene shown, how the character of characters in the story feel, and how it will come out. Devote at least one paragraph to each picture. You will have about five minutes for each picture.

The schedule of testing was arranged with as much variety as possible in the sequence of tests. Since some of the tests given are not a part of this study, the presentation of tests in this thesis does not represent the order of testing.

Both the Impulse Expression Scale and the Test of Critical Thinking were originally designed for group presentation, and the instructions given were those accompanying the respective tests.

Caligor gives general instructions for group administration of the Figure-Drawing Test. However, it was necessary both to make additional clarifying instructions (largely in the form of demonstrations) and a few minor changes in order to satisfy our testing situation. The complete instructions used for this test are given in Appendix B.

Scoring the tests

Although the scoring criteria for the Compliance-Defiance Test were available, experience has shown that populations may differ in the kinds of response made to such tests. Therefore it was considered advisable to evaluate the scoring criteria in relation to the present sample. A random selection of twenty sets of stories was chosen from the present sample. This set of stories was scored independently, according to the existing criteria, with the view of reserving for discussion those stories for which existing criteria were not precise enough. Since the previous scoring system was developed at Bennington College, we had anticipated that there might be some differences in the typical stories of the

present sample as compared with the original one. Our prediction proved to be correct, and discussion of additional criteria needed to embrace the stories of this sample resulted in an expansion of the scoring system. A complete description of the scoring technique as well as examples of the scoring criteria may be found in Appendix B. Following this revision of the scoring criteria, a second sample of twenty-five sets of stories was selected from the total. These were scored independently, and a reliability of .79 was obtained between the two raters.

The scores of the four stories were combined in such a a way as to place the individual in one of five groups: High Defiance (1), Moderate Defiance (2), Neutral (3), Moderate Compliance (4), and High Compliance (5).

Both the Impulse Expression Scale and the Test of Critical Thinking were scored according to a key provided with the test. As with the Compliance-Defiance Test, the sample was divided into code-groups for these tests. In both cases, the code-groups were based on natural groupings in the distribution of scores.

The scores of the Impulse Expression Scale were divided into six code-groups, with a code of (1) representing a low score and (6) representing a high score on the scale.

The scores of the Test of Critical Thinking were divided into five code-groups, with a code of (1) representing a low critical thinking score and a code of (5) representing a high critical thinking score.

The scoring of the Figure-Drawing Test is somewhat more complicated than that of the preceding tests, though less complicated than Caligor's complete system. Since this test was to be used in relation to three hypotheses (sexual identification, non-erotized narcissism-exhibitionism, and erotized narcissism-exhibitionism),

scoring systems for these three dimensions of the protocols were developed.

The score for the first dimension, sexual identification, was based directly on Caligor's criteria. Caligor states that most subjects draw the entire series of figures of the same sex as themselves, and goes on to say:

> Subjects who draw three or more figures of the opposite sex reveal their anxiety and discomfort with their sexual identification and sexual role. The greater the number of opposite sex drawings, the more intense is the anxiety and discomfort [Caligor, 1957, p. 73].

On the basis of this statement, the score for sexual identification was a simple count of the number of drawings in each series that were of the same sex as the artist. Scores on this dimension, therefore, range from 0 to 6.

The second scoring method for the figure drawing was a rating scale. This was designed to obtain a single rating for each set of six pictures. A five-step code was developed on the basis of characteristics found in a preliminary examination of the sets of drawings. This code corresponds with the Compliance-Defiance code, in that the characteristics were rated according to whether they were considered to be typical of a Compliant or a Defiant orientation. Compliant characteristics centered around those considered to be expressive of non-erotized narcissism-exhibitionism, but the Defiant characteristics included expressions of aggression, resentment, or resistance to the task assigned, and so on, as well as such characteristics as might be considered erotized narcissism-exhibitionism. A description of this rating scale and the characteristics involved in the rating is presented in Appendix B. This rating scale is subsequently referred to as Scale I for the Caligor.

While the Compliant end of Scale I seemed to describe adequately the dimension of non-erotized narcissism-exhibitionism, the Defiant end of the scale, as noted above, included various other elements in addition to erotized narcissism-exhibitionism. For this reason, a second rating scale seemed necessary in order to separate the dimension of erotized narcissism-exhibitionism from other characteristics of the Defiant position on Scale I.

The second rating scale combined some of Caligor's criteria with a rating of degree of expression of what were considered expressions of erotized narcissism-exhibitionism. According to Caligor,

> Most subjects draw fully clothed figures. Other scores reflect narcissism-exhibitionism. . . . The intensity of the above is indicated to some extent by the number of partially clothed figures and to a greater extent by the number of nude figures [1957, p. 85].

This rating scale, Scale II for the Caligor, may also be found in Appendix B. Both scales were rated by a second independent rater. Reliability coefficients are presented with the description of the scales in the appendix.

The Personal History Questionnaire was also given during the day's testing session. The questionnaire is self-explanatory to the respondent, and instructions were simply to fill it out as carefully as possible. A discussion of the coding of this questionnaire will appear in the section concerning general coding procedures for the Interview Schedule.

The Interview Schedule

The interviews preceded the testing session and were conducted individually by trained women interviewers. The interviews

were scheduled by letter appointment and were held at the college during the two weeks preceding registration week. Each interview was preceded by the following introductory remarks:

> My name is ————. I am working with a research group that is not part of the Monteith faculty. Our job is to learn what happens when a new college starts, and we are talking with everyone in your entering class. We will not discuss what any individual students tells us with the faculty or the administration. Everything you say is treated as confidential. We will eventually issue reports of statistical percentages in which no individual is identified. There is no right or wrong answer. We want to know what your experiences have been, and what your ideas are.

Coding the interviews

The interviews were coded according to the standard procedures for open-ended questions. That is, a sample of answers to each question was collected and a series of codes written which attempted to embrace the expected range of answers of the entire sample. Examples of codes for several representative questions may be found in Appendix A.

Statistical analysis

Frequency tables were prepared showing the various relations to be tested. These had five or six columns, and from two to several rows. With a total population of 100, many cells of the tables contained too few individuals to permit the use of chi-square.

Since at least one of the variables (usually the Compliance-Defiance criterion) in each comparison had been coded so as to give a reasonably normal distribution of students, the coefficient of correlation was chosen as a valid measure of the degree of overall trend (Walker and Lev, 1953).

A major advantage to the use of the correlation coefficient is the possibility of direct comparison between many tests. Further, the direction of correlation is indicated by its sign and thus can be expressed with reference to the hypothesis tested.

One-tailed probabilities were used to evaluate the Compliance-Defiance correlations because the hypotheses were established in advance of the study. For other correlations, related to hypotheses developed during the analysis of the data, two-tailed probabilities were used.

Inasmuch as many hypotheses were tested, the array of probabilities was analyzed to determine whether or not the proportion of significant findings exceeded chance. This is a necessary prelude to the presentation of any particular set of results, and for that reason, the over-all analysis of the array of correlations is presented here.

The Compliance-Defiance scale was correlated with a total of twenty-nine variables related to the hypotheses of this thesis. Of these, eleven lay in the predicted direction with one-tailed probabilities of 0.05 or less. Chance predicts 1.45 such correlations. Although the expected number is too small for testing by chi-square, the discrepancy is obviously significant. In order to compute a chi-square, correlations can be sorted at the level of the probable error (Table 1).

Following the decision to use the Impulse Expression Scale as a companion measure, the Impulse Expression Scale was correlated with the same twenty-eight variables used with the Compliance-Defiance scale (the twenty-ninth being the Compliance-Defiance and Impulse Expression Scale comparison). The Impulse Expression is presented from the point of view of an expected correspondence with Compliance-Defiance predictions. The correlations can, therefore, be similarly sorted into three categories (Table 2).

TABLE 1

DISTRIBUTION OF PROBABILITIES ASSOCIATED WITH THE COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE (C–D) CORRELATIONS

Correlation	Observed	Expected
Within probable error of zero	8	14.5
$p < .50$, in the predicted direction	17	7.25
$p < .50$, in the opposite direction	4	7.25
Total	29	29
$\chi^2 = 17.5$ df = 2 $p < .001$		

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF PROBABILITIES ASSOCIATED WITH THE IMPULSE EXPRESSION SCALE (IES) CORRELATIONS

Correlation	Observed	Expected
Within probable error of zero	11	14
$p < .50$, in the predicted direction	15	7
$p < .50$, in the opposite direction	2	7
Total	28	28
$\chi^2 = 13.3$ df = 2 $p < .01$		

All the correlations that fell within the probable error of zero are reported as zero in this paper, even though the majority of them deviated in the predicted direction from zero. A total of nineteen correlations are significant at the 5 per cent level (one-tail for C-D correlations and two-tail for IES correlations). Only these correlations are reported as verifications of the hypotheses in this thesis.

The remaining correlations exceed the probable error of zero, but fail to reach the 5 per cent level. Of these, however, fourteen fall in the predicted direction. The probability for this, using the binomial test, is 0.01 (Siegel, 1956). Thus it can be assumed that some of these (probably half) will be supported by further work. For this reason, many of these correlations are discussed as suggestive results. Using one-tailed probabilities, of course, the actual probability levels for these correlations, deviating from zero in the predicted direction, lie between 0.05 and 0.25. None of the negative correlations obtained in these whole-sample computations are discussed.

CHAPTER III

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION OF GROUP I HYPOTHESES

In this chapter the results of Group I hypotheses will be presented and discussed. Group I hypotheses are those concerning personality characteristics, or aspects of personality structure, associated with Compliance and Defiance. These hypotheses represent an attempt to designate a constellation of personality traits that characterize the two types, Compliant and Defiant, in addition to those specifically related to the dimension of anality from which the typology derives.

In Chapter II, it was stated that the Test of Critical Thinking was introduced to assess the relationship of Compliance-Defiance with an estimate of intelligence. The Test of Critical Thinking has a correlation of 0.02 with Compliance-Defiance, indicating that the latter parameter has little to do with intelligence.[1]

The five hypotheses of this group involve the association of Compliance-Defiance with impulse expression, masochism, narcissism-exhibitionism, and sexual identification.

---

[1]The distribution of scores on the Test of Critical Thinking and a comparison of this sample with other college samples may be found in Appendix B.

Hypothesis I

Hypothesis I. Compliance is associated with constriction of impulse expression, whereas Defiance is related to lability of impulse expression.

This hypothesis was based directly on a predicted relationship of the Impulse Expression Scale (IES) with Compliance-Defiance. A high score was considered evidence of impulse lability, and a low score, of impulse constriction. The correlation between IES and Compliance-Defiance was +0.23. With 105 degrees of freedom the probability of this result occurring by chance is less than .01, using a one-tailed test. Hypothesis I was considered upheld by the results.

A discussion of the Impulse Expression Scale and the theoretical implications of high and low scores as suggested by the authors of the scale will help to clarify the nature of the relationship between this scale and Compliance-Defiance. The description of the personality traits of the individuals scoring at the extremes of the IES have many similarities to those which we have posited as deriving from the conflict in the anal stage of development and associated with the personality types, Compliant and Defiant. The dimension the scale was designed to measure, as described by the authors, "extends from compulsiveness, authoritarianism, submissiveness and passivity at one extreme to impulsiveness, irrepressibility, assertiveness and adventurousness at the other" (Sanford et al., 1957, p. 1).

The IES is an attitude scale which attempts to measure a "general readiness to express, to seek gratification of, impulses, in overt action or in conscious feeling and attitude." It is an important feature of the construction of this scale that it was directed at disciminating these attributes in a college population where they were not expected to reach pathological proportions—that is, these are

extremes within a so-called "normal" range. Within this range, the scale distinguishes individuals who are in need of self-discipline and integration, and the like, from those who are over-disciplined and over-controlled in their expressive life.

Since the extent of conflict reflected in the measure of the dimension of Compliance-Defiance was also expected to fall within this "normal" range in our sample, the correspondence between the two scales in this regard allows for a greater degree of comparability of the two dimensions than would otherwise be the case.

One of the problems which concerns the authors of this scale is that there is no way for the scale to distinguish between impulse expression that is spontaneous and free and impulse expression that is "driven" and conflict-laden. Either characteristic would be expressed simply as a high score.

A similar problem exists among low-scoring individuals, in that the scale is unable to distinguish between emotionally open and flexible individuals who have established adequate controls, and individuals whose low score reflects a constriction of affect that is severely suppressive in the life of the individual.

Basically the difference in "driven" and "spontaneous" impulse expression revolves around the degree to which early object ties provided the opportunity for the formation of relatively stable identification patterns. Such instability in basic object relations would affect the adjustment of the individual through each succeeding stage of development.

In connection with this continuing effect (in the context of high impulse expression), the authors state:

> It seems unlikely that the traumata of early childhood were severe enough to generate strong psychotic potential, but they may have been important enough to determine the type of

> response to later crises. It might be that in many of these subjects [high Impulse Expressors] a narcissistic wound occurred at a time when a fairly substantial ego structure had been formed, so that they could feel, consciously, let down, disillusioned, embittered, insecure, and could determine to retaliate to get what is rightfully their own, to make some radical changes in the world, to see to it that they were not again caught off guard [Sanford et al., 1957, p. 19].

From the above discussion and from the fact that throughout the description of this dimension there is an emphasis on active mastery, or on action as a defense maneuver, as a strong component of high Impulse Expression, it seemed probable that one source of this attribute would be derived from the area of conflict over anality, and that high impulse expression would be associated with the expression of this conflict in the type of individual characterized here as Defiant.

However, another aspect of the expression of Defiance, namely, depression and withdrawn cynicism, would not be evidenced in a high score on IES. Since this latter expression of Defiance is less conducive to an adaptive manipulation of the environment, it might be assumed that they present a more intransigent continuing conflict.

One would therefore suppose that the relationship of Defiance with High Impulse Expression found in this study is one between those Defiant individuals whose life experiences have been such as to allow a freer and less severely conflicted expression of Defiance. Conversely, it would be presumed that the combination of high Defiance and low Impulse Expression reflects a more deeply imbedded conflict.

A similar relationship between Compliance and Impulse Expression would presumably be equally appropriate. Since the characteristics of Compliance are largely those involving a compulsive characterological manifestation of anal conflict, the

association of low Impulse Expression would be expected from the description of the limits of the dimension IES was designed to measure. But what of the High Compliant, High Impulse Expressor? It would seem that the combination of Compliance with a high score on Impulse Expression may characterize the individual of greater defensive flexibility in whom emotional expression and capacity for gratification of impulse are coupled with control—in whom the structure of the superego is not so rigid as to prevent the impact of present experiences and new adaptations.

The picture that emerges is one in which overlapping areas of the two dimensions interact in such a way as to allow clarification of the nature of both Compliance and Defiance and of Impulse Expression in a given instance. Such a situation, in fact, seems to have been accurately predicted by the originators of this scale. At the close of their discussion they make the following statement:

> Finally, the J-scale[1] as we see it measures . . . a pattern of attitudes that is intimately tied to unconscious sources in the personality. For this reason, we should expect it to correlate significantly with many other measures of performance and of personality functions. We should not, however, expect these correlations to be very high, just because J, standing at the level of attitude, may be expressed in different ways and have different sources within the personality [Sanford et al., 1957, p. 19].

The degree of correlation of the two scales, Compliance-Defiance and IES, is clearly low enough ($r = +0.23$) to allow for the independent correlation of each of these dimensions with other variables. In view of this, it was felt that a continuing comparison of the two measures would be of value. A more extensive appreciation of the areas of interaction and of independence of the two personality

---

[1]Impulse Expression Scale is abbreviated as the J-scale in the paper quoted here.

dimensions may thus be observed. In general, the presentation of Impulse Expression Scale findings is used as an illustration of the way in which the two partially interacting personality dimensions relate to a diversified universe of variables. The major reason is that, in several instances, it is felt that the nature of the interaction may contribute to the understanding of a particular finding with Compliance-Defiance. In such case, the interaction of the two dimensions is relevant to the discussion of findings of Compliance-Defiance, and both will be discussed.

Hypothesis II

Hypothesis II. Compliance is associated with a masochistic orientation.

The original hypothesis included a prediction concerning the relationship of Defiance to a sado-masochistic orientation, but no data could be found which are relevant to an assessment of this orientation. It was therefore only possible to test the relationship of Compliance with a masochistic orientation.

For the purposes of this study, a masochistic orientation was defined as one in which attitudes toward certain desired goals are expressed in terms of trouble and hardships, a denigration of the role or of one's capacities in the role, and a de-emphasis or omission of the attractive aspects and attributes of one's position. Data classified according to this definition are taken from responses to the question, "Thinking about a woman's life, how is a woman's life changed by having children?"

Since the mothering role, with which this question is concerned, is a role almost universally desired by young women of this age (cf. Douvan, 1960; Goldsen et al., 1960), the perception of the role in terms of its negative aspects was considered evidence

of a masochistic orientation in relation to the role. Negative aspects are represented by descriptions of the role in terms of self-denial (can't do what you want any more; you have to give up things), hard work (you're tired all the time; you have to work harder than ever before), restrictions on social life or pleasures (can't go out; have to give up hobbies, outside interests, movies, etc.), or loss of narcissistic gratifications (no time to take care of yourself; you lose interest in things; you get careless about the way you look, etc.).

Emphasis on positive attributes of the mothering role, such as self-fulfillment, rewards and gratifications of being a mother, or a pleasurable investment in the responsitilities of the role, represent a non-masochistic orientation to the role.

Data from this question were treated in two ways for this analysis. First, all answers were roughly divided into Positive, Neutral, and Negative attitudes to changes in one's life through children. Second, two response categories, one from the positive group and one from the negative group, were chosen for separate analysis. This choice was made on the basis of the frequency of responses in the coded categories. The category in each group (Negative and Positive) having the largest number of responses was the one chosen for analysis. The response category from the negative group was that concerned with loss of freedom, being "tied down" by children. The answer from the positive group concerned responsibility for the training, education, guidance, or discipline of the children. Again, the answer "tied down" represents a masochistic orientation, and "responsibility to train, educate, etc.," a non-masochistic orientation.

Table 3 presents the findings for this hypothesis. The table is set up in the direction of the hypothesis, so that a positive correlation indicates support of the hypothesis. The hypothesis that

TABLE 3

RELATIONSHIP OF COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE AND IES TO HYPOTHESIS II: MASOCHISTIC ORIENTATION

Measure	N	C-D r	p	IES r	p
Negative, Neutral, Positive attitudes toward parenthood . .	103	+0.16	=.05	+0.08	n.s.
Tied down, etc., vs. not given	107	+0.19	=.025	+0.00	n.s.
Answer not given vs. responsibility to educate, train, etc.	107	+0.22	<.025	0.00	n.s.

Compliance is associated with a masochistic orientation is upheld by these results.

In considering the meaning of the present findings, remarks from two recent studies dealing with the same area from which the present findings concerning masochism were derived—attitudes toward family life—seem appropriate.

In a study involving sex roles in adolescent girls, Kaye (1957) makes the following statement about the perception of the role of wife and mother by the mothers of the girls. She says:

> For the woman staying at home and raising a family these images of the career woman provided a counterpoint to her life, evoking fantasies of a life which might provide more gratification and in which she might "realize herself." The existence of this image tended to stylize "just housekeeping" as drudgery and deprivation [p. 1].

In much the same context (career versus homemaker), Goldsen et al. (1960) make the following statement regarding the perception of their future role by young college women:

> There is no question that college girls count on building an equity in family life, not in professional work. . . . For professional work among women in this country (and the college-trained women agree) is viewed as an interlude, at best a part-time excursion away from full-time family life—the family life which the coeds yearn for, impatiently look forward to—and define as largely monotony, tedium and routine [p. 58].

The mothers of the first study are of the same age-group as the mothers of the young college women in the second study. One might assume, therefore, that this view of family life is learned, as it were, at mother's knee.

It is noteworthy that it is the Defiant girls who tend to emphasize an aspect of family life that reveals an active, achieving attitude toward the task of child-rearing—to train, educate, discipline, and so forth. It may be that the rebelliousness which characterizes the Defiant position engenders a critical attitude toward the mother which brings awareness of the mothering role more directly into focus. The resentment and hostility directed toward the mother may have forced the Defiant girl to think about the problems involved in the role, to move away from the model her mother presents to her, and, perhaps, to formulate ideas about the meaning of the role for herself.

While one set of attitudes may be as unrealistic as the other in terms of how these girls will actually respond to the situation itself, the fact that there is such a demonstrable difference in the attitudes of the extreme groups—Compliant and Defiant—in this sample leads one to wonder about the amount of conflict present in this attitude toward motherhood on the part of Compliant girls. For

example, how much of this negative attitude reflects what might be called the "normal" degree of masochism that is part of a truly feminine adjustment, and how much does it indicate a degree of conflict that will intrude on the performance of this highly valued goal? In a culture as preoccupied with child-rearing and parenthood as the present one, this would seem to be a worth-while area for future research.

Hypothesis III

Hypothesis III. Compliance is related to non-erotized narcissism-exhibitionism, while Defiance is related to erotized narcissism-exhibitionism.

Evidence for Hypothesis III was derived from the two rating scales for the Figure-Drawing Test. Scale I is a rating of non-erotized narcissism-exhibitionism, and Scale II is a rating of erotized narcissism-exhibitionism.[1] In Scale I, for example, "paper-doll" or "princess"-like figures, often involving domestic or romantic settings, are rated Compliant. The opposite extreme, Defiance, presents a more varied picture. Examples of Defiance range from negativistic, aggressive themes (expressed through stick figures, sarcastic humor, caricature, etc.) to "arty" and "sexy" drawings. In contrast to the "Compliant" pictures, there may be a high level of activity portrayed as well as inconsistency or variety in the backgrounds of the pictures.

This diversity in the expression of Defiance in the figure drawings necessitated the development of the second scale to measure erotized narcissism-exhibitionism. Sexually exhibitionistic characteristics (emphasis on bust, hips, elaborate make-up or jewelry, nude figures, etc.) were rated on this scale. As noted in

---

[1]These scales are fully described in Appendix B.

Chapter II, only those series of drawings which included at least one female figure were included in this rating.

As can be seen from Table 4, the results indicate that the hypothesized relationship of non-erotized narcissism-exhibitionism with Compliance is supported, while the relationship of Defiance to erotized narcissism-exhibitionism is quite conclusively not supported. The very different results of Impulse Expression Scale and erotized narcissism-exhibitionism, as compared with those for Compliance-Defiance, is of particular interest and will be discussed below.

The fact that, for the first scale, the findings for Impulse Expression and Compliance-Defiance are in agreement seems to indicate that the characteristics of Defiance as expressed on this scale are a more accurate assembly of Defiant traits than is erotized narcissism-exhibitionism alone. This is in accord with the theory concerning the two personality types presented in Chapter I.

As with the delineation of the general personality characteristics of Compliance-Defiance in Chapter I, the characteristics of the Compliant rating on narcissism-exhibitionism in Scale I are a relatively homogeneous and definable group compared to those at

TABLE 4

RELATIONSHIP OF COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE AND IES TO HYPOTHESIS III: NARCISSISM–EXHIBITIONISM

Measure	N	C-D r	p	IES r	p
Scale I (Non-erot. N-E)	104	+0.19	=.025	+0.16	=.10
Scale II (Erot. N-E)	97	0.00	n.s.	+0.28	<.01

the Defiant end of this rating scale. On this scale, as in the discussion of theory, Defiance is characterized by a diversity of expression that makes it difficult to categorize definitively. In the figure drawings, for example, either aggressive elements (caricature or sarcastic humor) or sexually exhibitionistic features (nudes or highly stylized fashion models) may be emphasized in the expression of Defiance. While these characteristics may have a common denominator in their exhibitionistic quality (presumably the contribution to the relationship of Scale I to the two personality types), it may be that opposing expressions of Defiance on the figure drawings mask the relationship in the area of erotized narcissism-exhibitionism. Some further evidence for this supposition arises in connection with the relationship of Compliance-Defiance with the measure of feminine identification and will be discussed in conjunction with those findings. The interaction with IES, as it relates to Scale II, will also be discussed at that time.

It should be noted here that the relationship of non-erotized narcissism-exhibitionism to Compliance is highly consistent with the previous findings concerning this personality type. The Compliant personality in women seems increasingly to emerge as a conventional, conforming one with an orientation toward traditional feminine roles, a de-emphasis of sexuality, and a corresponding emphasis on control of emotions and impulses.

Hypothesis IV

Hypothesis IV. Compliance is associated with feminine sexual identification, whereas Defiance is associated with ambivalent or conflicted sexual identification.

The test of Hypothesis IV rests on a count of the number of female figures in the series of six drawings. As mentioned in Chapter II, drawing primarily female figures is considered indicative of a feminine identification. An unexpected situation emerged, however, when it was observed that subjects who drew six male figures or six female figures seemed to reverse a trend which was apparent among subjects who drew from one to five female figures in their series of six. In view of this observation, the drawings were divided into two groups: "Same-sex series" involving sets of drawings in which the six figures were either all male or all female, and "Different-sex series" involving sets of drawings which included both male and female figures in the series of six. Since the score given to the set is the number of female figures in the total set, "Same-sex series" have a score of either 0 or 6, while "Different-sex series" have a score ranging from 1 to 5. The results of this analysis are presented in Table 5.

An examination of Table 5 will show that the correlation for the entire series of drawings from 0 to 6 female figures would be about zero for both Compliance-Defiance and Impulse Expression.

TABLE 5

RELATIONSHIP OF COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE AND IES TO HYPOTHESIS IV: SEXUAL IDENTIFICATION

Measure	N	C-D r	p	IES r	p
Different-sex series	55	+0.12	n.s.	+0.20	n.s.
Same-sex series	49	-0.14	n.s.	-0.15	n.s.

The findings concerning sex of figures in the drawings do not uphold the hypothesis.

The findings reported in Table 5 represent an exploration of the data based on the observation of this trend in the original table. It was felt that some speculation concerning these results might be of interest in terms of implications for future research with such measures. The perplexing reversal of sign for the two groups of drawings, its occurrence with both personality tests, and the fact that the correlations approach statistical significance, tempt one to speculations about what could be involved.

Two lines of conjecture are suggested. The first concerns the nature of the ego defenses in general, and the second, the nature of sexual identification as it emerges here. In the first instance, one inference that could be drawn is that the tendency to draw different-sex series indicates a flexibility in the ego defense system, while the tendency to draw same-sex series indicates a rigidity in the defense structure. Such rigidity can be seen as reflecting an area of conflict that is too pressing to allow relaxation of the defensive position taken in the first drawing.

Theoretically, sexual conflicts arising from imperfect resolution of the oedipus complex are assumed to be characteristic of both Compliance and Defiance. Such conflict would be most clearly revealed, in the measures at our disposal, as a conflict over sexual identification.

A consideration of these results, using the number of figures of a given sex drawn in the series of six, sheds some light on the problem. For example, the drawing of all male figures by Compliant girls, while perhaps consciously representing a love-object, may reveal a less conscious masculine identification which allows the original love-object (mother) to be maintained. At the same time,

the necessity on the part of the young woman for whom this is an area of intense conflict, to maintain a rigid defense against this impulse, prevents her from moving away from the single sex drawn.

The fact that the correlation of Compliance-Defiance with the different-sex series is in the predicted direction is particularly interesting. It suggests that the reduction in the rigidity of the defense structure, even to the extent of allowing for one other-sex drawing, is enough to change the nature of the identification theme and its expression on this test.

In considering the relationship of Defiance to the all-female series of drawings, three things should be kept in mind. First, the all-female series is a much larger group, numerically, than the all-male series. Second, the all-female series presumably include a group of Compliant drawings of the "complaisant" or "paper-doll" group. Third, that, as noted above, there is more than one way of expressing Defiance in these drawings.

Referring to the theoretical discussion of the factors involved in the Defiant solution of the oedipus conflict, it was noted that there might be either an explicit rejection of the feminine role or that such a rejection could be more implicit and take the form of sexually provocative behavior. From this, one might conjecture that Defiant girls could express themselves in opposing ways in drawing all-female series of figures.

On the one hand, they may play down sexual characteristics and produce a series of pictures that are largely bland and rigid, while, on the other hand, they may produce a series of pictures where sexual attributes are overplayed and act as a counterphobic defense against sexuality. Such a dichotomy in figure-drawing types in Defiant girls would explain the total lack of correlation between Defiant girls and erotized narcissism-exhibitionism (cf. Table 4), as

well as providing a further description of the manifestation of sexual conflict in Defiant girls.

The relationship of the Impulse Expression Scale to the two hypotheses based on the Figure-Drawing Test lend additional support to the reasoning outlined above. The relationship of Impulse Expression with the first rating scale (non-erotized narcissism-exhibitionism) is in the same direction as that of Compliance-Defiance. That is, both low impulse expression and compliance are related to non-erotized narcissism-exhibitionism. Ratings of erotized narcissism-exhibitionism (Scale II) shows a significant relationship with high impulse expression and none with Compliance-Defiance. In the sexual identification measures, the relationship of Impulse Expression to the different-sex and same-sex series of drawings is again completely consistent with that of Compliance-Defiance.

If the reasoning concerning the rigidity of the defense structure is correct, one would expect that this rigidity would be associated with a limited capacity for impulse expression. Conversely, if the drawing of different-sex series is a sign of increased flexibility of the defense system, one would assume that there would be an association of this group with a higher capacity for impulse expression. The choice of the sexually provocative defense against sexuality would also logically be the choice of high impulse expressors. This is the defense picture that is involved in the rating of erotized narcissism-exhibitionism. It would seem that where defense structures are more flexible, Defiance may express itself in sexually provocative figure drawings, while when defense structures are too rigid, the drawings would be bland and constricted.

Although none of the correlations for sexual identification reach significance, the consistency of the findings with the two measures (Compliance-Defiance and Impulse Expression Scale)

indicates that this would be a fruitful area for further exploration and research. The present findings suggest two directions for such explorations. One concerns a test of the statement of theory in which both extreme Compliants and extreme Defiants were said to be conflicted in the area of sexual identification. The present findings in relation to the same-sex series of figures seem to support this theory, and especially so when one considers the inferred rigidity of defense structure.

In regard to the different-sex series, where presumably defenses are more flexible, the tendency of defiant girls to manifest a more open masculine identification and Compliants a more open feminine identification, as hypothesized, also needs further clarification. Perhaps one explanation would be that a more intense manifestation of conflict, such as is posited here in connection with same-sex series of drawings, relates to deeper and less conscious aspects of identification, while less intense manifestations of conflict, revealed in the different-sex series, has some of the quality of an ego-ideal.

Hypothesis V

Hypothesis V. Compliance is associated with a strong, internalized superego, while Defiance is associated with a more unformed, incompletely internalized superego.

Evidence for an internalized superego was considered to be found in responses that show adherence to clearly defined and conventional moral standards, acceptance and adoption of parental standards, and an orientation towards a regulated, controlled, and duty-oriented mode of life. A further aspect of these responses is the perception of decisions in these areas as autonomous since this

is an indication that the standards have been internalized. The opposite of the above attributes, such as chafing at parental standards, or ambivalence about such standards, looking to others for definitions of standards, et cetera, would be considered evidence of a more unformed, incompletely internalized superego.

Table 6 presents the findings based on the specific predictions listed in Chapter I. From this table, it can be seen that this hypothesis receives support from the first two predicted relationships. Additional support could perhaps be suggested through a third measure in which a noticeable positive correlation occurs.

The first and second predictions, however, which show the strongest relationship, are most directly related to the hypothesis under consideration. Both concern the degree of internalization of parental attitudes and parental controls. It seems, therefore, of particular value that these are the sources of primary support for the hypothesis.

TABLE 6

RELATIONSHIP OF COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE AND IES TO MEASURES OF HYPOTHESIS V: SUPEREGO

Measure	N	C-D r	p	IES r	p
1. Gen. family encourages college	103	+0.23	<.01	+0.19	<.05
2. On own vs. parents' rules .	106	+0.17	<.05	+0.11	n.s.
3. Daughter different	93	-0.11	n.s.	-0.20	=.05
4. Prefer city or suburbs, etc. .	107	+0.11	n.s.	0.00	n.s.
5. Number of children	101	0.00	n.s.	0.00	n.s.

In considering the last two predictions, suburban living versus city living, and a moderate, well-planned family size, the expectations of influence of current social attitudes should be recalled. The heavy emphasis on suburban living in this society was evident in this sample. About 30 per cent of the total chose to live in the city, however, and some relationship in the direction of the prediction emerges. A further factor affecting attitudes toward city or suburban living in this sample is the fact that the great majority of these girls are permanent city residents who go to college while still living at home. Living in the city, for this population, may not represent the excitement and drama that might be appealing to the Defiant girl of another environmental background.

In the case of the prediction concerning desired family size, the skewing of the distribution was even more marked than for the suburban-city question. About 80 per cent of this sample indicated a desired family of from two to four children, with "three" being the most frequently mentioned choice. Choices outside this range seemed more often to reflect religious background than as specific family size desired by the girl. Such answers as "That is in God's hands," or "As many as God allows" are not classifiable in terms of the intent of the hypothesis.

Finally, then, the general conclusion that one could draw from these findings is that there is justification for concluding that something of the nature of the superego formation that is characteristic of the two types, Compliant and Defiant, has been demonstrated. However, these findings represent a relatively circumscribed area of superego development, and an expansion of measures in this area would be necessary before any major conclusions could be drawn. The present findings indicate a direction for such further

exploration and support the hypothesis concerning a difference in the dimensions of superego development in the two personality types.

Summary of Group I Findings

A summary of the findings for Group I hypotheses shows the following:

1. The relationship of Compliance with affective constriction and of Defiance with affective lability was upheld (p. 31).

2. The relationship of Compliance with a masochistic orientation was upheld (Table 3).

3. The relationship of non-erotized narcissism-exhibitionism with Compliance and of Defiance with a more diffuse exhibitionistic qualities was upheld (Table 4).

4. The relationship of Compliance with an internalized superego and of Defiance to a more unformed, incompletely internalized superego receives enough support to indicate that exploration of this relationship along the lines outlined in this research would yield further definition of superego development in the two types of personality (Table 6).

5. The relationship of Defiance to erotized narcissism-exhibitionism was not demonstrated (Table 4).

6. The relationship of Compliance-Defiance to sexual identification measures was not demonstrated (p. 42).

In general, the personality correlates of the Compliant individuals, as outlined in the discussion in Chapter I, seem to have emerged with more clarity than have those associated with Defiance.

The theoretical view of the Compliant individual as one in whom a somewhat prematurely jelled, constricted personality structure leads to a conforming, conventional orientation to life seems to be supported. The association of masochism and affective constriction with Compliance is consistent with this view. Although the hypotheses concerning sexual identification were not upheld, some suggestions concerning the nature of sexual conflict in Compliant girls may be inferred from these two findings, together with those of the narcissism-exhibitionism scale. One possible inference is that, where defensive rigidity and emotional inhibition are most prominent, there may be a turning away from sexuality. Since such young women often cling to the "traditional" feminine role, these are important considerations in connection with the anticipated role resolutions of the second group of hypotheses.

The characterization of the Defiant personality correlates remains almost as uncertain as in the theoretical formulations. The characteristic expression of sexuality in the Defiant girl remains undefined. Some exhibitionistic characteristics, largely in connection with expression of rebelliousness or aggression or of unconventionality, may be inferred from the relationship of Defiance to the first rating scale of figure-drawings, even though the measures specifically relating to sexual identification on this test give no significant results.

However, two findings do lend support to other aspects of Defiance: emotional lability and an incompletely internalized, unformed superego. Both findings are consistent with the picture of defiance as a more disorganized and unsettled personality structure.

While such an individual may be, as Sanford et al. (1957, p. 1) suggest, primarily in need of integration and self-discipline,

there is some indication that where Defiance is coupled with affective lability the individual girl may be more active in searching for new kinds of adjustments and more open to the kinds of models or awareness of opportunities for change that college may provide. This attitude is also a relevant one to consider in connection with the role variables and the anticipated attitudes toward role resolution.

The presentation of these hypotheses before a consideration of the role variables which follows should provide a more complete background for considering the implications of the different role adjustments of these young women.

CHAPTER IV

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION OF GROUP II HYPOTHESES: ROLE VARIABLES

Group II hypotheses represent an attempt to measure conflict over the adoption of the traditional feminine role of wife and mother. It may be safely assumed that this is a role almost universally desired and anticipated by young college women. However, the attitudes and expectations that arise in connection with college, often centering around preparation for a future career, introduce new and contradictory strivings to the woman's view of her future. These attitudes are often difficult for the woman to integrate with the anticipated role of wife and mother. It seems reasonable, therefore, that they would represent a source of conflict in relation to future role adaptations.

Several hypotheses were developed on the basis of differences in the anticipated adaptations to this conflict by the two personality types, Compliant and Defiant. These hypotheses, as stated in Chapter I, derive from a statement of the basic assumption of this study, that Compliant girls tend to accept the traditional feminine role and renounce career goals, while Defiant girls tend to maintain career goals and manifest conflict over the exclusive adoption of the wife-and-mother role.

The specific questions used to test the predictions for these hypotheses may be found in Appendix A. The content of these

questions is indicated in abbreviated form in each table of results, under "Measure."

Hypothesis VI

Hypothesis VI. Fewer Compliant than Defiant girls have aims and ambitions in addition to marriage and a family.

The hypothesis is tested principally by the first three predictions, as stated above (p. 13). The remaining two predictions were designated as exploratory for the purpose of testing the limits of commitment to career in relation to marriage.

It can be seen from Table 7 that the results support the hypothesis in only one of the three central predictions. Two additional measures show a correlation with Compliance-Defiance in the predicted direction while two others show no relationship at all.

TABLE 7

RELATIONSHIP OF COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE AND IES TO HYPOTHESIS VI: AMBITIONS IN ADDITION TO MARRIAGE

Measure	N	C-D r	p	IES r	p
1. Early vs. later marriage . .	102	+0.17	<.05	+0.20	<.05
2. Work after marriage	103	0.00	n.s.	0.00	n.s.
3. Wife and mother only, or career too	100	+0.14	n.s.	+0.13	n.s.
4. Give up career for marriage.	100	0.00	n.s.	0.00	n.s.
5. Marry man who disapproves of women working	98	+0.12	n.s.	+0.13	n.s.

The rationale for this prediction was that postponement of marriage is related to career plans. However, the personality correlates found to be associated with Defiance (i.e., impulse lability and a more unformed superego) suggest other possible motivations for sources of the delay. Placing marriage plans further in the future may reflect a continuation of adolescent problems of identity in the Defiant girl. The career commitment implicit in the delay of marriage may represent a defense against recognition of such conflicts, or provide a rational reason for postponing commitment to the expected adult role.

Some justification for such an inference comes from the fact that no clear relationship emerges between Compliance-Defiance and the following predictions, which are specifically related to career goals. In the last four predictions of this hypothesis, the point of choice, in effect, assumes that the decision to marry has been made, though the time of marriage remains in the nebulous future.

Two of these measures (giving up a career at the request of a future husband, and working after marriage) show no correlation with the two personality dimensions. One conclusion regarding these measures may be that marriage and working are not seen as incompatible by these young women. The new conception of the "working wife" over the past few decades, cited by Goldsen et al. (1960, p. 85), was discussed previously in connection with the empirical measures of a masochistic orientation. The present findings lead to a further possibility. The young college woman will presumably be choosing a husband from her college classmates—a husband, that is, whose interests and ambitions parallel her own. The idea of working after marriage, far from being an indication of resistance to the marriage role, may have become an expected part of the function of a wife. It may represent her share in establishing a home—

either through supporting her husband in his educational program, or through establishing an economic security that will allow the new family to be properly endowed when the children arrive.

Under such a circumstance, the giving up of a career at the husband's request (question 4) could imply that (1) economic security is not the issue, or (2) that giving up the career is seen as a temporary condition during the years of arrival and rearing of children.

This conjecture receives substantiation when one considers that a noticeable (though non-significant) correlation with Defiance emerges in connection with attributes preferred in a husband: Defiant girls tend to prefer a husband who will encourage his wife to continue a career as well as be a wife and mother, and who does not disapprove of women working. One may assume that one explanation of the lowness of the correlation of these measures is related to the factors of role-change outlined above. It seems that many young women, quite committed to a domestic role, are identified with this role only as long as it applies to the family with children in the home. The fact that 48 per cent of this sample indicate a preference for a career-allowing husband, while 53 per cent say they would not want to marry a man who disapproves of women working, indicates the prevalence of such attitudes.

In view of what seems to be a change in the conception of the feminine role in the general culture, the association of Defiance with choosing a mate according to his attitudes toward work is perhaps indicative, more than anything else, of an increased awareness of the expanded dimension of the role adaptation open to women. It is possible that this awareness of other adaptations and the holding off of one's own commitment for the future represents the most

characteristic expression of Defiance that appears in relation to role resolution.

Since, in the discussion of some of the later hypotheses, another factor, the influence of social class, is introduced, it may be well to state here that the introduction of social class variables produces no appreciable changes in the results of the measures of this hypothesis.

Hypothesis VII

The next hypothesis to be discussed brings future plans for wife-and-mother roles into more direct association with the present life experiences of the young woman. By focusing on educational goals and values, some assessment of the amount of realistic consideration of the demands of the two roles, career or homemaker, is gained. Hypothesis VII states:

Hypothesis VII. Fewer Compliant than Defiant girls have education plans directed toward a personal career, independent of marriage and children.

The hypothesis is tested by four predictions relating to college aims or values, and two relating to attitudes about integration of such aims with a future family role. It can be seen from Table 8 that Hypothesis VII is clearly supported by the results of the first two predictions. Compliance is associated with developing values for the future as a college goal; Defiance, with preparation for a career.

The perception of college in terms of developing values for the future represents a view of college as a personally broadening experience. Such a value as a college goal supports the contention that college, for the non-career-oriented girl, is valued in

TABLE 8

RELATIONSHIP OF COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE AND IES TO MEASURES OF HYPOTHESIS VII: EDUCATION PLANS

Measure	N	C-D r	p	IES r	p
6. Compliants see college as developing values . . .	106	+0.27	<.005	0.00	n.s.
7. Defiants see college as preparing for career . . .	106	+0.23	<.01	-0.11	n.s.
8a. Grad. school vs. remain in elementary teaching (story)	100	-0.13	n.s.	+0.07	n.s.
8b. Fem. career (Educ. vs. non-Educ.)	103	+0.12	n.s.	+0.21	<.05
9. Disapprove of mothers working	105	0.00	n.s.	+0.20	<.05
10. Best time to return to work after having children	98	+0.10	n.s.	+0.18	.10–.05

terms of her general life-pattern and the social norms of her peers or her family. At the same time, the consistency of the association of Compliance with an orientation away from a personal career (and presumably toward the wife-and-mother role) is maintained.

In contrast to this relatively broad and abstract evaluation of a college education, the attitude of Defiant girls toward college as a training center for a future career seems concrete and practical. While this attitude is consistent with the hypothesis that Defiant girls are career-oriented, it might be well to consider

a further factor in this attitude—namely, the effect of social class.

Both Defiance and high Impulse Expression tend to be associated with higher social class (cf. Appendix A). This correlation is not significant, but it is high enough to suggest that some effect of social class might be entering into the relationship.

For example, girls from lower social class groups (roughly, lower middle class and working class in this sample) might be expected to have aspirations for moving into a higher social status then their present one. The perception of college in the more practical terms of preparation for a career is characteristic of such a group, since the sacrifices, financial and otherwise, that would be necessary in order to go to college would tend to prevent them from being able to view a college goal in terms of enrichment of one's essentially leisure hours. Since high Impulse Expression is also related to class, the fact that the perception of college in terms of preparation for a career shows a non-significant correlation with Impulse Expression, suggests that Defiant girls making this choice have two possible class origins—one from the higher status groups (middle-class), high impulse expressing girls, and the other from the lower-class, low impulse expressing girls. The middle-class Defiant girl would presumably be in a position to make the choice of career-preparation in accordance with her personal wishes, while the girl in the lower-class group may have additional pressures of economic security and upward mobility aspirations as determinants of college seen in terms of career preparation. However, a test of these conjectures must wait on further research.

Although the remaining measures of the hypothesis, as they stand, are not significantly related to Compliance-Defiance, they do

provide data which can be analyzed with reference to the interaction of social class with Compliance-Defiance, as just outlined.

Such an exploratory analysis of the data represents a digression, but in view of the fact that these predictions are central to the general thesis, such a digression seems warranted.

Prediction 8 concerns occupational goals. The data for both measures of this prediction center around the choice of teaching (or Education) as a career. Inasmuch as teaching is commonly seen as the path of social mobility (especially in the transition from laboring-class to middle-class status), the emphasis on teaching as a career choice adds further relevance to the analysis of these data in terms of social class.

The first of these two measures is based on an unfinished story in which it was expected that Compliant girls would choose the ending "Remains in elementary school teaching," and Defiant girls would select "Goes to graduate school." The fact that 92 per cent of the sample chose, by one means or another, the alternative of graduate school, while only 8 per cent chose to remain in elementary school teaching, seemed virtually to nullify any expectations of a relationship with Compliance-Defiance. Because of the extreme skew of the distribution, the sample was divided simply into a higher- and lower-class group.

When the population is divided in this manner, it turns out that all the girls who chose to remain in elementary school teaching come from the lower half of the sample in terms of social class. Therefore, what may be a trend toward an association of Defiance with the choice "Remains in elementary school teaching" comes entirely from the lower-class Defiant girls. This seems to support the contention, made in connection with perceived college values, that such pressures as upward mobility and economic security contribute

to the Defiant girls' view of college in terms of practical career training.

Further support for this contention comes from the next measure; one which concerns eventual occupational goals. The original intention was to divide occupational choices into traditionally feminine versus non-feminine career choices. For example, teaching would be considered a traditionally feminine career choice, while medicine would be considered a more unusual career choice for women and would be classed as non-feminine (uncommon, more independently competitive) career choice. More than half of this sample chose teaching as a future occupation.

While this heavy concentration in one occupational category allows only a crude split according to the original hypothesis (Education being considered a traditionally feminine career choice versus Not-Education as a non-feminine career choice), it does make it possible to explore more intensively the interaction of class and Compliance-Defiance in relation to the field of teaching itself.

The data in this case permit a breakdown into four social class groups. The results of this analysis are presented in Table 9.

Remembering that the total population has a correlation of +0.12 with this measure, these results are quite startling. These results show a definite rejection of Education as an occupational choice by Defiant girls of Class III of this sample.

An additional characteristic of this population, relative to social class, is important to consider at this time. From the distribution of reported income level, it can be seen that the sample population as a whole reaches a ceiling within the middle class. For example, only three girls report their father's income as higher than $15,000 a year. The heaviest concentration falls between $5,000 and $8,000 a year. This, combined with the general

TABLE 9

INTERACTION OF SOCIAL CLASS WITH COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE IN RELATION TO EDUCATION VERSUS NOT–EDUCATION AS A FUTURE OCCUPATION

Social Class	N[a]	C-D r	p[b]
I. Professional and managerial	22	0.00	n.s.
II. Entrepreneur; general "white collar"	25	0.00	n.s.
III. Craftsmen, foremen, etc. . . .	20	+0.76	< .001
IV. Skilled and unskilled labor	21	-0.13	n.s.

[a]Does not include 19 individuals for whom father's occupation was not ascertained.

[b]Two-tailed tests, since the treatment of the data here is exploratory.

knowledge of income in the geographic area of this study, make it reasonable to assume that occupations of higher status (professional, managerial, entrepreneur, etc.) may have incomes in the same range as those of an occupational status considered lower (e.g., draftsmen, foremen, highly skilled operatives, etc.).

A group coming from a social stratum where income level identifies them with the middle class while occupational status is only marginally middle class (as is the case with Class III of this sample) might show patterns of ambition that differ from other class

levels. The Defiant girl from this marginal class group may thus reject school teaching as a career because it is not far enough removed from the lower-class identity. Meanwhile, the relative economic security of the group allows her greater freedom in choice of a training program. She may be in a position to consider post-graduate training as economically feasible, for example, in contrast to her lower-class classmate.

In any case, the most striking and obvious conclusion to be drawn from these findings is that the interaction of social class with Compliance-Defiance might be important in the behavioral manifestation of attitudes toward occupational choice.

In terms of the original hypothesis (that Defiance is associated with a career choice other than a traditionally "feminine" one), the high correlation of Defiance with occupational goals outside of teaching, in at least one segment of the population, suggests that the hypothesis has some validity. In a population with a wider range of occupational goals, and a sample that is sizable enough to be controlled for social class, the hypothesized relationship would perhaps emerge with greater clarity.

The remaining two measures of this group have to do with attitudes toward mothers who work. Here another factor was considered relevant; that is, the kind of model the girl might have for differing role adjustments. Forty-one girls in the sample have mothers who work either full or part-time. This group, called the Working Mothers group, was analyzed separately in relation to these measures.

The Working Mothers group was analyzed, first, according to class membership. While the sample is small (n = 32 for Social Class and Working Mothers combined), it does permit a two-way class break. The group divided nearly in half, according to

occupational codes, into "upper" and "lower" class (see Appendix A, for code and distribution).

The fact that the mothers work is not in itself related to social class, but Compliance-Defiance, within the Working Mothers group, has a correlation of +0.27 with social class. That is, upper-class daughters of working mothers tend to be Defiant; lower-class daughters of working mothers tend to be Compliant. While this is not a significant correlation (p is about .10), it seems an important tendency to report, in that it indicates that this subgroup does not differ, in this respect, from the total sample population.

Table 10 reports the results of the analysis of the Working Mothers group regarding the two predictions: Defiance is associated (1) with approval of working mothers and (2) with an earlier return to work after having children.

TABLE 10

RELATIONSHIP OF COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE TO ATTITUDES TOWARD WORKING MOTHERS AS EXPRESSED BY THE DAUGHTERS OF WORKING MOTHERS

Measure	N[a]	C-D r	p[b]
Approves of working mothers . . .	40	+0.21	n.s.
Time of return to work after having children	39	+0.34	< .05

[a]Variation in N is due to number of persons from whom an answer was not obtained.

[b]Two-tailed test.

When these results are compared with those of Table 8 (p. 57), it can be seen that the relationship of Defiance to these measures, within the Working Mothers group, is very different from that obtained with the total sample. The correlation of Defiance with approval of working mothers (in accordance with the prediction) goes from zero to +0.21, while the correlation of Defiance with favoring an early return to work after children emerges at a .05 level of significance. Being the daughter of a working mother clearly has an effect on the attitude of these girls toward continuing a working role in addition to the wife-and-mother role.

In order to explore this effect further, this group was also analyzed with respect to three measures from Hypothesis VI concerning attitudes preferred in a husband (predictions 3, 4, and 5 of Table 7). Again, all three measures show a higher correlation of Defiance with attitudes favoring a combination of career and marriage.

Of the three, the measure most closely related to attitudes about one's own career is that of preference for a career-allowing husband. In the Working Mothers group, this measure has a correlation with Defiance of +0.40. This correlation is significant at the .01 level, as compared with the non-significant correlation of +0.14 of this measure with Defiance in the total population.

The fact that these forty-one girls have, as present models, mothers who have made an adjustment to a dual role, may mean that these questions have a more present reality to these girls than to the remainder of the sample. The model of variation in role adjustment that the mother presents may allow these Defiant girls to commit themselves more openly to attitudes which, though contrary to the dominant social value, have a reality in terms of their own observations.

The demonstration of this feature of the girls' background as a tangible influence on her attitudes is further evidence of the complexity of issues involved in the attempt to measure the behavioral manifestations of the basic personality orientation of Compliance or Defiance. Future research in this area might well focus on groups that are homogeneous on such dimensions as social class, and characteristics of the mother-model. One wonders, for example, about whether a model for Compliant girls (perhaps of community-oriented, volunteer-group mothers) might have uncovered a similar effect on the choices their daughters make. Unfortunately, information about mothers in this sample did not include such data. The effect on the findings of these measures of sorting out the Working Mothers group is an indication of the richness of information that explorations into various kinds of mothering models might provide.

Hypothesis VIII

Hypothesis VIII concerns what might generally be categorized as "the feminine world." The hypothesis states:

Hypothesis VIII. More Compliant than Defiant girls indicate a primary interest in traditional feminine community activities and feminine interests.

Two quite different predictions were made to test this hypothesis. The first concerns identification with an aspect of the feminine role that includes participation in community activities of a volunteer or charitable nature. In years past this was perhaps more specifically oriented toward such institutions as church work, private charities, and community social gatherings. In more recent years, the role has increasingly included such service-centered organizations as Red Cross, PTA, School Board, League of Women

Voters, and so forth. The extent to which such organizational work has become incorporated into the conventional wife-and-mother role may be seen by even a casual perusal of studies of modern society, especially those such as Crestwood Heights (Seeley et al., 1956) that describe the various aspects of suburban living.

A glance at Table 11 will suffice to show that the predicted association of such roles with Compliance-Defiance receives no support from the present research. It may be simply that these activities have become such an expected part of one's community obligations that it is not separated in terms of domestic versus non-domestic, conventional versus non-conventional role-choices. However, information with respect to the mother as a model for this kind of activity might produce an effect in relation to the Compliant girl comparable to that of the working mother in relation to the Defiant girl.

The second prediction for this hypothesis was based on the assumption of a preference for the less aggressive, less active girl-child by Compliant women. The non-significant correlation that

TABLE 11

RELATIONSHIP OF COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE AND IES TO MEASURES OF HYPOTHESIS VIII: FEMININE INTERESTS

Measure	N	C-D r	p	IES r	p
Women's clubs	104	0.00	n.s.	0.00	n.s.
Prefer girl	94	-0.11	n.s.	0.00	n.s.

was found for this measure may indicate a deeper level of personality as a determinant of this choice than the superficial qualities at first considered. In addition to the trend we hypothesized, there may be a counteracting trend toward association of Defiance with preference for a girl-child, which may reflect rejection of the masculine sex or conflict over sexuality that was discussed in considering the relationship of Defiance with sexual identification problems. More extended research in the area of both predictions would be necessary before any conclusions could be drawn about this hypothesis.

Hypothesis IX

Hypothesis IX. More Compliant than Defiant girls indicate a reluctance to compete with men, intellectually and socially.

This hypothesis receives no support from the findings (Table 12). The predictions for this hypothesis were based on two "typical" college situations where resolution of the problem presented was

TABLE 12

RELATIONSHIP OF COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE AND IES TO MEASURES OF HYPOTHESIS IX: COMPETITION WITH MEN

Measure	N	C-D r	p	IES r	p
Intellectual competition	104	0.00	n.s.	0.00	n.s.
Social competition	104	+0.12	n.s.	+0.07	n.s.

expected to elicit responses characteristic of future role resolutions. The first problem concerns taking a course generally considered to be an all-male course. The second has to do with running against a boy-friend for president of a campus club.[1]

It is possible that these situations were not perceived as conflict situations from the point of view of role adaptation. In the first instance (taking the course), one might assume that the fact of just beginning a college career makes academic achievement a more salient feature of this story than sex-role conflict.

The second story introduces, in addition to the competition with the boy-friend, such elements as loyalty to the club and to one's supporters. At this time in their careers, loyalty to friends may be the more important emphasis. A comparison of answers to similar questions by senior girls, with the background of several years of college experience and a future more concerned with marriage prospects, might yield a shift in the emphasis of the story as perceived by college women. These speculations, however, bring up the whole question of change in role-conceptions and sex-role adaptations that occur during college—as a function of college experience, age, marriage prospects, career ambitions, or some combination of these. Again, it becomes an area for future research.

Hypothesis X

Hypothesis X. More Compliant than Defiant girls are reluctant to depart from conventional or expected behavior patterns.

---

[1]These stories are given in the text of the Interview Schedule in Appendix A (Monteith Women's Interview).

The predictions of this hypothesis were based, as were those of the previous hypothesis, on possible "problem" situations occurring in a college setting. The first story presents the conflict over high academic achievement versus an extracurricular activity. The particular activity chosen (newspaper work) is one which, on many large college campuses, combines popular acclaim and recognition with a virtual "career" within the college campus. These were, of course, the features which were expected to appeal to the Defiant girl. A sense of duty and anxiety over jeopardizing one's academic record were expected to lead the Compliant girl to give up the outside activity.

This seems to be one of the most accurate predictions of the present research (Table 13). The situation involves features which were considered descriptive of the Defiant Personality—a nonconforming or rebellious attitude toward expected behavior patterns, and an inclination to make an impulsive decision, that is, to take present gains over long-term goals. In addition, it presents a situation in which a career-like pursuit is taken up concurrently with

TABLE 13

RELATIONSHIP OF COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE AND IES TO MEASURES OF HYPOTHESIS X: EXPECTED BEHAVIOR

Measure	N	C-D r	p	IES r	p
Accepts staff position	102	+0.20	< .025	+0.19	= .05
Keeps new friends	98	-0.19	n.s.	+0.24	< .02

another on-going role—in this case, student. The association of Defiance is, as predicted, with the choice of accepting the staff position on the paper.

The intention of the second story was to present a situation in which adoption of a "questionable" group of new friends in college brings about a threatened alienation from a "proper" group of old friends. The predicted relationship was not upheld by the findings.

There is, however, a further exploration of these results that is relevant for this particular college population. This is, again, the effect of social class as a determinant of the results of both predictions relative to Hypothesis XI.

Some aspects of the relationship of Compliance-Defiance and social class have already been mentioned in connection with educational goals (cf. Hypothesis VII). A division of the sample in higher and lower class groups in relation to the present predictions yields some interesting results.

A comparison of the two class groups with the two predictions may be found in Table 14. An examination of the table shows that the relationship of Compliance-Defiance and Impulse Expression to the decision to pursue the newspaper work comes primarily from the higher status group although there is a contribution from the lower status group. In the case of choosing new over old friends, the negative correlation comes entirely from the lower class.

The definite class split between the two measures brings to mind some of the findings previously discussed. For example, in discussing Hypothesis I, the combination of high Impulse Expression and Defiance was seen as an indication of a more flexible defense structure. An individual in whom these characteristics are combined may have freer access to new ideas and adaptations and

TABLE 14

RELATIONSHIP OF COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE AND IES TO MEASURES OF HYPOTHESIS XI WITH RESPECT TO SOCIAL CLASS

Measure	N	C-D r	p[a]	IES r	p[a]
Higher Class					
News staff story	43	+0.26	< .10	+0.35	< .05
New/old friends	42	0.00	n.s.	+0.28	< .10
Lower Class					
News staff story	41	+0.14	n.s.	+0.12	n.s.
New/old friends	39	-0.53	< .001	+0.12	n.s.

[a]Two-tailed test, throughout.

enough inner stability to move out actively and experiment with, or take advantage of, whatever opportunities and experiences the environment offers.

Another factor might be considered. Going to college is in itself an active moving out for the lower-class girl. It certainly represents a major departure from her family background and class level. Academic standing would have a different meaning, perhaps even a different function, in this case. Instead of meeting family standards in a more or less established middle-class pattern, maintaining a good academic standing is necessary in order to maintain the access into a new life pattern altogether. What she is rebelling

against is her class membership. This would be so whether her family approves or disapproves of the move.

In this context, we can see why it is the "higher" class group in this sample that is largely responsible for the correlation with the news staff prediction. Their membership in the middle class provides them with enough security to be able to choose variant paths of behavior, to take a chance that they can manage all right anyway. For the lower-class girl, the margin of freedom and risk is already taken up by the fact of going to college.

In regard to the second prediction, choosing new and different friends over old established friends, two lines of reasoning enter into the consideration of the relationship of social class and the predictor variables. For the "higher" social class, the higher correlation with Impulse Expression (Table 14) seems to indicate that greater flexibility in the defense structure, whether of Compliant or Defiant girls, is the more relevant determinant of the choice of new, different, even "radical" friends. Once more the relative security of this group in this college setting must contribute to the choice. For example, this university campus, though a large one, is almost entirely non-residential. Perhaps because of this, or perhaps for some very different reason, it seems not to be subject to as much sorority or fraternity "in-group" pressures as exist on campuses of comparable size. The question of acceptance into the major university activities or power positions may not be determined by acceptance into these fraternal organizations. Anxieties over conforming or non-conforming to group pressures at this campus may be drawn on very different lines. The story under consideration was aimed at the kind of in-group pressures that surround acceptance by sorority or fraternity-like groups. If these pressures do not exist, the solution to the problem that the

story presents would be based on individual judgments and internal pressures more than environmental ones. It is always possible, too, that the group pressures that do exist on this campus have not yet come into the awareness of these pre-freshman girls.

What then of the negative correlation between this prediction and Defiance in the lower-class girls? The Defiant girl was expected to be attracted by the exciting, different, even "radical" tinge that the "new" group was described as possessing. From a consideration of the results in the light of class structure, it seems that the most important feature is loyalty to old friends versus "dropping" them for greener pastures. If, for example, the parents of these lower-class girls are primarily interested in the upwardly mobile move that sending a daughter to college means to them, they may wish that the girl move into new friendship groups, with "better" people, people who already belong to the status group into which they would like to move, or see their daughter move. In this case, dropping old friends may mean dropping "low-class" friends and thereby following the parents' explicit or implicit wishes in relation to class mobility. In this situation, Defiance may express itself without jeopardizing the hard-won college goal and with particular reference to defying the parents.

Further exploration of parental attitudes, or of the student's perception of the parent's feeling about college, would be necessary in order to confirm this conjecture. The emergence of such a strong correlation in the lower-class group alone is very suggestive that this reasoning is relevant to the expression of Defiance in this instance.

Since none of the Group II (Role Variables) hypotheses were validated through support of all the predictions subsumed under it, some confusion about exactly what is upheld and what is not is inescapable. A summary of the findings in relation to the single basic

hypothesis seems to be the simplest way to collect the diversity into a meaningful pattern. Therefore, these findings will be presented, not in relation to the particular hypotheses of Group II, but in relation to whether they support the basic position of the general hypothesis. This hypothesis states: Compliant girls tend to accept the traditional role of wife and mother, while Defiant girls indicate a desire to continue with career goals and to be conflicted over the exclusive adoption of the wife-and-mother role.

Summary of Group II Findings

The relationship of Compliance to acceptance of the traditional role of wife and mother and of Defiance to a sense of role-conflict as evidenced by a desire for a personal career, is supported by:

1. The association of Defiance with a preferred time of marriage that is five or more years later than graduation from college (Table 7).

2. The association of Defiance with a perception of college in terms of training for a career and of Compliance, in terms of self-enrichment (Table 8).

3. The association of Defiance with the acceptance of a "career" role (newspaper staff) in addition to the current "student" role and of Compliance with a rejection of the dual role (Table 13).

In addition to these instances of support of the hypothesized relationship of Compliance and Defiance to the role variables, an excessive proportion of the remaining correlations falling outside the probable error are in the predicted direction. These should be

noted as contributing support for the general thesis since some, at least, must be expected to be supported by further research.

These findings are:

1. The tendency for Defiance to be associated with a preference for a marriage partner who wants his wife to continue her career interests as well as be a wife and mother (Table 8).

2. The tendency of Defiance to be associated with rejection of a marriage partner who disapproves altogether of women working (Table 8).

3. The association of Defiance with preference for an occupational goal other than the traditionally feminine one of teaching school (Table 8).

4. The tendency for Defiance to be associated with a desire to return to work after children earlier in the lives of the children than do Compliant girls (Table 8).

5. The tendency for Defiance to be associated with the choice of equal competition with men for position as a campus leader as a problem-story ending (Table 12).

Inspection of the measures used to test the predictions of the separate hypotheses will show that the above findings represent those out of the total group that are most relevant to the question of career versus non-career as part of the role adaptation anticipated by these young women.

However, there are several predictions relevant to the career versus non-career choice that receive no support from the findings. These are:

1. The association of Compliance with plans to stop working after marriage (Table 7).

2. The association of Compliance with disapproval of mothers working (Table 8).

3. The association of Defiance with a rejection of traditionally feminine community activities (clubs, volunteer work, etc.) (Table 11).

These findings were discussed in the text in terms of indicating a general change in role-conceptions on the part of women in this culture. There is some suggestion in these data that the most marked change may be in the conception of the role of wife, rather than in the role of mother, in that working either before or after the years of children's dependency and presence in the home seems to present no conflict to these young women. Exploration of such a hypothesized change in role conceptions would seem to be a worthwhile area for future research in feminine role adaptations.

Exploratory analysis of several specific measures in terms of two background features, social class and a mother who works outside the home, indicates that these background features have a significant effect on the relationship with Compliance-Defiance.

The most marked effect of social class occurs in connection with occupational choice. This effect is notable in relation to anticipated occupation (Education versus Non-Education), in a projective story about educational goals, and in relation to a career-like pursuit within the college setting (newspaper staff work). The relationship of Compliance-Defiance with other, more specifically sex-role variables, do not show any appreciable effect of class origin. However, the fact that both Defiance and high Impulse Expression show a trend in the direction of association with higher

social status, suggests that the effect of social class may enter into the other relationships with the dimension of Compliance-Defiance in ways too subtle to be picked up in these data. In any case, there seems to be enough evidence of the effect of social class to warrant control of this variable in future research with the measure.

The effect of having a mother who works emerges in all areas connected with sex-role variables; that is, those in which the role of wife and mother comes into conflict with, or juxtaposition to, career ambitions. Among girls belonging to this segment of the sample population (Working Mothers group), the following findings are important to note:

1. The predicted association of Defiance with a preference for a marriage partner who wants his wife to continue her career interests rises to a $<.01$ level of significance, as compared with a non-significant finding with the total population (p. 64).

2. The predicted association of Defiance with attitudes favoring return to work while the children are still young enough to be dependent rises to a $<.05$ level of significance as compared with a non-significant finding with the total population (Table 10).

In addition, all but one of the measures having to do with attitudes favoring working outside the home emerge with appreciably higher correlations with Defiance in the Working Mothers group as compared with the total population. The one measure for which this is not so (work after marriage) seems to be the result of a general shift in favor of working wives in a family unit that does not include children. When the career ambition comes into conflict with the child-rearing years, the association of Defiance with continuing

career pursuits emerges in contrast to the Compliant position of putting off career pursuits until the children are self-sufficient.

The effect of the model presented to the girl who has a working mother was considered most important in terms of providing an increased awareness of the expanded dimension of role adaptation open to women. This awareness may be the most characteristic manifestation of the Defiant orientation in relation to role resolution.

Finally, the results of this research provide evidence in support of the hypothesized difference in the role adaptations of the different personality types. The following chapter will present some of the implications of this difference for continuing research in this area, as well as implications of such differing attitudes toward the mothering role as it affects the society as a whole.

CHAPTER V

SUMMARY AND IMPLICATIONS

This research was designed to determine whether certain personality characteristics are associated with differing attitudes toward an expected social role. The research is specifically concerned with role conflict in women resulting from ambiguous or conflicting ambitions and their effect on attitudes surrounding the adoption of the expected role of wife and mother.

Two personality types, Compliant and Defiant, were established on the basis of a projective test. The test was designed to discriminate individuals according to personality characteristics deriving from different resolutions of anal conflict.

Two groups of hypotheses were developed in relation to these two personality types. The first group represents an attempt to expand the description of the personality structure of Compliant and Defiant persons. The hypothesized relationships with personality variables are based on psychoanalytic theory of personality development. These hypotheses (referred to as Group I hypotheses) are concerned with the relationship of Compliance and Defiance to such dimensions of personality as impulse expression, masochism, narcissism-exhibitionism, sexual identification, superego development, and submissiveness.

The second group of hypotheses are concerned with the relationship of Compliance and Defiance with different adaptations to a possible conflict of career and wife-and-mother roles. These hypotheses (Group II hypotheses) center around such areas as ambitions in

addition to marriage and family, educational goals, traditional community roles (clubs, PTA, civic endeavors, etc.), feelings about competition with men, and degree of conformity to conventional standards of behavior.

Findings of Group I Hypotheses

The findings support the Group I hypotheses concerning personality correlates of Compliance in the following instances:

1. The association of Compliance with constriction in impulse expression.

2. The association of Compliance with a masochistic orientation toward a desired role.

3. The association of Compliance with non-erotized narcissism-exhibitionism.

4. The association of Compliance with a strongly internalized superego (as measured by internalization of parental standards.

The hypothesized relationship of Defiance with other personality correlates was upheld by the findings in the following instances:

1. The association of Defiance with lability of impulse expression.

2. The association of Defiance with a more unformed, or incompletely internalized superego.

The following hypotheses from Group I were not supported by the findings:

1. The predicted relationship of Defiance with erotized narcissism-exhibitionism was not upheld.

2. The predicted relationship of Compliance-Defiance to measures of sexual identification were not upheld.

In addition to the findings listed above, characteristics classed as Defiant on Scale I of the Figure-Drawing Test should also be considered as indicating an association of Defiance with some aspect of narcissism-exhibitionism. Exactly how these aspects differ from those of the Compliant end of the rating scale seems to warrant further clarification. Perhaps more important than the hypothesized relationship of Defiance with sexually provocative behavior (which was not borne out by the data) is the use of humor as an outlet of aggression. Both caricature and sarcasm, for example, appear at the "Defiant" end of the rating scale (Scale I). A relationship emerges in connection with this more inclusive scale, as opposed to the scale which focuses on the one aspect of a Defiant orientation measured by Scale II (Erotized narcissism-exhibitionism).

This seems to be an important finding in terms of its implications for further research. The fact that a relationship can be shown to exist between these very different measures (a verbal projective test and a set of figure drawings) indicates that there is some basic orientation that is consistently expressed in the different areas of experience. The findings with regard to sexual identification, using the same figure-drawing test, provide a further direction for continuing research with these measures. For example, the trends reported for "single-sex" series of drawings as opposed to "different-sex" series of drawings, as discussed in Chapter III, indicate that the identification process, as represented in figure drawings, is very likely a much more complex phenomenon than it has previously been considered to be.

It has commonly been assumed, among users of projective drawing tests, that drawing a figure of the opposite sex, by preference, indicates a tendency to be more identified with that sex.

Yet our findings suggest that drawing all female figures, for example, may have different meanings for women of different personality types. The confusion in the issue is particularly pointed up by the tendency for the Compliant girls (in other areas of the study identified with a "traditionally feminine" orientation) to draw six male figures, which is quite the contrary of standard expectations.

The implication is that a more intensive investigation of these patterns of identification, when associated with other dimensions of the personality, might provide us with a better understanding of the identification process as a whole. While the findings from this study are far from conclusive in this area, they do provide a discernable trend as an indication of the direction that such research might take. For example, using two such measures of personality as appear in the present research, Compliance-Defiance and Impulse Expression, it appears probable that a much clearer picture of the identification process might be obtained in a sample large enough to permit a four-way analysis of the figure drawings—that is, with high and low impulse expressors among Defiant girls and high and low impulse expressors among Compliant girls.

A profitable direction for further research may also be found in other areas of the relationship of Compliance-Defiance with the personality correlates measured in this study. For example, the measure of a masochistic orientation used in this study was based on an expression of attitudes and feelings toward the mothering role. This role is generally accepted as one that is universally desired by young women in this culture, and therefore fits our needs for a measure in which negative attitudes might be expressed toward a desired role.

A recent survey (Gurin, Veroff, and Feld, 1960) which reports attitudes toward parenthood from a national sample of men and women of all age groups, states that women more often than men emphasize negative aspects of the role and reflect feelings of loss of freedom, or of being "tied down" in connection with the role of mother. "Apparently women are more bothered by the burdens of parenthood," this report states, "especially by the restrictions that come from their greater interaction with children and the feeling of being 'tied' to the house," while men "differ from women in more often stressing satisfactions that come from influencing their children or the satisfactions involving ambitions and accomplishments" (pp. 129f).

Goldsen's survey (1960) of college women's attitudes toward the mothering role, as reported above in this thesis (p. 35), is consistent with the findings for the women of this national survey. In the present study, both the attitudes reported above are expressed by the college women in this sample—the first (women's attitude) being associated with Compliance, and the second (men's attitude), associated with Defiance. In the national survey, these attitudes are related to other general aspects of role functioning of men and women. What does it mean, then, when the two orientations are shown also to be related to different personality types within one sex group?

Presumably the difference in dominant attitudes would have an effect on the actual performance of the mothering role by these young women. One might wonder if the Compliant girls, having a more realistic view of the demands of the mothering role to begin with, might make a better adjustment to the performance of the role. Or, conversely, the Defiant girls, with a more active and positive view of the role, might make a more flexible adjustment which

allows them, as individuals, to feel less "tied down" and more rewarded in their role performance.

The present study goes only so far as to indicate that a difference in attitudes toward the mothering role does exist in the two types of women. This finding can be considered only as a first step toward a definition of feminine role adaptations, but it is one which sets the stage for an additional approach to research in this area.

We have assumed throughout this research that the choice of career goals by Defiant girls would not preclude, in their thinking, the adoption of the wife-and-mother role. Positive attitudes toward career goals were felt to indicate a turning away from feelings of dependency or submissiveness which might be associated with their conception of the wife-and-mother role. Presumably, this would be reflected in desires for more active and independent roles which fall outside the conventional role of wife and mother.

The findings of Group I hypotheses seem to support these assumptions regarding the Defiant personality, both in the findings listed above and in the attitudes toward the mothering role just discussed.

The findings relating to the perception of a role-conflict which may occur as a result of the personality and attitudes of these girls are discussed in connection with the Group II hypotheses.

Findings of Group II Hypotheses

These hypotheses, as stated in Chapter I, derive from a statement of the basic assumption of this study: that Compliant girls tend to accept the traditional feminine role and renounce career goals, while Defiant girls tend to maintain career goals and to

manifest conflict over the exclusive adoption of the wife-and-mother role.

As stated in Chapter IV, the results of the role variables seem to be more clearly absorbed when they are stated in terms of the predictions directly relating to the basic hypothesis, rather than being subsumed under the four separate hypotheses, as originally planned. The predicted relationship with Compliance-Defiance was upheld in the following instances:

1. The association of Compliance with a preferred time of marriage within five years, and of Defiance with a time of marriage that is five or more years later than graduation from college.

2. The association of Compliance with a perception of college in terms of self-enrichment, and of Defiance with a perception of college in terms of training for a career.

3. The association of Compliance with a rejection of a "career" role (newspaper staff) in addition to the current "student" role, and of Defiance, with the acceptance of this dual role.

Some contribution to the support of the general position may be taken from the fact that, for five additional predictions, the findings were consistent with the direction of the prediction. These findings were summarized as "tendencies" and are reported only for those correlations that fall between .25 and .05 probability levels. They are:

1. The tendency for Defiance to be associated with a preference for a marriage partner who wants his wife to continue her career interests as well as be a wife and mother.

2. The tendency for Defiance to be associated with rejection of a marriage partner who disapproves altogether of women working.

3. The tendency for Defiance to be associated with an occupational goal other than the traditionally feminine one of school teaching.

4. The tendency for Defiance to be associated with a desire to return to work at an earlier time in the lives of the children than do Compliant girls.

5. The tendency for Defiance to be associated with the choice of equal competition with men for position as a campus leader as a problem-story ending.

The following predictions related to career plans were not upheld by the data:

1. The predicted association of Compliance with plans to stop working after marriage.

2. The predicted association of Compliance with disapproval of mothers working.

3. The predicted association of Defiance with a rejection of traditionally feminine community activities (clubs, volunteer work, etc.).

Probably of even greater interest, with respect to implications for further research, are findings related to explorations of the data in regard to two background features of the environment of this sample: (1) social class, and (2) having a mother who works.

Social class showed particularly marked effects on the choice of Compliant and Defiant girls in connection with educational and occupational goals, and, again, in friendship bonds.

With regard to predictions in these areas, the data show that:

1. Marginally middle-class Defiant girls overwhelmingly reject the traditionally feminine occupation of school teacher in favor of other (though unspecified) career goals.

2. Lower-class Defiant girls (a) reject plans for graduate school as a problem-story ending, and (b) tend to choose school-teaching as a career goal.

The assumption is that both these findings are related to the particular mobility strivings of these two groups of girls.

Social class also effects the relationship of Compliance and Defiance to the choice of new over old friends. The findings were opposite to the prediction. Analysis in terms of social class shows that the relationship found is entirely within the lower half of the class grouping. Defiant girls of this group choose to keep their old friends. This also seems to be related, in some way, to mobility aspirations. Perhaps it reflects an additional source of conflict in the role adjustment of these girls for whom upward mobility is largely motivated by economic gains rather than social striving.

In any case, these findings demonstrate a need for control on social class variables in future research of this kind. This seems particularly relevant to the area of occupational and career ambitions. However, the reported class-tied finding with regard to friendship shows that social class has a more pervasive effect on the orientation of Defiant and Compliant girls than simply in occupational areas and suggests that expression of Compliance and Defiance may take quite different forms in different class groups. An exploration of such differences would seem to be an important feature for future research with this personality dimension.

An additional area of control seems warranted when one considers the effect of the working mother as a model to these girls. The findings indicate that Defiant girls whose mothers work emerge with a stronger commitment toward combining career and mothering roles than is shown in the sample as a whole. In this

subgroup, Defiance is significantly related to preference for a husband who wants his wife to continue her career interests as well as be a wife and mother, and to attitudes favoring an early return to work after children. Defiant girls who are daughters of working mothers also tend to plan to continue their careers after marriage, to reject as a husband a man who disapproves of women working, and to have an accepting attitude toward mothers working.

However, from studies which include the attitudes of men toward women's roles (and one might particularly cite the Goldsen et al. survey of college students) it can be seen that a thorough evaluation of role adjustment in women should include an assessment of how much conflict the women might experience vis-a-vis their husbands' wishes for them. There is, for example, the suggestion in Goldsen's study that male students are less desirous of having a wife work than female students are of being a working wife (Goldsen et al., 1960, p. 48). This aspect of role conflict in women was outside the scope of the present research, but is certainly pertinent to the question of feminine role adaptation.

Several other questions suggest themselves in connection with the hypotheses that were not upheld, or which appear at levels below significance. In the first case, the possibility of changing conceptions of feminine roles in the culture in general was discussed in Chapter IV. The data suggest that the most marked change may be in connection with the role of wife, rather than the role of mother. There seem, for example, no longer any major sanctions against the working wife, while, at the same time, attitudes toward the working mother seem more open to variation. The years during which children are expected to be in the home appear to be the years around which differences between the more traditional attitudes toward the mothering role, and the less conventional splitting

of mothering and career roles, are centered. Further exploration of attitudes toward parenthood and the performance of parent roles seems indicated in order to assess the nature and degree of such a change in feminine role conceptions and adaptations.

A second question arises in connection with the tendencies toward differing role adaptations on the part of the two types of girls, as reported in the data. It seems possible (and to some extent the exploratory findings with respect to daughters of working mothers support this suggestion) that the girls in this sample, just beginning their college careers, and not presently faced with a choice of roles, are not yet fully aware of a conflict of roles. It is possible that when marriage and family commitments are closer at hand, the conflict may be more salient. It is also possible, however, that such awareness may not fully emerge, for many girls at least, until some role commitment has actually taken place. Such a suggestion is offered by Goldsen et al.: "The conflict [between career and mothering], if it exists at all, is likely to occur much later, during the years when the young, college-trained mother is raising her pre-school children" (1960, p. 57).

In order to assess the differences in role attitudes and role adaptations of the two types of women described in this study, and to determine the extent to which such differences result in differing adjustments or role performances, it seems appropriate to consider investigations at two further age levels, as a continuation of the present research. The first of these would be at the time of the senior year of college, when the young women would perhaps be facing a career choice; and the second, during the early mothering years, when the adaptation to the mothering role could be more directly and immediately evaluated.

In summary, the present study has indicated that research in the area of differential role adjustment according to the personality structure of the individual is a relevant and possibly fruitful area of research. While the present study seems to be useful primarily as an exploratory step in such research, the findings show that differences do exist in the kinds of role choices different types of women make, or want to make. The research ends by posing more questions than it answers. It leaves for future research, for example, the exploration of such areas as the meaning of such differences in terms of the eventual role adjustment of the individual women, in terms of the adjustment of the family to different patterns of family living, or of children to different patterns of mothering, and eventually, perhaps, to the meaning of these differences in terms of the cultural values surrounding family living in general.

APPENDIX A

QUESTIONS FROM THE INTERVIEW SCHEDULE AND PERSONAL HISTORY QUESTIONNAIRE

MONTEITH WOMEN'S INTERVIEW

FOR WOMEN ONLY

Interviewer's name _____

Respondent's identification number _____

NOW I WOULD LIKE TO ASK YOU SOME QUESTIONS ABOUT YOUR FUTURE LIFE PLANS.

1. Do you plan to marry someday?

2a. When do you think would be the best time to marry?

a. Now
b. In about five years
c. In about ten years
d. At least ten years from now

2b. Why?

3. Do you think a woman should work, or have a career of her own, after marriage?

4. Thinking about a woman's life, how is a woman's life changed by marriage?

5. Do you look forward to being active in community affiars, such as civic organizations, community women's clubs, League of Women Voters, etc.?

6a. Do you plan to have children someday?

6b. How many children would you like?

7. Thinking about a woman's life, how is a woman's life changed by having children?

8. Do you look forward to belonging to parents' groups, such as PTA, child study groups, etc.?

9. Do you think a woman should work, or have a career of her own, after having children?

10a. When do you think would be the best time for a woman to return to work after having children? (ASK ALL WOMEN)

a. When the infant is old enough to be cared for by a good baby-sitter.
b. When child is ready to start school.
c. When children are relatively self-sufficient.
d. When children have left home altogether.

(ASK ONLY THOSE SELECTING ALTERNATIVE C)

10b. What age do you think this would be?

11a. If you think only of your own preferences and not of what your future husband might wish, which would you prefer for a first child: a boy or a girl?

11b. Why is that?

12. If you had a daughter, how would you like her to be different from you?

(IF RESPONSE IS "I DON'T KNOW," ASK RESPONDENT IF SHE COULD TRY TO THINK OF JUST ONE WAY IN WHICH SHE WOULD LIKE A DAUGHTER TO BE DIFFERENT)

13a. What kind of community would you like to be living in ten years from now?

a. City
b. Suburbs
c. Small town
d. Country

13a. Why?

14. Would you prefer marrying a man who wanted you to be primarily a wife and mother, or a man who wanted you to follow up your own career interests as well?

15. Would you consider giving up your career if the man you wanted to marry asked you to do so?

16. Would you consider marrying a man who disapproves entirely of women working?

NOW I AM GOING TO DESCRIBE SOME SITUATIONS WHICH MIGHT HAPPEN TO GIRLS IN COLLEGE, AND I WANT YOU TO TELL ME HOW THEY COME OUT AND WHY YOU FEEL THIS IS SO.

17. Jane is a candidate for president of a campus club. The only other candidate is Bill, a boy whom she likes and has been dating. Jane feels she has a better chance to win than Bill. However, she knows that Bill wants the office very much.

    17a. What does she do? Why?

    17b. How does she feel?

    17c. How do things go with Bill and her after that?

18. Susan is a biology major and finds that she has a choice among several courses that will complete her major. After she has elected the course, she finds that it is one that is almost exclusively chosen by men, and that the few women who have taken the course in the past have not done well in it. She still has time to drop the course and change to one of the others.

    18a. What does she do? Why?

    18b. What effect do you think being the only girl in the course might have?

19. Pat becomes very interested in working on the college newspaper. She has put in a lot of time and has worked hard. As a result, she is being considered for a staff position on the paper. She feels that this is quite an honor. At the same time, she is finding it is impossible to keep up the necessary work on the paper and to maintain as high an academic standing as formerly.

    19a. What does she do? And why?

19b. How does she feel?

19c. How might her parents feel if her grades drop?

20. Betty and her friends have often discussed their plans for college and what sororities or fraternities they might join when there. In college, Betty becomes acquainted with a group whose attitudes and ideas are very different from her own and those of her gang. Betty knows that this group is considered "radical" and sort of "out of it," but she finds her new friends interesting and exciting. Betty's former friends are becoming cool toward her and do not share their plans with her quite as often. They indicate that her new friends are the reason for this.

20a. What does she do? And why?

20b. How does she feel?

21. Joan began her college career with the intention of becoming an elementary school teacher. As time goes on, she finds the idea of college teaching more appealing, even though this would mean doing post-graduate work for four years after college. She must make up her mind this fall, since she cannot complete both the requirements for a teaching certificate and the necessary courses to qualify for graduate school.

21a. What does she do? Why?

21b. How does she feel about it?

QUESTIONS TAKEN FROM MONTEITH PROGRAM STUDY INTERVIEW

24a. Different people want different things from college. Read through the list of things people may want from college, and I will ask you to tell me for each, whether it is important, or unimportant, as far as you are concerned.

a. Changing yourself
b. Learning to be of service tc the world
c. Preparing for your future work
d. Learning to know many different kinds of people
e. Developing values for your future
f. Making friends for life
g. Developing intellectually
h. Learning new skills
i. Meeting your future mate
j. Taking part in sports
k. Academic achievement
l. Participating in extracurricular activities
m. Learning to be independent
n. Having a good time
o. Meeting people
p. Other than these (specify)

24b. Which of these is most important to you?

24c. Which is next most important to you?

24d. Which is least important to you?

28. Coming to college means a change in relationships with parents. Do your parents want you to come to college, or are they against your coming, or don't they care?

29a. Is there some member of your family who has strongly encouraged you to come to college?

(IF YES)

29b. Who?

39a. Do you feel you are pretty much living according to your family's rules, or are you on your own?

(IF NOT ON YOUR OWN)

39b. When do you think you'll be on your own?

QUESTIONS TAKEN FROM PERSONAL HISTORY QUESTIONNAIRE

13a. What do you plan to major in?

13b. How firm do you feel your decision about this major is?

Firm, will not change _____
Fairly sure will not change _____
Tentative _____

ANSWER ONLY IF YOU ARE IN A PRE-PROFESSIONAL PROGRAM:

14a. What pre-professional program are you in?

ABOUT YOUR FUTURE:

25. What occupation or type of work do you expect to enter after you have graduated and completed any further training?

26. How firm is this decision?

Firm, will not change _____
Fairly sure, but may change _____
Tentative _____

29a. Do you expect to continue your education in a graduate or professional school? (check one)

Definitely yes _____
Probably yes _____
Probably not _____
Definitely not _____

(IF YOU CHECKED ALTERNATIVES 1 or 2)

29b. In what field of study?

33. What is your father's religious preference? (If Protestant, please list denomination. If Catholic, please note whether

Roman or Greek Orthodox. If Jewish, please note whether orthodox, reformed, or conservative.)

34. What is your mother's religious preference?

35. What is your own religious preference?

40. What is your mother's education?

Grammar school only
Some high school
Some high school and other training such as business school
Completed high school
Completed high school and other training, such as business school
Some college
Completed college
Graduate work (describe)

41. What is your father's education?

(Same classifications as above)

42a. Is your mother living?

(IF NO)

42b. How old were you when she died?

43a. Is your father living?

(IF NO)

43b. How old were you when he died?

44. Are your parents divorced or permanently separated?

45. How much conflict has there been between your parents?

Very much, Much, Some, Little, Very little?

NEIGHBORHOOD AND RESIDENTIAL HISTORY

46. In which do you live? (Please answer in terms of your home address, rather than your school residence)

    a. Two-family house
    b. Single-family house
    c. Apartment in apartment building
    d. Other (specify)

47. Do you live—

    a. In the suburbs
    b. In the outskirts of the city
    c. In the city itself

48. Where is your home address now? (Please do not answer in terms of school residence)

    (City) _____ (State) _____

49. How long have you and your family lived there? (in years)

50. Where did you live most of your life? (city, state)

51. Is this a large city, average-sized city, small city, or farm?

52. Where were you born? (city, state)

53. All Americans except the Indians were originally from another country, and even the Indians probably migrated from Asia. We would like to know about the original nationality of your family. Please give the country of origin, as far as possible.

    53a. What is the original nationality of your family on your father's side?

    53b. What is the original nationality of your family on your mother's side?

    53c. For each of the following, check whether they were born in this country, or born outside of this country.

You, yourself
Your father
Your mother
Your father's father
Your father's mother
Your mother's father
Your mother's mother

54a. Are any languages besides English spoken in your home?

(IF YES)

54b. What other languages?

58a. What is your father's job?

58b. Whom does he work for?

59. About what is his yearly income? (pre-coded)

60a. Does your mother work?

(IF YOUR MOTHER WORKS)

60b. What is your mother's job?

60c. Whom does she work for?

60d. Does your mother work (a) Full time? (b) Part time?

QUESTIONS AND RATIONALE RELATING TO HYPOTHESIS V: SUPEREGO

Hypothesis V. Compliance will be associated with a strong, internalized superego, while Defiance will be associated with a more unformed, incompletely internalized superego.

Evidence for an internalized superego was considered to be found in responses that show adherence to clearly defined or conventional moral standards, an orientation toward a regulated, controlled, and duty-oriented mode of life. A further important aspect of these responses is the perception of decisions in this area as autonomous, since this is the indication that the standards have been internalized. The opposite of the above attributes is considered evidence of a more immature, unformed superego. The attribution of decisions to others, or dependency on others for help in making decisions regarding behavior was considered indicative of incomplete internalization of standards of behavior.

Since the hypothesis is somewhat general and the area itself difficult to translate into empirical terms, data from several questions were used to test the hypothesis. These questions and the rationale behind their use are as follows:

Prediction 1. Compliant girls indicate general family encouragement to come to college, whereas Defiant girls more often cite a particular individual as the source of encouragement.

Question: Is there some member of your family who has strongly encouraged you to come to college? If so, who?

The rationale for the use of this question was that girls who mentioned a particular individual as "strongly encouraging" them to come to college were following a "model" from whom they gathered support for their choice, while girls who mentioned "the general family, no one, or no one in particular" were responding to the internalization of general standards of the family.

The code and distribution of responses for this question are:

Code	Frequency
Particular person mentioned as encouraging	47
No one, or general family mentioned	56
Total	103

Prediction 2. Compliant girls more often state that they are "on their own" regarding rules of conduct, while Defiant girls more often state that they are subject to parental rules.

Question: Do you feel you are pretty much living according to your parents' rules, or are you on your own?

This question was directed at the autonomy of decision perceived by the respondent. It was reasoned that girls answering "parents' rules" were reflecting either an imperfect internalization of parental standards or some chafing at the bonds of parental restraint. Again, "on my own" answers were seen as internalization of parental standards. The code and distribution of responses is as follows:

Code	Frequency
Parents' rules	39
Some of each	22
On my own	45
Total	106

Prediction 3. Compliant girls name internalized values as ways in which they would like a daughter to differ from themselves, while Defiant girls name recognition-seeking attributes as ways in which they would like a daughter to differ.

Question: If you had a daughter, how would you like her to be different from you?

It was felt that respondents would answer this question in terms of the qualities they most valued in themselves. That is, that Compliant girls would name such internalized values as "control over anger, neatness, being more responsible," etc., while Defiant girls would name recognition-seeking values, such as: "more talented, intelligent, beautiful, socially poised, popular," and so on. The code and frequency of responses is as follows:

Code	Frequency
Internalized values	26
Recognition-seeking qualities .	67
Total	93

Prediction 4. Compliant girls prefer suburban living, while Defiant girls prefer city living.

Question: What kind of community would you like to be living in ten years from now? City, suburbs, small town, or country?

The code and frequencies for this question are as follows:

Code	Frequency
City	23
Suburbs	55
Small town	14
Country	15
Total	107

Prediction 5. Compliant girls wish for a moderate number of children (between 2 and 4), while Defiant girls tend to fall at the extremes (none or many) in stating preferences for family size.

Question: How many children would you like?

The code and frequency of responses are as follows (summarized):

Code	Frequency
Two to four	79
Other	22
Total	101

The last two predictions were directed at an assessment of an orderly or regulated life plan, of a conventional or conservative sort. Both questions were expected to be heavily weighted in the respective categories, "suburbs" and "three children," since these choices reflect the most popular attitudes towards residence and family size at present.

It was expected that the Defiants would prefer the city as a source of excitement, change, the variety of entertainment opportunities, and even for the work opportunities that the city offers. The prediction concerning extremes in family size was based partly on the occasional rejection of planning for children, or on the opposite side, an impulsive overestimation of a desired family size.

DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION ABOUT THE SAMPLE

TIME OF GRADUATION FROM HIGH SCHOOL

Graduation Date	Frequency
June, 1959	94
February, 1959	1
June, 1958	5
More than 3 years ago	2
Not answered	3
Total	105

RACE

White	97
Negro	7
Oriental	1
Total	105

RELIGIOUS AFFILIATION OF THE WOMEN IN THE SAMPLE

Catholic	29
Protestant	57
Jewish	6
Other	2
None	7
Don't know	4
Not answered	0
Total	105

NUMBERS OF GIRLS WITH WORKING MOTHERS IN THE SAMPLE

Mother Works:	
Full time	19
Part time	22
Not at all	63
Not answered	1
Total	105

NATIONAL BACKGROUND OF GIRLS IN THE SAMPLE

	Father	Mother
British	33	37
West European	22	20
East European	27	24
French	6	7
Greek	2	2
Italian	3	3
Spanish	1	0
Negro	3	4
Near Eastern	2	2
Far Eastern	1	0
Other	4	3
Not answered	1	3
Total	105	105

DISTRIBUTION OF THE SAMPLE ACCORDING TO FATHER'S OCCUPATION

The occupational groupings were made in the following manner. Father's occupations were coded according to these general categories:

Occupational Code	Frequency
1. Professional, technical, and kindred workers	20
2. Managers, officials, and proprietors	2
3. Clerical and kindred workers	10
4. Sales workers	15
5. Craftsmen, foremen, and kindred workers	20
6. Operatives and kindred workers	12
7. Laborers and service workers (unskilled and semi-skilled)	9
8. Farmers and farm managers	0
9. Retired	3
0. Other, unemployed, and no answer	14
Total	105

The groups divided into four nearly equal sub-groups on the basis of this coding, with a total of 88 individuals whose father's occupations were listed. The four occupational groups used in this study were:

Occupational Codes	Frequency
I. Professional and managerial	22
II. Clerical and sales workers	25
III. Craftsmen, foremen, etc.	20
IV. Unskilled, semi-skilled, and skilled labor	21
Total	88

When two occupational groupings were used, the groups were established by combining the first two groups (I and II) and the second two groups (III and IV). These are the so-called higher class and lower class groups.

DISTRIBUTION OF FATHER'S INCOME IN THE SAMPLE

Income Code Groups	Frequency
1. Less than $3000 a year	6
2. Less than $5000 a year	11
3. Between $5000 and $8000 a year	44
4. Between $8000 and $15,000 a year	25
5. Over $15,000	3
0. Inappropriate, has no father, father unemployed	9
&. Other; don't know	5
–. Not ascertained	2
Total	105

FOREIGN LANGUAGE SPOKEN IN THE HOME

Yes	28
No	77
Total	105

EDUCATIONAL LEVEL OF THE PARENTS

Education	Father	Mother
Grammar school	15	13
Some high school	27	15
Some high school and additional training	14	14
High school	8	26
High school and additional training	5	12
Some college	10	13
College degree	13	7
Graduate school	13	5
Total	105	105

All demographic data obtained for 105 girls.

The following table presents the correlation of Compliance-Defiance to three demographic variables that were considered relevant.

RELATIONSHIP OF COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE AND IES TO THREE DEMOGRAPHIC MEASURES

Measure	N	C-D r	p	IES r	p
Father's occupational status (class)	88	+0.17	< .10	+0.16	n.s.
Father's education	105	0.00	n.s.	+0.28	< .01
Mother's education	105	+0.064	n.s.	+0.14	n.s.

APPENDIX B

CODING CRITERIA AND DISTRIBUTION FOR TESTS AND SCALES

SCORING CRITERIA FOR COMPLIANCE–DEFIANCE

PICTURE I: MESSY ROOM

The Defiant Story: In the Defiant story there is a conflict between mother and daughter with the mother insisting that the daughter clean the room. The story is scored Defiant if the girl doesn't yield to the mother's order and defies her, or if the girl yields grudgingly, sullenly, or angrily. In some cases, the story is shot through with feelings of unwillingness or mention of slowness, depression, daydreaming, etc. Very often the girl expresses negative feelings about cleaning, and there is an uncertainty about whether the girl will finally finish cleaning.

It is important to distinguish between stories in which the writer shows identification with the heroine and the type of story, sometimes told by a Compliant girl, wherein the writer judges the girl moralistically.

Example of a Defiant story:

> I believe that the picture was taken as a teenager was about to clean her room. She probably just had a disagreement with her mother either over her late hours or the condition she keeps her room in, and as punishment has been told by her parents to clean the room. In the picture she looks mad and depressed at the same time. The big blow-up probably came when she wanted to go out again or go out before cleaning her room. She probably feels persecuted. Most likely she will sit and mope but eventually she will clean her room, at least make it neat enough to pass inspection. The whole situation will probably soon be forgotten.

The Compliant Story: In the Monteith sample there seems to be one typical form of the Compliant story. The major figure in the story is seen as the mother. The mother is represented as hard-working and especially as martyred. The mother is seen as long-suffering, patient, put-upon, hard-working, and so on. Needless to say, she is not represented sarcastically.

In these stories the girl, or central figure, is basically neat. Another person, or some factor beyond the girl's control, is

responsible for the room being dirty. This could be another member of the family (husband or son), a roommate, friends, or natural causes such as an earthquake. There is no question but that the girl will clean up the room.

A story type which does not appear frequently, but is still Compliant, is one in which the girl talks moralistically about feeling better, feeling clean, feeling good, and so on, after she has cleaned the room. Cleaning is seen as an inner drive which is rewarded by feelings of self-esteem when accomplished.

Example of a Compliant story:

> It appears to me that a young boy's mother is deciding whether to clean up after her son. He left his room in a mess after coming home from school, only to go out again, leaving his room in this shocking state. The boy doesn't feel much pride in his possessions, for this carelessness may be due to his youth. But regardless of his youth, the mother will seek to train the young man in the virtues of being neat. The mother has spent all day in the house, cleaning, etc., and is feeling quite dismal upon seeing another room to clean.

The Ambivalent Story: The story is scored ambivalent when both impulses are represented, for example, when initial rebelliousness is followed by virtue triumphing, and the room is spotlessly cleaned. Or, an initially rebellious story may end with a great deal of moralizing about the virtues of cleanliness.

The Neutral Story: Neutral stories are those which do not fit clearly into the above categories. The theme of cleanliness may be completely overlooked, and the story is turned into something else. An example of such a story is one in which the woman is seen in the process of moving to a new house and having sentimental thoughts about the old one. The neutral score can also be given to very shallow or empty stories where the writer's impulse, one feels, is primarily to avoid facing up to the issue presented by the picture, to avoid telling a meaningful story.

PICTURE II: PIGGY BANK

The Defiant Story: The pure Defiant story is easy to spot and score. The girl is seen as interested exclusively in her own

pleasure. Spending is often impulsive; the girl can hardly wait to get at the money in order to spend it. Generally she spends it on something which affords her immediate gratification, such as candy, or a toy. Sometimes, a theme of robbing someone else's bank or smashing the bank to get the money is introduced. The major criterion is an unambivalent emphasis on spend the money on herself.

Example of the Defiant story:

A young girl is counting her money, for she wishes to purchase something. She is counting her money, for earlier in the day she saw a small doll in the store window, and she would like to have it if at all possible. When she returned home she emptied her bank and counted her money. She found she had enough money to purchase the doll, so she ran back and bought it. The girl is very happy she had enough money, and now has the doll she wanted.

The Compliant Story: There are two types of Compliant stories. One emphasizes altruistic spending, and the other emphasizes saving. In the first, there is an extreme emphasis on how happy the girl is going to make someone by buying a gift for them.

Example of the Altruistic story:

Little Susie in the picture is counting and recounting all that wealth in her piggy bank—each time there is a little more. Why, no wonder, it's almost Christmas shopping time; must have a present for everyone and so must sacrifice candy money for a while!

Example of the Saving theme:

Sue has just finished taking all of her money out of her piggy bank. This task is one she does every so often when she has nothing else to do. Counting her money, she finds that she has $5.85 in her bank. She has saved $1.32 since the last time she counted her money. Dropping the money back in her piggy bank, Sue is happy with herself for the amount of money she has saved in four weeks.

In the truly Compliant story, the saving is seen as virtuous, as appeasing the superego.

Ambivalent and Neutral stories are judged in the same manner as for Picture I.

PICTURE III: BATHROOM SCENE

The Defiant Story: The Defiant story stresses a conflict between the mother and the child on toilet training, in which the mother is frustrated in her attempts to train the child. The child is seen as stubborn, or difficult, or slow, or even fiendish in the training process. The mother is represented as confused or helplessly furious; generally she is represented as unable to cope with the situation. Often the story may have a happy ending in that the child is seen as trained. Such an ending is most often a perfunctory last sentence.

Example of a Defiant story:

> Before this picture was taken, the child had dirtied his pants and is at present being scolded. The mother seems to be approaching the end of her rope and as a punishment she is making the child sit on the toilet. If her patience holds out, everything will be fine—but if she loses her control, she will have a harder time training the child.

The Compliant Story: The scene is harmonious and an air of sweetness and light pervades the story. The child is seen as either completely trained or in the process of being trained. The mother has a very definite plan in mind about training the child. She is firm, though not punitive, and the child will be trained without question. The mother is loving, patient, and cooperative, and the child is cooperative and doing his best.

Example of a Compliant story:

> The mother is obviously training her child to use the toilet by herself. Before the child has used a smaller seat and usually wanted someone with him in the bathroom. Now that the child is growing older, it is time for him to learn to do things for himself. The child, being led on by the mother's remarks—"that's acting like a big boy now"—has led the child to feel pride in a new accomplishment.

Again, Ambivalent and Neutral stories are judged in the same manner as described for Picture I.

PICTURE IV: GIRL HOLDING KNIFE

The Defiant Story: In the Defiant story there is a breakthrough of aggression. In the most extreme instances violence is used. However, direct violence is surprisingly rare. More likely, there is a "playing" with violence in the story.

Example of a Defiant story:

> "Harry, what kind of vegetables do you want for dinner?" Meg called to her husband. Harry didn't answer. "Why don't you answer me?" called Meg. Meg went into the living room to see what her husband was doing, and she found him lying on the floor in a pool of blood. You see, Harry shot himself.

Violence may come to the surface and then be suppressed, or may seem to turn against the self, as in cutting oneself, or in suicide.

The Compliant Story: In this story, there is a determined or bland denial of the possibility of aggression. The most common form of this story has the girl preparing a meal, and the violence possibilities are assiduously overlooked.

Example of a Compliant story:

> The girl in the picture is holding a knife. She is about to make a potato salad. [There follows a recipe for potato salad.] When the potatoes are cooked and cooled, she begins the final stages of her potato salad which, by the way, was just delicious and was soon gone.

Ambivalent and Neutral stories are judged as before.

This description of the scoring technique for the individual stories is necessarily abbreviated, particularly with reference to the number of examples given, both for the primary criterion stories and for Ambivalent and Neutral stories.

DEVELOPMENT OF THE FIVE-POINT SCALE:

For the final score, these basic criteria are used in conjunction with a clinical judgment of the degree of Defiance or Compliance manifest in the story.

For this purpose, each story was judged on a seven-point scale.

1 = Highly Defiant
2 = Defiant
3 = Ambivalently Defiant
4 = Neutral
5 = Ambivalently Compliant
6 = Compliant
7 = Highly Compliant

The scores for each of the four stories were then combined into a five-point scale, using the combination of individual scores presented in the table below. It will be noted that the numerical combination begins from the Defiant end of the ratings. These units represent the minimum combination required for classification. The numbers in the blank spaces must be as high as, or higher than, the numbers presented in the sequence.

SCALE COMBINATIONS AND FREQUENCY OF DEFIANCE AND COMPLIANCE

Global Scale Placement on Compliance-Defiance	Four-Story Combination	Final Scale Number	Frequency
High Defiance . .	11--, 122-, 2222	1	12
Defiant	123-, 133-, 2223, 223-, 2333	2	21
Neutral	15--, 225-, 2335, 333-, 3355	3	35
Compliant	25--, 335-, 35--, 5555	4	24
High Compliance.	36--, 5556, 556-, 6---	5	15
		Total	107

INSTRUCTIONS FOR CALIGOR FIGURE–DRAWING TEST

Instruct as follows:

1. YOU HAVE A SET OF SIX SHEETS OF ONIONSKIN PAPER AND ONE PIECE OF CARDBOARD BACKING. TURN BACK THE FIRST FIVE SHEETS OF PAPER SO THAT ONLY THE LAST SHEET IS IN FRONT OF THE CARDBOARD BACKING, LIKE THIS.

   (Demonstrate.)

   NOW MAKE A PICTURE OF A WHOLE PERSON. (If anyone says, "I can't draw," tell him to do the best he can.)

After FOUR minutes, say:

2. NOW COVER THE SHEET ON WHICH YOU JUST MADE A PICTURE WITH THE NEXT SHEET OF ONIONSKIN PAPER. YOU MAY DO ANYTHING YOU LIKE WITH THIS PICTURE OF A PERSON. YOU MAY ADD TO IT, TAKE AWAY FROM IT, CHANGE IT, OR LEAVE IT ALONE. ONLY, AGAIN, MAKE A PICTURE OF A WHOLE PERSON.

After FOUR minutes, say:

3. NOW TAKE THE EXTRA BOOKLET OF BLANK PAPER. (Demonstrate.) PLACE IT BEHIND THE SHEET ON WHICH YOU'VE JUST DRAWN. JUST BEHIND THE SHEET ON WHICH YOU'VE JUST DRAWN. NOW COVER THIS SHEET WITH THE NEXT SHEET OF ONIONSKIN PAPER. YOU MAY DO ANYTHING YOU LIKE WITH THIS PICTURE OF A PERSON. YOU MAY ADD TO IT, TAKE AWAY FROM IT, CHANGE IT, OR LEAVE IT ALONE. ONLY, AGAIN, MAKE A PICTURE OF A WHOLE PERSON.

After FOUR minutes repeat the above instructions. Repeat the third set of instructions four times in all. The students will make six drawings.

DESCRIPTION OF SCALE I OF THE CALIGOR FIGURE–DRAWING TEST

Scale I for the figure-drawings was designated to provide a single rating for each set of six pictures.

A code, corresponding to the Compliance-Defiance code, was was developed on the basis of characteristics found in a preliminary examination of the sets of drawings. The entire sample was then rated according to the characteristics described in the code. A sample of fifty sets of drawings was then given to an independent rater. The reliability between the two ratings was found to be +0.63.

The determinants of the rating scale are listed below.

Characteristics rated Compliance:

1. Series of "paper-doll" or "princess" figures with stereotyped, single-pattern faces, where successive pictures represent the same, or very nearly the same, figure.

2. Series of drawings in which successive pictures develop the original picture, either through increasing completion of the same background or of the same person.

3. Series of drawings representing a domestic or mildly romantic theme.

Characteristics rated Defiance:

1. Series of drawings that portray different figures or different people altogether.

2. Changes in posture and "action" of successive figures, even though they might conceivably be the same person.

3. The occurrence of something "unusual" or "unconventional" in the sequence of pictures, such as the sudden occurrence of a nude drawing, or an unusual "prop" (gun, spear, etc.) (These must be judged in the context of the total set of drawings).

4. The development of a story in which there are shifts in the background and people—particularly stories that develop comic or satirical themes.

5. Series of drawings in which the background shifts—that is, the background is not an increasing development of the same background.

6. "Artiness" or highly-styled drawings. (This allows for a distinction between "fashion-model" poses [Defiant] and the "paper-doll" poses [Compliant]).

Using these criteria, the rater is asked to judge the placement of the set of pictures on the scale from 1 to 5:

1 = High Defiance
2 = Moderate Defiance
3 = Neutral
4 = Moderate Compliance
5 = High Compliance

The neutral score is given when the set of drawings cannot be rated on the above criteria, or when the mixture of Compliant and Defiant features is such that the set cannot be placed in either category.

The "Compliant" characteristics listed above were considered by the researcher to describe the dimension of non-erotized narcissism-exhibitionism. Since the opposite end of this rating scale, the "Defiant" ratings, seemed to include several other characteristics than erotized narcissism-exhibitionism, a second rating scale was devised to separate this latter dimension from other characteristics of the "Defiant" position as described on Scale I. A description of this second scale may be found in the following section of this Appendix.

DESCRIPTION OF SCALE II (EROTIZED NARCISSISM–EXHIBITIONISM) OF THE FIGURE–DRAWING TEST

The characteristics upon which the rating of erotized narcissism-exhibitionism were based are:

1. Emphasis on secondary sexual characteristics, such as bust-line, hips, or other aspects of the figure.

2. Amount of decoration, such as jewelry, make-up, hair-styles, highly styled dresses, and the like.

Caligor also has a measure of narcissism-exhibitionism in his scoring system, but he bases his scores entirely on partially clothed and nude figures and does not score fully clothed figures on this dimension at all. This procedure was not followed in this rating scale for two reasons: (1) it was felt that the characteristics upon which this rating was based could be apparent equally well on fully clothed figures, and (2) it seemed possible that a college population might draw quite banal "partially clothed" figures, such as people in clothes appropriate for certain sports, and so on. Since the emphasis in this rating scale was on the sexualized "showiness" of the figures, ratings were made on all series that included any female figures. It should be noted, however, that all series that included a nude figure were automatically rated "3."

The rating was given on the basis of the presence of the above characteristics in the following degree:

Rating	Degree of Presence of Characteristics Outlined
0	Absence of these characteristics; bland drawings
1	Characteristics mildly present
2	Characteristics moderately present
3	Characteristics clearly present

In order to assess the reliability of this rating scale, a sample of 25 sets of drawings was drawn at random from the sample. It should be noted that the seven sets which contained no female

figures in the series were excluded from this rating. The 25 sets were rated independently by two raters. A reliability coefficient of +0.92 was obtained between the two ratings on this sample.

DISTRIBUTION ACCORDING TO SEX OF FIGURES IN THE FIGURE–DRAWING TEST (Six drawings)

Number of Female Figures	Frequency
0	7
1	5
2	6
3	12
4	18
5	14
6	42
Total	104

DISTRIBUTION OF SCORES ON SCALE I OF THE FIGURE–DRAWING TEST

Rating of Drawings	Frequency
Highly Defiant	9
Moderately Defiant	16
Neutral	38
Moderately Compliant	23
Highly Compliant	18
Total	104

DISTRIBUTION OF SCORES ON SCALE II OF THE FIGURE-DRAWING TEST

Rating of Drawings	Frequency
0	42
1	17
2	22
3	16
Total	97[a]

[a]Omits 7 all-male figure-drawing sets.

While the two rating scales of narcissism-exhibitionism were developed for the present research, they derive from interpretations of narcissism-exhibitionism formulated by Leopold Caligor (1957). The measure of sexual identification by counting the number of female and male figures is also based on a part of his scoring system.

Caligor developed his scoring system on the basis of clinical experience and pilot studies of his quantification techniques. The test was then given to two groups: one of college students, and the other of hospitalized schizophrenics, and was found to discriminate clearly between them. It has since been used with both group and individual administration to populations ranging in age from seven through seventy (Caligor, 1957, p. 9).

DISTRIBUTION CODES FOR THE IMPULSE EXPRESSION SCALE

The Impulse Expression Scale was scored according to a key provided with the test. Scores range from 4 to 92, in this sample, with 124 being the highest possible score on the test. The median for this sample is 44. The sample was divided into code-groups ranging from 1 to 6, with a code of 1 representing low impulse expression, and a code of 6 representing high impulse expression. The groups were formed on the basis of apparent groupings in the distribution. The separation into six code-groups was done for the purpose of making comparisons more flexible. The table below presents the distribution of subjects on this scale.

DISTRIBUTION OF SUBJECTS ON THE IMPULSE EXPRESSION SCALE

Range of Scores	Code Number	Frequency
4–26	1	13
27–35	2	19
36–48	3	27
49–59	4	23
60–75	5	20
76–92	6	5
	Total	107

The reliability coefficient reported by the authors, for freshman girls, is .860. The mean score for the Monteith freshman girls on this scale is 46.4. This falls between freshman and senior means (41.43 and 48.60, respectively), reported by the authors of the scale (Sanford et al., 1957).

DISTRIBUTION CODES FOR TEST OF CRITICAL THINKING

The scores on the Test of Critical Thinking range from 9 to 49 with the highest score possible on the test being 52. The sample was divided into five code-groups, with a code of 1 representing a low score in critical thinking and a code of 5 representing a high score in critical thinking. The table below presents the distribution of subjects on this scale.

DISTRIBUTION OF SUBJECTS ON THE TEST OF CRITICAL THINKING

Range of Scores	Code Number	Frequency
9–23	1	13
24–30	2	29
31–36	3	28
37–42	4	27
43–49	5	10
	Total	107

The manual accompanying the Test of Critical Thinking reports three reliability coefficients obtained for Form G of this test, as follows:

COEFFICIENTS OF RELIABILITY

Method	Group	r
Kuder-Richardson	Freshmen	.79
Odd-even answers	Freshmen	.84
Odd-even answers	Freshmen	.89

Colleges participating in the program under which this test was developed (Cooperative Study of Evaluation in General Education) were grouped together on the basis of the gross mean scores of entering freshmen, on the ACE Psychological Examination. Three groups were formed. Group I represents colleges in which the gross mean score was above the sixtieth percentile rank in terms of the national norms. This is the group with the highest gross mean score of the three. The present sample accords most closely with this group (Group I), as can be seen from the following comparison of percentile ranks.

Percentile	Group I Freshmen 1952	Monteith Freshmen 1960
95	44	45
90	42	42
80	40	39
70	38	38
60	36	35
50	33	33
40	31	31
30	29	29
20	26	26
10	23	22
5	21	20

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abraham, Karl. Contributions to the theory of the anal character. In Selected papers on psychoanalysis. New York: Basic Books, 1953. Pp. 370–392. (a)

_____. Manifestations of the female castration complex. In Selected papers on psychoanalysis. New York: Basic Books, 1953. Pp. 338–369. (b)

Ackerman, N. W. Social role and total personality. Amer. J. Orthopsychiat., 1951, 21, 1–17.

Adelson, Joseph. The compliance-defiance test. Personal communication, 1959.

Adelson, Joseph, and Redmond, Joan. Personality differences in the capacity for verbal recall. J. abnorm. soc. Psychol., 1958, 57, 244–248.

American Council on Education. Test of critical thinking, form G (instructor's manual). American Council on Education, 1953.

Berliner, B. The role of object relations in moral masochism. Psychoanal. Quart., 1958, 27, 38–56.

Brenner, Charles. The masochistic character. J. Amer. psychoanal. Ass., 1959, 7, 197–225.

Brown, Donald. Some educational patterns. J. soc. Issues, 1956, 12 (No. 4).

Caligor, Leopold. A new approach to figure drawing. Springfield, Ill.: Charles C. Thomas, 1957.

Cottrell, L. S., Jr. The adjustment of the individual to his age and sex roles. Amer. sociol. Rev., 1942, 7, 618–625.

Deutsch, Helena. Psychology of women. 2 vols. New York: Grune and Stratton, 1945.

Douvan, E., and Adelson, J. Themes in American adolescence. (In preparation.)

Edwards, A. E. Statistical methods. New York: Rinehart, 1954.

Ellis, Evelyn. Social psychological correlates of upward social mobility among unmarried career women. Amer. sociol. Rev., 1952, 17, 558–563.

Fenichel, O. The psychoanalytic theory of neurosis. New York: Norton, 1945.

Freedman, Mervin B. Some observations on personality development in college women. Speech given May 6, 1959. (In press.)

Freud, Anna. The ego and the mechanisms of defense. New York: International Univer. Press, 1946.

Freud, S. Character and anal eroticism. In Collected papers, Vol. II. London: Hogarth Press, 1953. Pp. 45–50. (a)

_____. Female sexuality. In Collected papers, Vol. V. London: Hogarth Press, 1953. Pp. 252–272. (b)

_____. Libidinal types. In Collected papers, Vol. V. London: Hogarth Press, 1953. Pp. 247–251. (c)

_____. On the transformation of instincts with special reference to anal eroticism. In Collected papers, Vol. II. London: Hogarth Press, 1953. Pp. 164–171. (d)

Goldsen, R., Rosenberg, M., Williams, R. M., and Suchman, E. A. What college students think. New York: Van Nostrand, 1960.

Gurin, G., Veroff, J., and Feld, Sheila. Americans view their mental health. New York: Basic Books, 1960.

Kaye, Carol. Changing conceptions of adolescent sex roles. Paper read at Amer. Psychological Association, September, 1957.

Kestenberg, Judith S. On the development of maternal feelings in early childhood: observations and reflections. In The psychoanalytic study of the child, Vol. XI. New York: International Univer. Press, 1956. Pp. 257–291.

Korner, A. Theoretical considerations concerning the scope and limitations of projective techniques. J. abnorm. soc. Psychol., 1950, 45, 619–627.

Mead, M. Male and female. New York: William Morrow, 1949.

Mishler, E. G. Personality characteristics and the resolutions of role conflicts. Publ. Opin. Quart., 1953, 17, 115–135.

Murray, H. A., and Staff of Harvard Psychological Clinic. Thematic apperception test. Cambridge: Harvard Univer. Press, 1943.

Neiman, L. J., and Hughes, J. W. The problem of the concept of role; a re-survey of the literature. Soc. Forces, 1951, 30, 141–149.

Newcomb, T. M. Role behaviors in the study of individual personality and of groups. J. Pers., 1950, 18, 273–289.

Sanford, N., Webster, H., and Freedman, M. Impulse expression as a variable of personality. Psychol. Monogr., 1957, 71 (No. 11).

Sarbin, T. R. Role theory. In G. Lindzey (Ed.), Handbook of social psychology. Cambridge: Addison-Wesley, 1954. Pp. 223–258.

Seeley, J., Sim, R. A., and Loosley, E. W. Crestwood Heights. New York: Basic Books, 1956.

Siegel, Sidney. Nonparametric statistics. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1956.

Stouffer, S. A., and Toby, J. Role conflict and personality. Amer. J. sociol., 1951, 56, 395–406.

Walker, Helen M., and Lev, J. Statistical inference. New York: Henry Holt, 1953.

Zilboorg, G. Masculine and feminine. Psychiat., 1944, 7 (No. 3), 257–296.